

CHAPTER V. ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS

Introduction

This chapter presents a cross-case analysis of the three case studies. Using observations from both the narrative and case reports, the cross-case analysis identifies common themes across the cases as well as suggests an administrative fit that is present between the principal's administrative style and the school organization.

A variety of analytic techniques was used to make sense of the abundant cross-case data items and events. They facilitated the reduction of data without loss of meaning while increasing the conceptual significance of all of the processes, categories, and themes previously identified in the case narratives and reports.

The narrative and case reports were examined independently as well as collectively. Meta-matrix charts facilitated pattern matching (Appendix D) for cross-case analysis. A hypothetical report explains the cross-narrative findings (Appendix E). Analysis of the paradigm logic diagrams (Appendix F) yielded several common categories, which are highlighted in blue. One category, the [context of care](#), is examined in depth (Appendix G).

The last section of this chapter addresses the research questions which guided this study. They comment on stereotypical feminine and masculine behaviors observed in this study.

Narrative Analysis and Findings

A meta-matrix of constructs (Appendix D) provided an overview of the constructs identified in the narratives for the three cases. The constructs are a combination of descriptive, conceptual, inferential, and thematic codes. The first three pages of this appendix present the primary, secondary, and tertiary processes identified during narrative analysis. Outlines accompanying the narratives further delineate the constructs into quaternary and quinary code levels. The outline format facilitates the initial associations among the categories.

In examining the narrative codes across the cases, it is apparent that all categories can be subsumed under two major themes: [attending to people](#) and [attending to school programs](#) (Appendix D). The significance of these two themes is located in their relationship to each other. [Attending to people](#) is accomplished in service to [attending to school programs](#), which represents school operations aimed at accomplishing the mission.

Specific descriptive labels associated with these two themes capture each principal's unique manner and style of attending to people and programs. The Professional principal [pilots](#) and [promotes](#), while the Guardian [guides](#) and [guards](#), and the Constructive principal [cultivates](#) and [builds](#). As explained and defined in the narratives, each of the processes concerns specific behaviors associated with each principal.

Piloting people is the first of two primary processes associated with Patricia's administrative style. It is defined as steering people towards goals that support the common mission. More specifically, it concerns presenting a principal persona, creating connections, and encouraging excellence within the school organization.

Promoting the program is the second primary process associated with Patricia's administrative style. It is defined as publicizing school objectives, activities, and achievements. More specifically it concerns valuing the organizational vision, advancing the goals of the organization, and subscribing to service through one's profession.

Guiding the clientele is the first of two processes associated with Gayle's administrative style. It means administering to the members of the school organization. It involves taking care of the interests of students and staff in the school organization by providing direction and support in the daily execution of their duties and responsibilities. It also concerns rendering a calm presence while fostering working relationships. Gayle's primary objectives are to encourage participation and collective agreement around the goals and objectives of the school organization.

Guarding the program is the second process associated with Gayle's administrative style. It means protecting the programs of the school. It concerns upholding the framework of the school in order that the organization can function efficiently and effectively. In addition, it concerns maintaining operations and safeguarding resources in order to serve the clientele efficaciously. As threats to that service arise, Gayle activates troubleshooting efforts aimed at minimizing menaces in the making.

Cultivating culture is the first of two primary processes associated with Connie's administrative style. It means promoting the growth and development of shared beliefs, behaviors, and characteristics within a group of people who support a common mission. More specifically, it concerns exhibiting eminence among a collective body of students, staff, parents, and community members to create solidarity and security in service to common goals.

Building the program is the second primary process associated with Connie's administrative style. It means establishing direction and control to enhance operations and conditions. More specifically, it concerns managing operations to upgrade programs, policies, procedures, and performance.

From an examination of the primary and secondary process categories associated with these themes, several processes emerged as common. Descriptive labels were assigned to these processes. The labels maintain consistency with the case narrative format. See Table 5.1, Cross-Narrative Categories.

Table 5.1 Cross-Narrative Categories

Creating community	Improving the program
Presenting presence	Engaging vision
Facilitating relationships	Supporting operations

In keeping with the presentation format of the case narratives and case reports, a hypothetical cross-case description (Appendix E) reports these findings. The cross-case description format is similar to the actual case report format. It is, however, abbreviated to only common themes that occurred across cases.

Dr. Helen Hart is introduced as the hypothetical cross-case principal of Harmony Heights High School. She is identified as the [humanistic principal](#) because she is committed to the welfare of the school community. Her administrative strategy is called [affiliative administering](#). This strategy represents the common characteristics found in each of the individual case strategies.

