

**Graphic Organizers:
Toward Organization and Complexity of Student Content Knowledge**

Carol E. Watson

Dissertation Submitted to the Faculty of the Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State
University in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy
in
Curriculum and Instruction

Cheri Triplett, Co-Chair
Larry Harris, Co-Chair
Mary Alice Barksdale
Brenda Brand
Jane Abraham

August 26, 2005
Blacksburg, Virginia

Keywords: Graphic Organizer, Organization, Complexity, Instructional Strategies

Graphic Organizers:

Toward Organization and Complexity of Student Content Knowledge

Carol E. Watson

ABSTRACT

Within the current national atmosphere of accountability and high-stakes testing, many teachers are changing their instruction to return to more traditional strategies that emphasize rote memorization. As a result, classroom curriculum and student learning are narrowing. This study sought to explore the potential of graphic organizers as an instructional strategy to expand student content knowledge beyond rote memorization to include more organized, complex, meaningful learning.

For the purpose of this study, graphic organizers are described as visual displays of concepts, their component parts, and the relationships among their parts. This study was conducted over a six week period in a third grade classroom in a rural elementary school in Virginia. Ten focus students were identified for in-depth data collection on their learning process as recorded during science instruction.

Although existing research strongly supports graphic organizer effectiveness as an instructional strategy toward general student achievement, little is known about the type of learning they support or the process by which students' knowledge develops. Thus, this research utilized qualitative methodological strategies in order to investigate this process. Data collection methods included field notes, student artifacts, and participant interviews. Constant comparative methodology was employed to analyze data. The theoretical framework of constructivism, espousing that newly acquired information is

connected to prior knowledge forming complex, organized networks of conceptual understanding, guided this qualitative study.

Findings resulted in emergent themes including student motivation, simplicity, efficiency, visual hierarchical organization, reconstructing knowledge, and cooperative socialization. Documentation of the learning process as opposed to a comparison of pre/post measurements clearly indicated that student thinking gradually became more complex and organized in nature. As students worked with graphic organizers, and participated in study activities, their knowledge moved from a form of listing facts to resemble more complex, interconnected networks.

Implications of this study for practice include appropriate instruction and practice for students with graphic organizers as a strategy and a tool, value as an assessment tool, and potential for use with complex classroom populations. Suggestions for future research are given for teacher training on how to use graphic organizers effectively, interdisciplinary use of graphic organizers within one context, potential benefit for struggling and diverse learners, a continuing focus on process as opposed to product, and an examination of the connection between graphic organizer activities and sorting.

Contents

Chapter 1

Introduction	page 1
Rationale	
Graphic Organizers: Organizing Complex Knowledge	
Defining Terms	
Graphic Organizers	
Organization	
Complexity	
Theoretical Framework: Constructivism	
Summary	

Chapter 2

Review of the Literature	page 16
Historical Development	
Origin	
Early Variations	
Recent Modifications	
Research Results	
Early Findings	
Developmental Findings	
Recent Findings: Complexity and Organization	
Significance of this Research Study	

Chapter 3

Methodology	page 34
Introduction	
Participants	
Role of the Researcher	
Materials and Procedures	
Data Collection and Analysis	
Field Notes	
Artifacts	
Interviews	
Students	
Teachers	
Data Analysis	
Establishing Credibility	
Limitations	

Chapter 4

Description of Findings	page 60
Individual Student Processes	
Foxyer	
Buggy	
Peel	
Subzero	
Uranus	
Jackie Chan	

- Trunks
- Siberious Wilderous
- Daisy
- Crazy
- Classroom Teacher Perspectives
 - Mrs. H
 - Mrs. B
- Emergent Themes
 - Motivation
 - Simplicity
 - Efficiency
 - Visual Hierarchical Organization
 - Reconstructing Knowledge
 - Non-factual Information
 - Visual Symmetry
 - Amount of Knowledge Communicated
 - Incorporation of Prior Knowledge
 - Adjustments to Knowledge Structure
 - Cooperative Socialization

Chapter 5

Discussion

page 114

- Answering the Guiding Question
 - Evolving From Listing Facts to Complex Networks
 - Hierarchical Organization
 - Reconstruction Knowledge
- Outcomes Beyond the Scope of the Question
 - Motivation
 - Hands-on Manipulatives
 - Simplicity and Efficiency
 - Cooperative Socialization
 - Vehicle to Communicate Knowledge
- Limitations
 - Hawthorne Effect
 - Researcher Bias
 - School Context
- Implications
 - Practice
 - Sufficient Instruction and Practice
 - Graphic Organizers as an Assessment Tool
 - Individualized Instruction Within Complex Classrooms
 - Future Research
 - Appropriate Implementation and Use
 - Interdisciplinary Immersion
 - Struggling Learners
 - Academically Diverse Classroom Populations
 - Process-Not Product

Connection Between Graphic Organizers and Sorting

Summary		
References		page 141
Appendices		
A	informed consent (parent)	page 155
B	informed consent (teacher participant)	page 156
C	timeline for fieldwork	page 157
D	curriculum	page 158
E	instructional resources	page 161
F	instructional materials for Natural Resources	page 162
G	instructional materials for Sources of Energy	page 165
H	instructional materials for Forms of Energy	page 167
I	sample lesson plans	page 169
J	complete transcript of class discussion	page 173
K	Foxer's artifacts	page 175
L	Buggy's artifacts	page 181
M	Peel's artifacts	page 186
N	Subzero's artifacts	page 192
O	Uranus' artifacts	page 198
P	Jackie Chan's artifacts	page 202
Q	Trunks' artifacts	page 206
R	Siberius Wilderous' artifacts	page 210
S	Daisy's artifacts	page 211
T	Crazy's artifacts	page 214
U	interview questions (student)	page 218
V	interview questions (teachers)	page 219
W	artifact analysis rubric	page 220
X	sample artifact analysis rubrics	page 221