

# **GLOBALIZING NWP?**

## **The Latin America report**



**Thursday, October 14, 2004**

# Structure of presentation

1. NWP's strengths
2. Clarify, modify or strengthen
3. LA realities
4. Bigger issues in NWP
5. Preliminary recommendations

# NWP's strengths



**“NWP is an excellent starting point for the process of developing a more international perspective on development issues.”**

## **Strengths accepted for all regions 1**

- **Tight, comprehensive summary of well recognized good practices drawn from field experience.**
- **Accessible language, easy to read, upbeat.**
- **Positive set of actions to encourage policy makers and project personnel to re-think current ideas and practices**

## **Strengths accepted for all regions 2**

- **NWP principles are generically applicable to a range of settings and projects in Africa and beyond.**
- **The good practices it contains are generically applicable to a wide range of projects, not only those based on NRM.**
- **Document could stimulate cross-sectoral thinking within and outside USAID missions.**

## The quotes

**“NWP has a positive voice, and in developing literature positive voices are far and few. It instills energy based on real success stories.”**

**“If the intent is to bolster morale amongst those looking for success with natural resource management — and let’s face it, in Africa over the last twenty years, we haven’t had much to cheer about — then this is an excellent means to do that.”**

## More quotes

**““NWP reads like it was condensed from a much larger experience. Hours of discussions were boiled down to short statements that had to be general in order to include everything that was talked about. NWP reads like the concluding chapter to a book, one that might be well worth writing.”**

## One more quote

**“Reading these guidelines in one coherent, well written document like this helps me to recall similar recommendations I have come across and confirm many conclusions that I have reached intuitively but have not been able to articulate. The document raises my confidence in following some of my vaguely perceived assumptions. If it has this effect on other readers, it will serve a useful purpose.”**

# CLARIFY, MODIFY, STRENGTHEN



**Look deep, deep into nature and then you will understand everything better.”**

**—Albert Einstein**

# Topics that need “balance”

- **What is meant by NR, diversity of resources and endowments, biophysical limits and potentials, issues of scale and appropriate interventions**
- **Drivers of environmental degradation**
- **The role of science and technology**
- **The role of agriculture and intensification in NRM**
- **The role of markets and urbanization**
- **Differences among stakeholders**
- **Decentralization, the state and participation**

# **NRM critical issues and drivers**

- **LAC: 25% of the world's forest and over 50% of the world's tropical forest**
- **Rapid and massive deforestation**
- **Land settlement policies (instead of land reform), roads, credit and subsidies are most important drivers of rainforest deforestation.**
- **Rich and poor settlers**
- **Over 40 % of the agricultural landscapes of LA have significant soil productivity constraints.**
- **Main issue of NRM is not underutilization but who reaps the benefits.**
- **Most population is urban. Strong rural-urban linkages**

# LA NR and NRM varied issues

- Natural low soil fertility (savannas)
- Erosion and degradation of pastures (on hillsides and mountains)
- Excessive use of agrochemicals and soil compacting (commercial production)
- Deforestation and degradation of soils (forest margins)
- Overgrazing and desertification
- Soil salinization



- Soil fertility, pests, diseases and weeds (cereal monocropping).
- Erosion of genetic material and wildlife
- Erosion and degradation of coastal areas
- Mining and soil contamination
- WATER

# **NRM's technology and sciences issues**

- **Human capabilities high: education and health**
- **Recognized importance of investing in education and infrastructure**
- **Public extension has been reduced or eliminated**
- **Private extension experiences (good and bad)**
- **NGOs are main source of extension services**
- **Many forms of extension pioneered and used**
- **Moderate state investment in agricultural research**

# Agriculture in rural development

- **Agriculture: strong role in development but smaller role as employer and source of revenue from exports**
- **Most farmers use external inputs**
- **Infrastructure, credit and marketing are critical challenges**
- **Livelihood diversification**



# Market and urbanization

- **Most farms (large and small) are in the process of becoming predominantly commercial.**
- **Most rural people are becoming functionally landless: losing land and becoming rural workers or leaving agriculture/rural areas altogether.**
- **Long-term trend: globalization and supermarket economy**
- **Supermarket-gearred production excludes small farmers (except in few niche production areas, i.e. coca)**

# Markets 2

- **Cut flowers, soybeans for export, are more important than (small-scale) food**
- **Structural adjustment for 2 decades**
- **Free trade agreements (NAFTA and**
- **Environmental service payments and of marketable options in rainforest areas.**

# Stakeholder heterogeneity

- **LA has most skewed income distribution world due to access to productive assets, including land**
- **Asset and income distribution has agricultural modernization to lead to development**
- **Strong gender, class, ethnicity differences access to resources and power.**
- **Different options needed for urban, peri- and remote locations**

# **Decentralization and the role of the state**

- **Poor correlation between economic growth and democracy (devolution)**
- **Decentralization of NRM has taken mostly the form of devolution of power to local communities (and less so to local governments)**
- **Poor links between decentralization and poverty alleviation: regional inequalities, local elites**
- **Political democracy has not resulted in economic democracy due to clientelism and corruption.**
- **Democratization and market reform: have been complementary, contradictory, or unrelated**

# Civil society

- LA is highly differentiated, polarized and with an active civil society.
- Local organizations arranged into networks and federations to fight political and economic development for the poor.
- Civil society acknowledges differential power, competition over resources, organized resistance change.
- Often, development work within ongoing political struggles.
- Promote more politics rather than less.