Case Report Analysis and Findings

Analysis of the three paradigm logic models revealed several common categories: [administrative context](#), [vision](#), [care](#), [equity](#), [mission](#), and [district support](#). The [administrative context](#) is the set of conditions under which each principal executes her respective [administrative strategy](#) (core phenomenon). [Vision](#), [care](#), and [equity](#) are conditions that influence the way and manner in which the strategy is executed. [Mission](#) and [district support](#) are outcome categories that occur as a result of the [strategy](#).

The [administrative context](#) is unique for each case. It is the environment within which the principal acts. It includes the characteristics of the principal herself as well as the characteristics of the environment.

[Vision](#) is an ideal future state of affairs that guides each principal's actions. It is unique to each principal and is matched to the needs of the school. [Care](#) and [equity](#), on the other hand, are similar across cases. [Care](#) is defined as concern and consideration for the well-being of others (e.g., [trust](#), [respect](#), [understanding](#), and [commitment](#)) while [equity](#) is defined as being fair, impartial, and just (e.g., [regulating](#), [disciplining](#), [controlling](#), and [upholding policies and procedures](#)).

Two other common constructs, [service](#) and [maternalism](#), emerged with less significance. They were subsumed under the category of [care](#). All of the principals perceived their work to be a [service](#) to the community; and when working with the students, they all exhibited some stereotypical maternal behaviors associated with caring about the welfare of the students. They would tease them about any slightly inappropriate behavior. They would remind them of their obligations and would provide information about safety. All of them enjoyed talking with students about their classes and, in some cases, their personal lives.

Within a unique **administrative context**, each principal implemented an **administrative strategy** that was guided by a **vision** and tempered by **care** and **equity**. As each principal directed her strategy toward accomplishing the educational **mission**, she earned **district support**.

Cross-Case Report Analysis and Findings

A re-examination of data events across cases increased both the quantity and quality of observations in the categories of **care** and **equity**, **vision** and **mission**, and **district support**. These findings are presented below.

Context of Care

Each principal, through her thinking and her actions, appeared to be guided by consideration for the people with whom she was working as well as by the responsibilities, rules, and rights governing those people. These two categories were examined for their common characteristics.

The category of **care** contained seven characteristics which describe the manner in which the principals "cared". They were **relational**, **responsive**, **situational**, **particularized**, **feeling**, **confirmatory**, and **constancy**. The category, **equity**, was expanded and relabeled **justice**. Because the two concepts, **care** and **justice**, appeared to be interconnected in their application, they were combined to create the **context of care**.

The **context of care** is defined as a relational agreement with others that preserves and enhances the well being of others while acting in an equitable and fair manner. Care occurs in relationship to other people. It is stereotypically associated with the feminine. Consequently, it is often devalued in the world of business. There is evidence, however, that this is changing. Care has been historically associated with the gender-assigned role of women as caretaker, nurturer, and nursemaid. As such, it is regarded as less important than the singular principles of justice or equity, processes that are associated with men and with rules outside the home in the business arena.

Carol Gilligan (1982), among others, publicly challenge men's historical moral and intellectual superiority arguing that women's morality is evidenced through a "different voice". Gilligan's thesis was that most women speak in a different, not inferior, moral voice stemming from a contextual identity of self. In this outlook, care and responsibility to others, rather than justice and individual rights, become the fundamental ethical principles.

Nel Noddings (1984, 1991, 1992, 1995) expounded upon the ethic of care, not as a moral development process (Gilligan, 1987), but rather as an instinctive response to life focusing as much on feeling as on reasoning. It is through her extensive work, as well as that of others, that care has been legitimately recognized as an important aspect of life. Noddings argues that it is a necessary component of education and critical in responding to the enormous social changes that are occurring today. Gayle, the guardian principal of an inner city, urban high school acknowledged this need: "At Ethan Allen, we spend a lot of time caring".

Selected data events from the narrative and case report analyses were used to demonstrate the characteristics of care identified during the cross-case analysis (Appendix G). Collectively, the characteristics create the **context of care**. It is this **context** that influences the administrative strategy sensitizing the principals to individuals and their circumstances. This sensitivity appeared to contribute to **goodwill** across the cases even as the principals balanced care for individuals with care for the organization.

