

**Portraits of field dependent children with reading disabilities:  
Colored overlays as an instructional intervention**

Lucinda Rightnour Willis

Dissertation submitted to the Faculty of the  
Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University  
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy  
in  
Curriculum and Instruction

Barbara B. Lockee, Chairperson

David M. Moore

Patricia P. Kelly

Jerome A. Niles

Susan G. Magliaro

April 12, 2002

Blacksburg, Virginia

Keywords: field dependence, colored overlays, reading disabilities, tactile learning, Title I, Reading Recovery

Copyright 2002, Lucinda Rightnour Willis

Portraits of field dependent children with reading disabilities:  
Colored overlays as an instructional intervention

Lucinda Rightnour Willis

(ABSTRACT)

A portraiture study was conducted with four children enrolled in various grades of a rural Virginia elementary school. Purposeful sampling was used as a selection tool, and all students were participants of the Title I program, unsuccessfully discontinued from the Reading Recovery program, and were tested as field dependent, a cognitive characteristic, using the Children's Embedded Figures Test created by Witkin, et al (1971).

These participants were observed within a classroom setting, a small group setting, and in a one-on-one setting. Interviews offered the opportunity to investigate the students' feelings and attitudes towards using the overlays. Field notes, unaided observations, participant observations were gathered, and interviews were conducted with the students, as well as with the reading specialist, the teachers, and the administrator of the school. Further data was gained from historical records from the school and evaluative tools used within the classroom, on a periodic basis.

Outcomes of this study focus on the process of using colored overlays with these participants, their self-efficacy their feelings about using the tool, how the faculty perceives this tool, and additional implications with regards to field dependence and colored overlays within the classroom.

*Dedicated to*

*Marian Elizabeth Dillman Collins, My Gram ~*

*Who taught us the love of learning  
and the power of dreams.*

## Acknowledgements

Every avenue of the past two years has been lined with people that believed in me, and offered humor and candid advice to help me attain this goal.

Words cannot express the gratitude and respect I have for Dr. Barbara Lockee, chairperson of my committee. From the onset, you believed in my ability to gain this Ph.D., and your gentle persuasion and impassioned sense of learning helped me to believe in my ability too. I value your opinion and am constantly amazed at how easy you make your job seem, even on those days when it doesn't all go well. You've taught me many things that are only now coming to light, and I recognize that the caliber with which you attack life is unrivaled in any other person I've had the pleasure of meeting on this journey. Thank you seems so inadequate for all that you offered me, from scholarships to heartfelt conversations to a quick email when that is all either of us could afford in time. I hope in my own way, I will be able to offer this kind of support to future learners, and know that they too, will make a difference in the world. You've certainly made a difference in mine.

My committee was a one-of-a-kind combination. The expertise that was brought to the table at each meeting was awe-inspiring, and I want to let each of you know just how greatly I respect you and your dedication to the department, to the graduate students, and to the art of teaching. To Dr. Mike Moore, I thank you for your wonderful and thought-provoking conversations. When you told me to follow a class research paper into a dissertation during my masters program, I really didn't believe it could be done. Your confidence in me and hope in the research have developed into this dissertation, and will continue for many years of researching unanswered questions in field dependence. I will always smile when I remember the trepidation with which you once talked of qualitative research -- it turned out to be a very rewarding experience for me, and I thank you for supporting the research method without reservation. Dr. Pat Kelly, I cannot say thank you enough for the conversations woven around our work with NCATE, and the meaningful corrections on this dissertation. I remember fondly the exuberance you shared with me while I told you stories of the children that I worked with, and the gentle nudging you gave me to continue with this research several years from now. You are a

consummate educator, and again, I count myself so very fortunate for having had the opportunity to work for you and with you. To Dr. Jerry Niles, my one committee member that surprised me consistently and completely. I came to think of you as the one professor that would “trip me up” with a question that I couldn’t answer about this research, and the struggle to gain a complete understanding of this topic was often fueled by desire to meet that challenge. I enjoy the lively conversations and admire the way with which you offer alternative options in an unthreatening and inspiring manner - without even realizing, you have added an edge to my research thoroughness that I will forever strive to keep. Thank you for all that you’ve done, and all that you have taught me. Dr. Sue Magliaro, may I offer thanks for coming on board at the eleventh hour and completely immersing yourself in my research ideas, in order to give me the greatest amount of help possible. Helping me shape my ideas into a completed qualitative dissertation was no small task, but you helped to make it seem orderly and attainable by your easily offered suggestions. From the first day of your assistance, I felt like the qualitative attitude of this dissertation was safe and well, and the product of this rich data has surprised me many times over.

