The Meaning of the Motherhood Experience to the Work of the Internal Organizational Development Consultant/Manager: Three Case Studies

Patricia Ann Morgan

Dissertation submitted to the Faculty of the
Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University
In partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
in
Human Development
(Adult Learning)

M. Boucouvalas, Chair
M. G. Cline
P. Brott
C. Klunk
L. Morris

April 10, 2003
Blacksburg, Virginia

Keywords: adult learning theory, ethic of care, grounded theory,
mothering epistemology, organizational development consulting, subjective knowledge

The Meaning of the Motherhood Experience to the Work of the Internal
Organizational Development Consultant/Manager: Three Case Studies

Patricia Ann Morgan

(Abstract)

The dissertation focuses on understanding the mothering experience of three internal organizational development consultant/managers who perceive that their experience informed their professional functioning. The questions that guided the study were: (a) What is the mothering experience of the internal organizational development consultant/manager who perceives that her experience informed her professional functioning? and (b) How does the mothering experience inform the professional functioning of the internal organizational development consultant/manager?

A case study method using the grounded theory method of data analysis produced three narratives that suggested how the mothering experience influenced consulting and managerial functioning. Three themes emerged; namely: "being fully present," "protecting by fighting for trust and safety", and "bringing a caring stance." In two of the cases, however, some contradictions were embedded in the data, suggesting a possible "idealized perception." The ideology of the good mother is suggested as one explanation for the potential discrepancy between the co-researchers' beliefs and self-reports of actual functioning in the three roles of mother, consultant, and manager. A larger construct of "care" emerged, however, and related to the "ethic of care" in organizational practice.

Dedication

This dissertation is dedicated to my adult children, Michael and Michelle Morgan and my grandson, Ned Morgan. Michael provided technological assistance throughout the process as well as support and encouragement. Michelle believed in me. Both have transformed my life and keep me on the path of the "good enough mother." However, it has been said that you don't know how good of a mother you have been until you see how your grandchildren turn out. And Ned is currently being "mothered" by his stay-at-home dad, Michael.

Acknowledgements

The past eight years have been a transformative adult learning experience for me. I am grateful to my advisory committee, the co-researchers, family, friends, and professional colleagues who helped make this challenging topic a reality. Dr. Marcie Boucouvalas, my committee chair, who always believed in the topic, was supportive, committed, and encouraging throughout the process. Dr. M. Gerry Cline's constant challenging caused thinking, reflection, and growth while guiding the research process. Dr. Pam Brott provided invaluable comments in the production of the final iteration of the project. Dr. Clare Klunk was always available and accompanied me to my initial presentation of this work to an academic community, The Society for Research in Adult Development in New York City, 2001. Dr. Linda Morris provided continued positive regard and valuable suggestions.

Michele Eldredge, secretary of the Adult Learning Program, became a wonderful friend who offered editorial assistance and ongoing support. Alice McAndrew, fellow student and faithful friend, offered continual support and encouragement throughout the process. Lori Gibbons served as "cheerleader," fellow compatriot, and technological guru. Victoria Decker provided moral support during the last stages of the process.

Last, but not least, I want to acknowledge the unsung heroes of the dissertation process, the staff of the Illiad Service and the Northern Virginia Resource Center personnel, for their kindness and cooperation.

Table of Contents

List of Tables

Chapter I: Introduction

Some internal organizational development consultant/managers perceived that their mothering experience contributed to their consulting and managerial work. The purpose of this study was to better understand their mothering experience and how it contributed to their functioning in a professional role. This study adds to the scholarly knowledge about mothering and its potential influence in the workplace, as well as to scholarship regarding women's (i.e., mothers') voices in organizational development consulting (Kaplan, 1994). In addition, this study adds to the literature regarding the advancement of maternal experiences and qualities, particularly, the connection of mothering to professional roles (Abbey, 1995; Collins, 1998; MacDonald, 1996; Stern, 1992), an inquiry that is currently valued by those researching mothering (Association for Research on Mothering [ARM], 1998).

If the experience of mothering provides some women with important skills, knowledge, and abilities, as well as possible transformative changes that enhance their ability to function in the workplace, this study would also add to the ongoing scholarly debate about whether mothering can be viewed as "work" that has economic value (Crittenden, 2001; Hart, 1992; Ruddick, 1989; Seery, 1996) rather than by its more traditional definition (Boris, 1994; Chodorow, 1978; Everingham, 1994; Hart, 1992; Ribbins, 1994; Richardson, 1993), which devalues it by continuing to place it within the "private" sector (the home) rather than in the "public" workplace. The foundation of this research was based on the conceptualization of the mothering experience both as a form of "work" and as an adult educative process that may provide important experiences that influence and are valued in the practice of internal organizational development consulting and management.

Background of the Problem—The Valuation of Mothering

Forces Devaluing Mothering

In colonial times, economic and family life took place on the farm, with all family members being co-workers. The industrial revolution, however, led to the fracturing of the job site from the household, creating the "ideology of separate and gendered spheres"(Gerstel & Gross, 1987, p. 13) wherein the "work" of mothering was relegated to the private realm (the home) rather than in the "public" workplace, which meant it no longer was considered to have economic value (Crittenden, 2001).

Crittenden (2001) discusses how the work of mothering disappeared from an economic perspective. After the industrial revolution, as women were no longer needed in the "public" work force, the roles of mother and child took on a new significance. Mothers were accorded moral authority as the psychological creator of human capital for industrialization through a "labor of love" without economic value and were supported by the "working" member of the family, who was usually a man. Mothers specialized in providing the "expressive functions" on behalf of the personality of family members, that "haven in a heartless world" (Crittenden, 2001, pp. 47-51).