Vision and Mission

The category of **vision** was a significant condition influencing the **administrative strategy**. **Vision** was, in a sense, the ideal school fashioned from the principal’s perception of the needs of the school. It appeared to provide an ideal toward which to direct administrative effort. It is different from the mission in that it is an abstract ideal state. The mission is tangible and, through accomplishing goals and objectives, achievable.

The **mission** was common across the three cases: delivering educational services to the students. It was an outcome of the **administrative strategy**. The visions for each case are listed in Table 5.2.

Table 5.2 Principals’ Visions

	Vision
Case 1	Successful school focused on achievement
Case 2	Safe school focused on preserving amicable interactions
Case 3	Well-equipped school focused on productivity

District Support

During the cross-case analysis, **district support** emerged as common across cases. The school communities as well as the superintendents appeared to support the principals as evidenced by the categories of **relational** and **decisional** transactions.

Administrative Fit

Administrative fit was an emerging category at the conclusion of the analysis. This category suggests that each principal was effectively matched to her school organization for the following reasons:

- ? The principals enjoyed **district support** (school and district office).
- ? The characteristics and behaviors of each principal appear to be matched to the needs of the school organization resulting in **goodwill**.
- ? The category, **administrative fit characteristic**, appears to be a trait which links the principal and the organization together.

The findings for this category are inconclusive, but interesting.

Research Questions

Initial interest in this study focused on how women's behavior, as school administrators, might differ from men's behavior. Much of the research on the topic pointed to a variety of gender difference while current "pop psychology" claims that men are from Mars and women are from Venus, amnestic beings cohabiting on earth (Gray, 1992).

The guiding research questions, therefore, initially focused on investigating the phenomenon of gender-related values, beliefs, and behaviors. However, as research progressed, the use of gender filters was deemed too limiting to study the behaviors observed. They were not used to capture, record, analyze, or report the data in the narratives or the case reports, although associations with stereotypical feminine and masculine behaviors are evident.

During cross-case analysis, several common **conditions** emerged as significant. Two of those conditions, **care** and **justice**, are concepts discussed extensively in the literature on gender differences. Together they contribute significantly to the way and manner in which each principal behaved as an administrator (**administrative style**).

In an effort to facilitate alignment of this study's contribution with the research on women's experiences as school administrators, the initial research questions are addressed below.

Under what circumstances and to what degree do feminine and masculine characteristics manifest in these three principals?

As described in the narratives and case reports, each of the principals exhibited both feminine and traditional administrative characteristics as defined by various research authorities reported in Chapter 2: Loden (1985), Hegelsen (1990), and Eagly (1995). However, they all acted within a context of care as they managed school operations using **justice** to inform **care**. Care is historically and stereotypically associated with women, while **justice** is stereotypically associated with men.

In this study, eight characteristics are associated with the **context of care**, which governs each principal's behavior. They are **relational**, **responsive**, **situational**, **particularized**, **feeling**, **confirmatory**, **constancy** and **justice**. The principals were purposeful and administered in a logical, rational manner. Rather than allowing universal principle or application to guide their behavior, they allowed themselves to be led by feelings, needs, and situational circumstances associated with the individuals involved.

Each of the principals extended the ethic of care beyond the realm of caring for "others" as characterized by Noddings (1990). They took time to care for themselves, for distant others (often through service), for plants (they all enjoyed beautifying the school), for the human-made world (school facilities and equipment), and for ideas (they loved professional discourse).

Maternalism, a construct associated with the "feminine", emerged particularly as principals worked with students. They behaved in a

"motherly" fashion, nurturing students while reminding them about behavioral expectations and their responsibilities as young adults.

Patricia enjoyed meeting with students who were obtaining their driver's license to encourage safe driving practices and warn them about danger: "I don't want to read about you in the newspaper!" Connie was the matriarch of her school community and behaved much as a mother bear caring for her cubs.

There was little evidence to suggest the use of the "feminine" concept, women's intuition. Although the constructive principal reported that when making decisions she often just "winged it", when questioned further about this, "winging it" was not the use of intuition. It was evident that "winging it" pertained more to using tradition and logic in decision-making than with using intuitive guidance.

The Guardian principal did seem to exhibit a natural, almost instinctual ability to perceive trouble. This was not labeled as intuition, but rather remained an inference based upon her constant environmental scanning and ability to react quickly. Safety consciousness was noted as a high professional priority.