# Bigger issues in NWP



**“Research on social-ecological systems will inevitably be dealing with high levels of complexity.”**

**—J. Sayer and B. Campbell**

# **Intended audience (or who will implement the recommendations?)**

- **The document's focus is on strategy and making but there is a missing 'by whom' and 'for whom' in much of the discussion**
- **Degree of emphasis on audiences changes from section to another, and even within sections.**
- **Audience's ambit of responsibility, the level of intervention and the incentives will vary.**

# How operational is NWP?

- The really hard part is not defining the principles much as how to use them.
- “NWP, is mostly about what to do rather than do it.”
- Principles may be translated into diametrically interventions.
- “Principles” may be interpreted as static black

# **‘It is difficult to disagree with the document because it is very polite.’**

- **“It presents the accepted good judgment of the but it does not challenge us with criticism or new approaches.”**
- **We need to learn from (and make reference to) so-successful development approaches.**
- **It needs to include experiences, frameworks from donors, projects**
- **It needs to define how the “dialogue” on will take place. How to combine “prescription” discussion?**
- **What will be the role of donors?**

# **“NWP does not go nearly far enough in addressing political economy issues of NRM”**

- **It ignores serious embedded political and problems**
- **“Underdevelopment, environmental degradation, poverty, famine result not so much from a lack of natural wealth but from decisions and systems, political in nature, on the distribution of resource wealth.”**
- **It needs to question WHY the right institutional framework does not exist now: what are the problems? Without that discussion we will not whether what is offered will solve the problems.**

# Political economy implications

- Existing inequalities can be barriers to efficiency and innovation: large amounts of protect own interests.
- Groups, alliance, compromises influence
- The state as problem solving mechanism rather arena of power conflicts
- Win-win approaches are not always possible in conflicting, vested interests. “Win more, lose
- Adaptive management or land reform?

# Recommendations



**“Politics is the art of the possible.”**

—Otto von Bismarck

# Recommendations

- **Clearly define natural resources and NRM.**
- **Define “sustainability” and role of NRM in development**
- **Correct technology and biophysical omission in NWP**
- **Correct biophysical and social science omission**

# Recommendations 2

- Clarify/balance issues relative to role of markets, stakeholders' diversity, environmental governance, property rights
- Define how to address structural conditions that hinder sustainable development
- Promote reflection on the role of donor agencies, and how their vision mesh or conflict with the vision of host countries

## Recommendations 3

- **Operationalize NWP principles**
- **Better identify the audience**
- **Be more explicit about priority activities and levels where action should be taken**
- **Tighten integration across micro, meso- and macro levels**

# Recommendations 4

- **Learn from not-so-successful cases**
- **Include other USAID and non-USAID experiences and frameworks**
- **Provide resources to supplement the knowledge summarized in NWP framework.**

# **USAID Resources**

- **Review of USAID's Natural Forest Management Programs in LA and the Caribbean. Pool, Molinos, et al. EPIQ, 2002**
- **Environmental valuation for watersheds and resources. A guide for USAID Missions. USAID America and Caribbean Bureau and EGAT/Water Team. 2004**
- **Johnson, G. and H. Lorraine. 1994. El libro RENARM and DESFIL. 3 Volumes.**
- **USAID's enduring legacy in natural forests: Livelihoods, Landscapes, and Governance. Clausen et al. Chemonics International. 3 vols.,**

# LA Resources

- **La Gestion Forestal Municipal en America**
- **El acceso a la Tierra en la Agenda de**
- **Sustainable Livelihoods: Lessons from**

THANKS



# Resources

- **Field Directors' Handbook.** An Oxfam manual for development workers. Oxford University Press
- **Beyond Fences.** Seeking social sustainability in conservation. 2 vols. IUCN 1997
- **'Engendering' Eden, Women, Gender and ICDPs:**

## Resources 2

- **Guiding Principles for Biodiversity in Development. Lessons from Field Experience.** **ICN, n.d.** Caroline Ashley and Diana
- **Sustainable Livelihoods: Lessons from**

# *Principles to Guide NRM Investments in Africa*

## **Nature:**

- Improve information and knowledge management systems
- Promote local land use planning and appropriate resource tenure systems
- Foster innovation, social learning, and adaptive management
- Build capacity and invest in human resources
- Promote cost-effective technical advisory and intermediary services

## **Wealth:**

- Be strategic about the economics of natural resource management
- Strengthen markets and NRM market incentives
- Invest in rural organizations
- Create a framework for better NRM choices
- Assure that local resource managers have secure access to NRM means and benefits

## **Power:**

- Strengthen environmental procedural rights for rural people
- Improve rural input into public decisions and policy
- Redistribute natural resource authority and functions
- Transfer powers, rights, and responsibilities to representative and accountable authorities
- Explore a minimum environmental standards approach
- Promote platforms that allow for continuous and inclusive consultations