Design and Testing of a Quick-Connect Wheelchair Power Add-On Unit

Laura L. Clark

Dissertation submitted to the Faculty of the Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State
University in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

in

Industrial and Systems Engineering

John G. Casali, Chairman Beverly A. Williges Patrick C. Koelling Robert C. Williges

December 4, 1997

L. Thompson Hanes

Blacksburg, Virginia

Keywords: Power Attachment, Usability Testing, Electric Wheelchair, Product Evaluation

Laura L. Clark

Design and Testing of a Quick-Connect Wheelchair Power Add-On Unit

Laura L. Clark

(ABSTRACT)

A quick-connect wheelchair power add-on unit (PAU) has been developed at the Human Factors Engineering Center of Virginia Tech. The objective of the invention is to provide an inexpensive, highly portable product which can quickly convert a manual wheelchair into a power-operated wheelchair. This dissertation details the three year research and design effort to develop the new wheelchair PAU. Results are presented from a series of evaluations conducted to identify performance and user-interaction characteristics of the PAU. Interpretation of the results provides a prioritized list of identified design deficiencies along with wheelchair expert and design team suggestions for the next generation of design alterations.

The three evaluations conducted with the second generation PAU prototype include a series of wheelchair expert interviews, a PAU performance evaluation, and a usability evaluation which utilized wheelchair operators as subjects. Also included in the dissertation is an explanation of the need for a new PAU, a description of the most recent design iteration, a literature review containing information about the history of wheelchairs, the condition of the current PAU market, and an analysis of wheelchair PAU consumers.

The new invention was conceived and patented by Dr. John G. Casali of the Industrial and Systems Engineering (ISE) Department at Virginia Tech. This research was supported jointly by Southwestern Applied Technologies, L. C., of Roanoke, Virginia and Virginia's Center for Innovative Technology in Herndon, Virginia.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This dissertation was produced by the efforts and sacrifices of many individuals. I wish to thank everyone who has assisted with this process and acknowledge them here.

Thanks to my committee who have been tolerant and supportive through several years. Dr. John Casali, my advisor, provided unwavering guidance and worked to assemble financial support as well as avenues for continued growth of the project. The basis of this research and design effort was Dr. Casali's PAU invention and he kindly allowed me to share in each step of its development. Mr. Thomas Hanes of Southwestern Applied Technologies contributed financial resources along with his time and energy to oversee the work and assist in my academic achievements. Dr. Robert Williges provided hours of invaluable research design and evaluation counseling. I have also had the pleasure of attending several of his lecture courses throughout the years, which provided a solid foundation for my work. Mrs. Beverly Williges and Dr. Patrick Koelling provided guidance, encouragement, and a willingness to help at all times. I have found them to be very patient and generous; any student would be fortunate to have this assistance through an academic career.

In addition to the financial support provided by Southwestern Applied Technologies, the project was also sponsored by the Center for Innovative Technology located in Herndon, Virginia.

Much of the innovative success of the project was due to the skilled work of Mr. Randy Waldron. Mr. Waldron fabricated two PAU prototypes and contributed many original ideas to the design process. He continually demonstrated a positive attitude which promoted a good team-oriented design atmosphere. I express my gratitude to Mr. Waldron and to Mr. Will Vest who provided the electronic expertise for the project.

I also wish to thank Mr. Jack Mitchell who devoted countless hours to the completion of the PAU evaluation. Mr. Mitchell was indispensable in his work dealing with subjects, recording evaluation data, and contributing design suggestions.

My appreciation is also expressed to those who have provided for my personal development. I thank my grandparents, parents, sister, and teachers: Pete Ingersol, Don McElhone, and Leroy Hampton. My greatest appreciation is expressed to Dixie, Kittie, and Ed. Their sacrifices have provided the opportunity to accomplish this goal. Finally, I must thank Kalimar, without whom I would not have had the time to complete this dissertation.

Thank you all.

Table of Contents

Abstract	
Acknowledgements	iii
Table of Contents	iv
List of Figures	vii
List of Tables	ix
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
Chapter 2: Literature Review	5
History of Wheelchairs and Power Add-On Units	5
Products Currently on the Market	6
The Wheelchair Power Add-On Unit Consumer	14
United States Wheelchair Market	16
Chapter 3: Expert Information Interview Evaluation	18
Objective	18
Expert Opinion Capture Technique	19
Development of Interview Questions	19
Interview Questions	20
Interview/Demonstration Procedures	21
Results and Data Analysis	23
Discussion	29
Chapter 4: Performance Evaluation of the Power Add-On Unit	30
Objective	30
Methods	30
Maximum Speed	31
Grade Climbing Capability	33
Dynamic Stability	36
Battery Life	38
Obstacle Climbing	41
Additional Performance Observations	43
Chapter 5: Usability Evaluation	50
Objective	50
Usability Evaluation Tools	50
Methods	53
Specification of Procedures	55
Attachment and Detachment of the Battery	61