In the literature, the concept of intuition is associated with feminine decision-making: "making intuitive decisions". Hegelsen (1990) and Loden (1985) report that women are intuitive and do make intuitive decisions, while men tend to make rational decisions. There was no evidence in this study to suggest that the principals used their "women's intuition".

There was evidence to suggest that the principals used emotion, cognition, and action. Emotion concerned feelings, which accompanied decisional and relational events. Cognition involved the use of analysis and logic to facilitate comprehension and understanding. Action was characterized by determination, vitality, and direction. The combined use of these three functions garnered the principals both trust and respect in their school organizations.

What values and beliefs motivate the leadership behavior of these three principals?

Values and beliefs concern rules of conduct. They have a strong cognitive component because they grow out of people's understanding of the world. Social norms and institutional demands often influence people's values and beliefs.

Each of the principals shares a strong belief in the importance of directing all school efforts toward the **mission**. They highly value education and learning and assume personal responsibility for the care of the students and the operations of the organization. As reported in the case reports, the operational definition of **mission** is delivering educational services to the students. Students are the beneficiary recipients of the administrative strategy process while the staff is the primary target towards whom the strategy is directed.

Each of the principals appears to be directed by a primary **value** that motivates their **administrative style**. This is an intra-psychic force,

which appears to be unrelated to gender. See Table 5.3: Administrative Strategies and Values.

Table 5.3 Administrative Strategies and Values

	Principal	Admin Strategy	Primary Admin Value
Case 1	Professional	Principled marketing	Integrity
Case 2	Guardian	Steadfast shepherding	Vigilance
Case 3	Constructive	Preeminent proffering	Generosity

For example, motivated by [integrity](#) ([administrative value](#)), the professional principal uses [principled marketing](#) ([administrative strategy](#)) to influence the staff ([administrative focus](#)) so their work efforts are directed at delivering educational services ([mission](#)) that will benefit the students ([administrative beneficiary](#)).

Other values ([secondary, tertiary values](#)) support the [primary value](#). They are presented and defined in Appendix D.

What symbols are associated with each principal's behavior?

Symbols are expressions of human nature. They are pictorial representations that stand for something as a result of relationship, association, convention, or accident.

Throughout history emblems like flags served as powerful cultural symbols: the Stars and Stripes that appear on the American flag, the Confederate flag, and the Swastika (a symbol which today carries a negative war association but historically was a powerfully positive symbol). Symbols like the heart shape, the cross, the eagle, the dove, cupid with his bow and arrow, and the four-leaf clover can affect consciousness regardless of human awareness.

Concepts also have symbolic associations. The concepts of [care](#) and [justice](#), important constructs associated with this study, are linked with symbols originating in Greek mythology. In the same way beauty and love are linked with Aphrodite and strength is linked with Hercules, care and justice are linked with two Greek goddesses respectively.

Associated with the feminine concept of [care](#) is Goddess Demeter, whose name may mean "Mother Earth" or "Mother Nature" ("Demeter", 2000); *meter* seems to mean mother, although it is not altogether clear what *de* means. She is goddess of the harvest and the goddess associated with the care of children and women predisposed to nurturing others. She represents the "maternal instinct fulfilled through pregnancy or through providing physical, psychological, or spiritual nourishment to others" (Bolen, 1984, p. 171). She protects women drawn to the traditionally feminine professions such as teaching, social work, and nursing.

Associated with the masculine concept of [justice](#), is Astraea, the goddess of Justice, daughter of Themises, goddess of divine justice. Pictures of her, as "Justice Blindfolded", are located throughout the world. Perhaps more popular than the caduceus [the staff of the God of

Healing, Asclepius] which symbolizes physicians and medicine, Astraea represents judges and the court system.

Blindfolded, Astraea represents the precept that justice must be blind to individual needs, relying primarily on universal rules and principles which operationalize into "laws of the land". The scales Astraea holds represent balance, equality, justice, and harmony while the dagger represents the consequences inherent in breaking "the law". As a robed, middle-aged woman, Astraea represents the wisdom of age and temperance guided by the "golden mean" ("Astraea", 2000).

The "golden mean" refers to Aristotle's view of midlife as a time of balance between youth and old age, optimism and pessimism, altruism and practicality. This concept of balance appears to be significant in "Justice Blindfolded" as the scales Astraea holds suggest equilibrium. Astraea is also feminine (her name means "star maiden") which suggests mercy, the element which tempers or balances the use of the dagger.