The people that work at Virginia Tech are also a very rare breed; they keep all of us on our paths, often without even our realization of it. To Roberta Snelling, for her wonderful sense of humor and for her undying faith in me, I thank you. Life would have been so different for me without you as a constant on this journey. To Terry Davis and Bonnie Guthrie, I also offer my thanks -- the diligence and honesty with which you do your jobs affords all of us an insight into the true workings of a dedicated and successful department. I am lucky to have been part of this department, and luckier still to have the honor of knowing each of you. Thank you for making my time here so much richer.

To the children within the elementary school where this research was conducted, I offer my sincerest thanks. You have made this research possible, and you have taught me a great deal in the process- that learning is the sweetest journey and should always be appreciated. Thank you for sharing the wonderful journey with me. You will always be within my heart.

To the administrators and teachers at the elementary school: To Dollie Cottrill, for helping to make this research happen, and for opening her school and all that it embraces,

I thank you. To the many teachers that took the time, and offered their expertise to help me understand the underpinnings of good education, again, I thank you. To Jane Ann Wells, please know that I am forever in your debt. You are the example of teaching that I will forever strive towards - there is a sense of wonder and abandon in learning that you've graciously instilled in all whom you've touched. I hope the children will someday recognize this great gift you've given them, as I have had the distinct pleasure of recognizing and embracing. Teaching to you is an expedition, and each day it begins anew. For that refreshing idea, I thank you.

To Mindi Walker, for the wonderful conversations, the votes of confidence and the desire to learn right along with me through this process; you opened your classroom to me and allowed me the freedom to question everything, and then helped me to find the answers to at least part of this vast and fascinating puzzle. For this, I thank you.

To my family of friends, my utmost respect and love are offered here. Thank you for being there, all hours of the day and night, offering encouragement when the work became arduous, and celebrating with me at each peak along the path. It takes a village to raise a child, and it has taken a wide world of villagers to accomplish this dissertation. To each and every one of you, thank you for reaching out and touching this life with such pleasures. You have my heart.

To Debi Marlow, especially -- thank you doesn't even come close. The unfailing support, unbounded patience, and unbelievable confidence you had in me completing this project stretched every chasm and every crisis to help me believe it could be done. Thank you for sharing your children, your time, your home, and your life; all of these were comforts and relief when I needed them most. You are more than I could have asked for as a friend, and more than I could have hoped for had I been given a sister. We share a wonderful bond, and I thank you for helping me make this dream come true.

To my family, I offer my love and thanks. You have supported me in my decisions and my difficulties, even when it seemed like I was going the long way around a goal. Someday, perhaps I can offer the support in return for all the evening emails and all the laughter over simple things that kept me grounded. Thank you, Mama and Daddy, Scott, Rob, Brian, and David, and, of course, all of my very special aunties. Thank you all for the love you've continued to share with me.

And last, but certainly not least, I thank my constant canine companion, Molly Mano. For the long nights of one-sided conversations and the many walks along the river, you were always there as a sounding board and as an unconditional friend. I am grateful for the day we found each other and began this journey; thank you for helping me complete it.

## Table of Contents

Chapter 1: Introduction .....	1
Chapter 2: Literature Review .....	4
Chapter 3: Methodology .....	37
Chapter 4 .....	61
Context of the Study .....	61
The School .....	61
Principal .....	64
Reading specialist .....	64
Special Education Teacher .....	66
First Grade Teacher .....	66
Second Grade Teacher .....	67
Third Grade Teachers .....	74
Fourth Grade Teacher .....	76
The Children .....	77
Qualitative features of the Portraits .....	80
Field dependence .....	80
Children’s Embedded Figures Test .....	80
Reading Recovery Program .....	82
Title I Program .....	83
Portraits .....	84
Catie .....	84
Daniel .....	100
Cherie .....	121
Lee .....	134
Chapter 5: Summary .....	149
Table 1. Test results of Children’s Embedded Figures Test .....	159
Figure 1. Daniel’s drawing .....	160
Figure 2. Cherie’s drawing .....	161
Figure 3. Catie’s drawing .....	162

Methodological Changes .....	167
Conclusions.....	169
Further research .....	175
Glossary .....	177
Acronyms of school participants .....	180
References.....	181
Appendix A.....	191
Appendix B.....	193
Appendix C .....	207
Appendix D: .....	224
Appendix E: .....	228
Vita.....	230