

GLOBALIZING NWP?

The Africa report



Wednesday, October 13, 2004

Principles to Guide NRM Investments in Africa

Nature:

- Improve information and knowledge management systems
- Promote local land use planning and appropriate resource tenure systems
- Foster innovation, social learning, and adaptive management
- Build capacity and invest in human resources
- Promote cost-effective technical advisory and intermediary services

Wealth:

- Be strategic about the economics of natural resource management
- Strengthen markets and NRM market incentives
- Invest in rural organizations
- Create a framework for better NRM choices
- Assure that local resource managers have secure access to NRM means and benefits

Power:

- Strengthen environmental procedural rights for rural people
- Improve rural input into public decisions and policy
- Redistribute natural resource authority and functions
- Transfer powers, rights, and responsibilities to representative and accountable authorities
- Explore a minimum environmental standards approach
- Promote platforms that allow for continuous and inclusive consultations

Structure of presentation

1. **NWP's strengths**
2. **Areas that need clarification, modification or strengthening**
3. **Broader issues in NWP**
4. **Preliminary recommendations**

NWP'S STRENGTHS



“NWP is an excellent starting point for the process of developing a more international perspective on development issues.”

Strengths accepted for all regions 1

- Accessible language, easy to read, upbeat
- Tight, comprehensive summary of well recognized good practices drawn from field experience

Strengths accepted for all regions 2

- **NWP principles are generically applicable to a range of settings and projects in Africa and beyond.**
- **The good practices it contains are generically applicable to a wide range of projects, not only those based on NRM.**
- **Positive set of actions to encourage policy makers and project personnel to re-think current ideas and practices.**

Major step forward

- **NRM lifted above the technical, sectoral, tubular, isolated approaches of past**
- **Environment, livelihood, and governance must be addressed in a holistic fashion**
- **Agriculture cannot be seen in isolation, but must be considered together with other land uses**
- **Democracy – particularly voice for poor resource users – is critical for creating healthy ecosystems and local wealth.**

Thought provoking

- Document could stimulate cross-sectoral thinking within individual USAID missions.
- Generate an integrated view of rural development and practical best bets for decision and policy makers
- Valuable guide to formulating the strategies and assessing the actions of different players in international and national efforts to improve rural livelihoods

Quotes from reviewers

“NWP has a positive voice, and in developing literature positive voices are far and few. It instills energy based on real success stories.”

“If the intent is to bolster morale amongst those looking for success with natural resource management — and let’s face it, in Africa over the last twenty years, we haven’t had much to cheer about — then this is an excellent means to do that.”

Another quote

“NWP reads like it was condensed from a much larger experience. Hours of discussions were boiled down to short statements that had to be general in order to include everything that was talked about. NWP reads like the concluding chapter to a book, one that might be well worth writing.”

One more quote

“Reading these guidelines in one coherent, well written document like this helps me to recall similar recommendations I have come across and confirm many conclusions that I have reached intuitively but have not been able to articulate. The document raises my confidence in following some of my vaguely perceived assumptions. If it has this effect on other readers, it will serve a useful purpose.”



CLARIFY, MODIFY, STRENGTHEN

Look deep, deep into nature
and then you will understand
everything better.”

—Albert Einstein

Drivers of unsustainable NMR

- Drivers mentioned at onset only, not integrated within conceptual framework
- Highlight historical context that shaped drivers and their perception
- Africa: key drivers include:
 - Climate
 - Globalization
 - AIDS
 - Chronic conflict, political instability

Defining NR and NRM

- Greater recognition of Africa's diversity in resource endowment and NRM capacity
- Better define of NR will enable fine-tuning of approaches, identification of actors and scale of intervention

NRM's technology and sciences issues

- Is the pendulum swinging too far away from technology-only approaches of past?
- Impression that technical skills are not as important as economic and legal skills
- No explicit role for research or science (social or biophysical)
- Long-term research to support long-term development needed

Agriculture and NRM in rural development

- To what extent is smallholder production viable in globalizing rural economies?
- What is the role of NR in rural household livelihood security?
- Is intensification of NR, widespread use of external inputs, necessary, inevitable?
- What are the linkages between urban development and NRM?
- How does infrastructural development impact sustainable NRM ?

Role of the market

- Advantages and disadvantages of competitive markets:
 - Free competition difficult to achieve, small producers at disadvantage
 - Markets alone do not ensure benefit from NRM
 - Markets may increase vulnerability
- Privatized rural services may
 - Improve quality, responsiveness, accountability but
 - Be unavailable to low income, marginal groups

Stakeholder heterogeneity

- What are the key asymmetries
 - Within communities (gender, class, ethnicity)
 - Between communities and outside stakeholders (business, NGOs, state, etc.)
- How stakeholders' diversity affects knowledge, perceptions, valuing of NR and goals of NRM
- What is the appropriate role of civil society and rural organizations in NRM?