In an effort to create awareness about the significance of symbols and their meaning, a symbol from the offices of the principals was selected to represent their unique administrative style. As an inferred conceptual representation, its purpose is to capture the spirit of each principal's traits and behaviors.

The [apple](#) is the symbol chosen to represent Patricia's administrative style. She is extremely professional, polished, and personal. One afternoon she gave an [apple](#) to her custodian for doing a fine job of preparing the building and grounds for back-to-school night. In Norse mythology, the goddess of love and magic, Freyja would give golden apples to the gods to refresh and rejuvenate them (Fontana, 1993).

The [apple](#) is a symbol of the profession of education and is associated with teachers and learning. Patricia has a collection of decorative [apples](#) in her office. As the professional principal, Patricia always maintains a "polished" and very professional presentation.

The [apple](#) is also associated with the feminine. It is associated with the circle, wholeness, female breasts, and with the core sliced in half, it can represent the vulva. Culturally, it is infamous for its association with Eve in the Garden of Eden as a symbol of temptation and original sin (Protas, Brown & Smith, 1997, Apple).

The [table](#) is the symbol chosen to represent Gayle's administrative style. The table is associated with gatherings and communions. In medieval legend, King Arthur met with his Knights at the Round Table. In Christian theology, Jesus and his disciples convened the Last Supper at a large banquet table (Protas, et al., 1997, Table).

Gayle, the guardian principal, holds meetings and builds consensus around tables. She uses a large [table](#) for meetings in the administrative conference room and a small coffee [table](#), surrounded by an upholstered love seat and chairs, for meetings in her office. Metaphorically, she invites dialogue with reference to a table: "Let's bring it to the table".

The [table](#) can be regarded as a feminine symbol because it is round or oval (a feminine shape) and because of its association with processes women manage. For example, gathering around a [table](#) for a meeting

represents relationship, a feminine principle. The preparation and consumption of food, a historically feminine domain, is customarily performed at a [table](#).

The symbol chosen to represent Connie is [blueprints](#). Connie, the constructive principal, is concerned with building up people and things. Connie works with blueprints as she oversees the construction of the new wing to the school and in planning a new sports field house. Blueprints symbolize the planning and interconnectedness necessary to bring ideas into reality.

[Blueprints](#) can be associated with an ancient symbol, the maze or a modern symbol, the matrix, or with nature, the spider's web. All are lateral or flat representations of reality with one central point.

For ancient Egyptians, the maze symbolized the path through the underworld. The dead were required to follow the great Egyptian goddess, Isis, to the center, where Osiris rendered judgment. The maze, then, came to be linked with the mysterious, the feminine, and the creative power of giver of life and deliver of death (Fontana, 1995).

Characterized by lines and spaces, [blueprints](#) are very similar to a matrix, which has come to represent today's vast communication network of telephones and computers. When connecting globally, this network is often referred to as "the web".

[Blueprints](#) are also similar to the spider's web, which for the Celts symbolized the manner in which all of life was held together. The spider itself, often pictured in the center of the web, stands for the Great Mother (Fontana, 1995).

People can also be regarded as symbols. They personify attributes or ideas, which are highly regarded by a culture. For example, Mother Teresa of Calcutta represents charity for the sick and the needy. Uncle Sam, a rather common man, came to symbolize freedom and the American Way. Jesus and Buddha are powerful figures who represent whole systems of religious thought. Princess Diana was affectionately called the "Queen of Hearts" while Martha Stewart today is the reigning goddess of garden and home.

Connie, the constructive principal, is such a symbol in the Greenland High School community, on a smaller scale, of course. She is the "Great Mother", a matriarch in the truest sense of the word. She is one of those rare individuals who actually embodies the spirit of a group; and, as such, becomes a living symbol for them.

Summary

Each principal exhibited a unique style influenced by the context within which she administered. However, there were common elements across the styles involving types of categories: presence, a way and manner of working with people, a sense of vision, and a way and manner of facilitating operations.

Symbols are the external representations of the character of each principal. They embody the professional attributes of a principal; and, in a sense, project an element of professional spirit.

Each of the principals are female; however, it would be spurious to conclude that they each act in a stereotypically feminine manner. Their behavior appears to be associated more with their personality characteristics, some of which could be considered feminine and some of which could be considered masculine. In addition, the school culture and professional vision appear to influence behavior as well as does the variety of situations in which the principals engage themselves.

The cross-case analysis suggests that the principals are effectively matched to the needs of their school organization ([administrative fit](#)). This finding, however, is not conclusive.