Attachment and Detachment of the Column	62
Transfer to and from the Wheelchair with the PAU Attached	63
Switching Column Modes	63
Driving Tasks	64
Maneuvering Tasks	66
Questionnaire	66
Pretesting	66
Results and Data Analysis	67
Evaluation Structure	80
Chapter 6: Design Recommendations	83
Safety Issues	83
Securing Crossbar Instability	85
Power Operation in Reverse	87
Two-Handed Attachment/Detachment Procedures	88
Component Accessibility	90
Locations of Wiring Components	92
Crossbar/Securing Block Interface	94
Column Position and Motion in Transfer Mode	96
Controls	97
Additional Design Deficiencies	99
Reasonably Foreseeable Misuse	101
Chapter 7: Conclusion	102
References	104
Chapter 8: Appendices	A-1
Appendix A	
Description of the New Power Add-On Unit	A-1
Appendix B	
Wheelchairs Circa 1997	B-1
Appendix C	
Patents for Add-On Power Devices	C-1
Appendix D	
Assistive Device Consumers	D-1
Appendix E	
Wheelchair User Disability Groups	E-1
Appendix F	
Expert Interview Questions and Responses	F-1

Appendix G
Expert Interview Informed Consent FormG-1
Appendix H
ANSI/RESNA Wheelchair Standards OutlineH-1
Appendix I
Motor Sound Level MeasurementsI-1
Appendix J
Usability Evaluation Informed Consent FormJ-1
Appendix K
User Evaluation Questionnaire and Subject ResponsesK-1
Appendix L
Time Data Statistical ComparisonsL-1

List of Figures

Figure 1. New power add-on unit attached to a manual wheelchair	2
Figure 2. Side view of manual and power operating modes	4
Figure 3. Fortress 1000FS add-on power attachment	8
Figure 4. Damaco D90 power attachment	8
Figure 5. Roll-Aid add-on power drive	9
Figure 6. Redman add-on power devices	9
Figure 7. Damaco Electro-Lite transportable wheelchair	13
Figure 8. Fortress Commuter transportable wheelchair	14
Figure 9. U-shaped release mechanism replacement suggestion	24
Figure 10. Two-bar grip release mechanism replacement suggestion	24
Figure 11. Battery voltage measurement versus trial (distance traveled)	40
Figure 12. Wheelchair motor and ambient sound spectrums	49
Figure 13. Critical incident tool	61
Figure 14. The driving and maneuvering task course	65
Figure 15. Suggestion for lower crossbar release mechanism	77
Figure 16. Forward/reverse control suggestion	78
Figure 17. Ease of operation questionnaire results	79
Figure 18. Collar solution for pinch point problem	84
Figure 19. Column motions resulting from the ground reaction force	86
Figure 20. Column unit angle of approach for attachment	89
Figure A-1. Attachment of securing crossbars to wheelchair frame	A-2
Figure A-2. Compression spring housing	A-3
Figure A-3. Exploded view of the drivetrain assembly	
Figure A-4. Crossbar securing block (blocks 1 and 2 of 10)	
Figure A-5. Crossbar securing block (blocks 3 and 4 of 10)	A-5
Figure A-6. Crossbar securing block (blocks 5 and 6 of 10)	A-5
Figure A-7. Crossbar securing block (blocks 7 and 8 of 10)	A-5
Figure A-8. Crossbar securing block (blocks 9 and 10 of 10)	A-5
Figure A-9. Steering bar	A-5
Figure A-10. Steering bar cover	A-5
Figure A-11. Handle	A-5
Figure A-12. Slip-ring cover	A-5
Figure A-13. Inner column tube	
Figure A-14. Outer column tube	A-5

Figure A-15.	Crossbar	A-5
Figure A-16.	Crossbar poppit inserts	A-5
Figure A-17.	Crossbar release finger grip	A-5
Figure A-18.	Column/crossbar attachment block (pieces 1 and 2 of 4)	A-5
Figure A-19.	Column/crossbar attachment block (piece 3 of 4)	A-5
Figure A-20.	Column/crossbar attachment block (piece 4 of 4)	A-5
Figure A-21.	Wheel support side plate	A-5
Figure A-22.	Wheel support top plate	A-5
Figure A-23.	Inner column tube support block	A-5
Figure A-24.	Gearbox	A-5
Figure A-25.	Gearbox cover	A-5
Figure A-26.	Motor cover (piece 1 of 2)	A-5
Figure A-27.	Motor cover (piece 2 of 2)	A-6
Figure A-28.	Motor locking support	A-6
Figure A-29.	Motor ring support	A-6
Figure A-30.	Axle augmentation	A-6
Figure A-31.	Cloth pattern for battery sling	A-6
Figure B-1.	Folding manual wheelchair	B-1
Figure B-2.	Straight-through and drop-down wheelchair frame types	B-3

List of Tables

Table 1. Power Add-On Units	7
Table 2. Transportable Power Wheelchairs	12
Table 3. Results from the Maximum Speed Performance Evaluation	32
Table 4. Results from the Grade Climbing Performance Evaluation	35
Table 5. Results from the Battery Life Performance Evaluation	39
Table 6. Results from the Obstacle Climbing Performance Evaluation	43
Table 7. Time Data Collection Sheet	58
Table 8. Critical Incident Data	61
Table 9. Time to Complete User Performance Tasks	68
Table 10. Pre-Task Time Willing to Spend Estimates	70
Table 11. Post-Task Time Willing to Spend Estimates	70
Table 12. Problems Identified by Critical Incident Analysis	75
Table 13. Problems Identified by Critical Observation Analysis	75
Table B-1. Wheelchair Sizes Available From Major Manufacturers	B-3
Table C-1. Patents for Add-On Power Devices	C-1