AN ANALYSIS OF THE ADMINISTRATIVE BEHAVIOR
OF THREE FEMALE HIGH SCHOOL PRINCIPALS

Lorraine W. Walker

Dissertation submitted to the Faculty of the
Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University
In partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
In
Educational Leadership and Policy Studies

C. Vaught, Chair
M. G. Cline
K. Singh
C. W. Krill
D. Gordon

August 28, 2000
Blacksburg, Virginia

Keywords: educational leadership, grounded theory, administrative style,
administrative behaviors, principals, high school, female principals

© 2000 by Lorraine W. Walker
AN ANALYSIS OF THE ADMINISTRATIVE BEHAVIOR OF THREE FEMALE HIGH SCHOOL PRINCIPALS

Lorraine W. Walker

(ABSTRACT)

For many decades, school leadership has been conceptualized in a variety of ways attempting to identify the critical elements necessary for effective school leadership. The expertise required for today’s schools appears to be different from that required in the past, particularly as school leaders are expected to initiate change and “restructure” in order to obtain new and improved educational results.

Traditional managerial skills, once deemed appropriate and effective for school administration, are now being replaced by styles that focus on cooperation and consideration, community building, open communication, and involvement with others. These behaviors appear to be present in women as they demonstrate their effectiveness in leadership roles as principals and superintendents.

This descriptive study offers an in-depth look at the administrative behavior of three women. It documents their experiences and perspectives as high school principals. The purpose of the study is to contribute to the growing body of research on female leaders necessary to challenge the existing theories on school administration, which are based on traditional business management theory and formulated using an androcentric conceptual framework.

Naturalistic inquiry guided the present study, which employed qualitative research methodology. Participant observations, complemented by interviews and reflective conversations, provided the data for analysis using grounded theory. A computer software program Ethnograph (Qualis, 1998) facilitated the organization and analysis of data.

Case narratives, case reports, and a cross-case analysis report three women’s behavior in their role as high school principals. Major conclusions include: (a) Each principal demonstrated a unique style of administrative behavior which seemed effectively matched to the needs of the school organization; (b) Each principal demonstrated a strong set of collegial or relational behaviors that focused on building community in order to support the school programs; and (c) Each principal demonstrated an ethic of care informed by a sense of fairness and loyalty to the policies and procedures associated with their bureaucratic organizational environment. The ethic of care that guided each principal’s style suggests that these principals exercise a kind of power associated more with “effective agency” than with “command and control” power typically associated with traditional leadership.

Additional research is needed to document the female leadership experience in schools in order to challenge and transform current administrative theory; research is also needed to explore the notion of “effective agency” as power. Practitioners, researchers, and other interested educational professionals are invited to use the behaviors identified in this study to reflect upon their own styles, because changing our schools is inevitably bound up with changing ourselves.
DEDICATION

This work is dedicated to my husband, Corky; to my parents, Lee and Doug Walker; and to my friend and confidante, Ellen Mason Luce, for their abundant care and steadfast support.

This work is also dedicated to Sophia: She who represents Wisdom. It is through the pursuit of knowledge and experience, applied to the common good, that we can move beyond the conventionality and dualities of life into the light of creative wholeness.

For wisdom is more precious than pearls,
And nothing else is so worthy of desire.

Proverbs 8:11
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The dissertation process challenged me to grow personally as well as professionally. Many people contributed to the success of this enormous undertaking and to whom I remain indebted.

I wish to thank my advisory committee, the principal participants, my family, friends, and colleagues for the confidence and caring support that provided the motivation, strength, and resilience necessary to complete this endeavor.

Finally, I wish to thank all of those who have served as my teachers, formally through personal contact or informally through their research and writings. They provided not only the foundation upon which this work was accomplished but also the inspiration to move forward with my own hopes and dreams.