Challenges of NRM governance

- What has been the experience of decentralization of NRM governance?
- How to reconcile the diversity of tenure and use rights surrounding NR?
- What is the appropriate role of local and central government in NRM?

BROADER ISSUES IN NWP



“Research on social-ecological systems will inevitably be dealing with high levels of complexity.”

—J. Sayer and B. Campbell

“NWP does not go nearly far enough in addressing political economy issues of NRM”

- It ignores embedded political and structural problems
- “Underdevelopment, environmental degradation, poverty, famine result not so much from a lack of natural wealth but from decisions and systems, often political in nature, on the distribution of resource wealth.”
- “It needs to question WHY the right institutional framework does not exist now: what are the underlying problems? Without that discussion we will not know whether what is offered will solve the problems.”

Political economy implications 1

- Existing inequalities can be barriers to institutional efficiency and innovation
- Groups, alliance, compromises influence institutions
- The state as problem solving mechanism rather than arena of power conflicts
- Win-win approaches are not always possible in light of conflicting, vested interests. “Win more, lose less”
- Adaptive management or land reform?

Political economy implications 2

- Shift of power is needed: defining principles will not be enough
- Working within ongoing formal and informal political power struggles is needed
- Who should do it? Whose agenda to follow?

Intended audience (or who will implement the recommendations?)

- The document's focus is on strategy and making but there is a missing 'by whom' and 'for whom' in much of the discussion
- Degree of emphasis on audiences changes from one section to another, and even within sections
- Audience's ambit of responsibility, the level of intervention and the incentives will vary

How operational is NWP?

- “The really hard part is not defining the principles as much as how to use them”
- “NWP is mostly about what to do rather than how to do it.”
- Principles may be translated into diametrically opposed interventions
- “Principles” may be interpreted as static black boxes.

‘It is difficult to disagree with the NWP document because it is very polite’

- “It presents the accepted good judgment of the day, but it does not challenge us with criticism or new approaches.”
- We need to learn from (and make reference to) not-so-successful development approaches
- It needs to include experiences, frameworks from other donors, projects
- It needs to define how the “dialogue” on development will take place. How to combine “prescription” with
- What will be the role of donors?

RECOMMENDATIONS



“Politics is the art of the possible”

O. von Bismarck

Recommendations 1

- **Clearly define natural resources and NRM**
- **Define “sustainability” and role of NR in development**
- **Correct technology and biophysical omission in Nature section**

Recommendations 2

- Clarify/balance issues relative to role of markets, stakeholders' diversity, environmental governance, property rights
- Define how to address structural conditions that hinder sustainable development
- Promote reflection on the role of donor agencies, and how their vision mesh or conflict with the vision of host countries

Recommendations 3

- **Operationalize NWP principles**
- **Better identify the actors, audience**
- **Be more explicit about priority activities and levels where action should be taken**
- **Tighten integration across micro, meso- and macro levels**

Recommendations 4

- **Learn from not-so-successful cases**
- **Include other USAID and non-USAID experiences and frameworks**
- **Provide resources to supplement the knowledge summarized in NWP framework.**

Africa Resources

- *CBNRM in Africa: a review.* ARD RAISE, 2001
- *Natural resource management in African agriculture.* By C. Barrett et als. CABI, 2002.
- *Flashback: fifty years of donor aid to African agriculture.* Department of Agricultural Economics, MSU. By C. Eicher, 2003.
- *Chance, change and choice in Africa's Drylands: a new perspective on policy priorities.* CIFOR Brief. 2004.
- *Designing agricultural technology for African women farmers: Lessons from 25 Years of Experience.* By C. Doss. World Development, 29, 12.

USAID Resources

- *USAID's enduring legacy in natural forests: Livelihoods, Landscapes, and Governance.* R. Clausen et al. Chemonics International. 3 vols., n.d.
- *Empowering communities to manage NR: Case studies from Southern Africa.* S. Shackelton and B. Campbell, USAID SADC NRM, 2000
- *Environmental valuation for watersheds and water resources. A guide for USAID Missions.* USAID LAC Bureau and EGAT/Water Team. 2004
- *Gender and Property Rights.* World Development, 25, 8 (papers from USAID/WID Policy Reform through Gender Analysis conference) Ed. R. Meinzen-Dick et al. 2001.