When the student is ready
   the teacher appears

    An Old Saying
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract

Dedication ...........................................................ii

Acknowledgements ....................................................iii

Chapter I Introduction ................................................1
  Public Education in the United States ...........................2
  The Call of Educational Reform .................................3
  School Leadership .................................................3
  Statement of the Problem .........................................4
  Purpose of the Study ..............................................4
  Significance of the Study .......................................5
  Conceptual Framework ............................................5
  Assumptions .....................................................5
  Delimitations of the Study ......................................6
  Definition of Terms .............................................6
  Organization of the Study .......................................7

Chapter II Literature Review ..........................................8
  Leadership ................................................................8
    Leadership Definitions ........................................8
    Trait Theories ..................................................9
    Behavior Theories ..............................................10
      Nature of Managerial Work ................................11
      Effectiveness of Managerial Work ......................11
      Taxonomies ..................................................13
    Contingency Theories ..........................................13
      LPC Model ..................................................14
      Path-Goal Theory ........................................14
      Situational Approach ....................................15
        Managerial Grid Theory .................................15
        Situational Determinants ...............................15
        Situational Leadership .................................15
      Power-Influence Theories ................................16
    Integrative Theories ..........................................18
      Transformational Leadership .............................19
      Charismatic Leadership ..................................19
      Cultural Leadership ......................................19
      Servant Leadership ......................................21
  Gender Differences in Leadership ...............................22
  Summary ..................................................................29
# TABLES AND FIGURES

## List of Tables

### Chapter 2

2.1 Managerial Skills Associated with Effectiveness ..........10  
2.2 Traits Predicting Leadership Effectiveness ...............10  
2.3 Mintzberg’s Ten Managerial Roles .........................11  
2.4 Effective Managerial Behavior ............................12  
2.5 Four-Factor Theory .......................................13  
2.6 Path-Goal Leader Behaviors ...............................14  
2.7 French and Raven Power Taxonomy ........................17  
2.8 Sources of Power in Organizations .......................17  
2.9 Schein’s Primary Mechanisms for Shaping Culture ..............20  
2.10 Guidelines for Transformational Leadership ...............20  
2.11 Characteristics of Servant Leaders ........................21  
2.12 Balancing the Polarities ................................29  

### Chapter 4

4.1 Case Titles ..............................................41  
4.2 Administrative Strategies ...............................42  

### Chapter 5

5.1 Cross-Narrative Categories ...............................90  
5.2 Principals’ Visions ......................................92  
5.3 Administrative Strategies and Values ........................95  

### Chapter 6

6.1 Descriptive Case Titles ..................................100  
6.2 Administrative Strategies ...............................100  
6.3 Cross-Case narrative Categories ............................101  
6.4 Factors and Forces Affecting Administrators ...............102  

### Appendix A

A.1 Research Stages .........................................122  

### Appendix B

B.1 Collection of Feminine and Masculine Associations ......123  
B.2 Gender Roles ..............................................123  
B.3 FemaleThink is the NewThink ..............................124  
B.4 Leadership Ways of Men and Women ........................124  
B.5 Comparative Leadership Styles .............................125  
B.6 Characteristics of the Corporate Pyramid ..................125  
B.7 Traditional vs. Women’s Leadership Characteristics ......126  
B.8 Six Central Traits of the New Leadership ..................127
Appendix D

D.1 Primary and Secondary Processes .........................361
D.2 Tertiary Processes 1 ....................................362
D.3 Tertiary Processes 2 ....................................363
D.4 Symbol, Motto, and Value Constructs ......................364
D.5 Service and Maternal Constructs ..........................365
D.6 Principal Constructs ....................................366
D.7 School and District Constructs ..........................367
D.8 Administrative Constructs ...............................368

Appendix F

F.1 Case 1 Paradigm Logic Model (The Professional Principal) 374
F.2 Case 2 Paradigm Logic Model (The Guardian Principal) ....375
F.3 Case 3 Paradigm Logic Model (The Constructive Principal) 376

List of Figures

Appendix E

E.1 CARE ....................................................372
E.2 Mandorla of Care & Justice ..............................373

Appendix G

G.1 Concentric Circles of Influence ..........................377