Crittenden (2001) contends that feminists in the beginning of the 20th century either valued or devalued mothering. Some denigrated mothering as being a role that kept women dependent on men, and only paid employment outside the family could bring equality for women. Others sought equality by demanding recognition and remuneration for the mothering role. During the remainder of the 20th century and into the new millennium, the women's movement followed the first path, resulting in a few cracks in the "glass ceiling," but motherhood has remained devalued. This study supports the second path, which builds on the feminists' more recent efforts to have the federal government define "work" as "an activity that produces something of value for other people" (Gerstel & Gross, 1987, p.5).

Forces Valuing Mothering

Currently, both popular and scholarly literature, as well as social action, values mothering and provided the impetus for this research. Historical evidence suggests that the skills of mothering and managing a family were valued as early as the 1800's (Crittenden, 2001). Catherine Beecher's Treatise on Domestic Economy, published in 1841, argued that housework (which at that time included childrearing) required the political skills, wisdom, firmness, tact, discrimination, prudence, and versatility, as well as the system and order of a business (Crittenden, 2001). A 19th century historian, Jeanne Boydston, claimed that the cash value of work done by wives was far greater than the cost of their maintenance (Crittenden, 2001). More recently, using 1997 data from the National Study of the Changing Workforce, Hays (1996) observed that at all economic levels, mothers consider raising children as serious business requiring much effort. Currently, professionally employed women work harder at childrearing than their grandmothers and less educated women do (Hays, 1996).

Conceptualizing Mothering as Work

Crittenden (2001) argues that mothering must be conceptualized as "work" if it is ever to be accorded social, legal, or economic value. The scholarly works of Ruddick (1989), Hart (1992), and Seery (1996) discuss mothering as being a special kind of work that gives rise to a certain epistemology based on experiential learning, thus challenging assumptions that it does not rely on specially learned skills and demands.

Ruddick (1989) describes the ideal of "mother's thought" as including intellectual capacities developed, judgments made, metaphysical attitudes assumed, and values affirmed while doing a "mother's work" or engaging in "maternal practice," the goals of which are preserving, growing, and raising a socially-acceptable person. She noted that there is no language by which to capture the ordinary/extraordinary pleasures and pains of maternal work. She makes reference to the learning that

emanates from mothering. "We think when we are disturbed, and the aim of our thinking is to recover our equilibrium" (Ruddick, 1989 p. 31).

Hart (1992) views mothering as a form of subsistence labor, which involves the maintaining, caring, nurturing, or relational activities that has as its focus the production and taking care of life. Hart's attempt to define an epistemology of mothering resonated with the researcher as a mother and initially piqued the researcher's interest in the topic. The boldness of Hart's attempt to describe a knowledge base that emerges from the experience of mothering challenges the historical devaluation of the role. An attempt to illuminate the economic as well as social value of the role led the researcher to ask the question: What learning from the mothering experience was useful to the world of work? Literature on transformational leaders (Rolls, 1995) and their competencies echoed characteristics of the mothering role that appeared in Hart's (1992) work, such as providing a holding place for employees, managing chaos, systems thinking, compassion, and ego subordination-- to name only a few.

Seery (1996), building on Hochschild's (1983) conception of emotion work, describes four types of mothering emotion work: distress management, relationship management, ego work, and pleasure/enjoyment work. According to Seery (1996), doing mothering emotion work is often a multi-stepped process that involves either deliberately doing or not doing a multiplicity of physical, verbal, mental, and emotional tasks, which she describes for the four types of emotion work.

Mothering as Informing Work

Popular literature suggests that the mothering skills most useful on the job are the following: time management; prioritizing; problem-solving; negotiating; and dealing with several people, all of whom want your attention at the same time (Conran, 1999; Goldman, 1996). Conran (1999) points out that if a woman can manage a family she can manage a department and wonders why firms do not take those management skills into account when filling a vacancy.

More scholarly research on the influence of the mothering experience on a professional role includes Stern's (1992) qualitative study of the positive carryover from home to work leadership skills for career women who are mothers. Kaplan's (1994) study of female external organizational development consultants mentions that a few women likened their work to maternal functioning, stating that raising a family was not so different from supporting the growth and development of people in organizations. More recently, feminist scholars have studied the influence of mothering on the professional role of teachers and nurses (Abbey, 1995; Collins, 1998; Mac Donald, 1996). Their findings support Stern's (1992) work regarding the democratic type of leadership and valuing of the affective domain that carried over from the mothering experience to the professional role.

Mothering as Transformation

The process of pregnancy, birth, delivery and care of an infant provides a possible opportunity for transformation (Barlow, 1993; Comart, 1983; Stern, 1995). Stern (1995) defines his conceptualization of this transformation as being a psychic reorganization that takes place during a first pregnancy and mothering of an infant up to three years of age as the "motherhood constellation." This psychic reorganization, which includes a change in self-definition, may last a few months or a lifetime (Barlow, 1993; Comart, 1983; Stern. 1995).

In her study of women's voices in organizational development consulting, Kaplan (1994) reports that a few of the external organizational development consultants in her sample felt that the experience of pregnancy and delivering a child impacted their world-view or paradigm about work. One woman changed her focus from education, which seemed more content focused, to consulting, which she felt was more processed oriented, because childbirth had changed her:

"The fact of the mutuality of labor, the baby and me, the process of laboring was so much more interesting to me than anything I have ever experienced. I think I altered my paradigm about work on the delivery table" (Kaplan, 1994, p.158).

Mothering as an Adult Educative Process

There is substantial scholarship that emphasizes the adult learning and development that emanates from mothering (Barlow, 1993; Comart, 1983; Coulter, 2001; Hart, 1992; Ruddick, 1989; Stern, 1992). This viewpoint builds on the seminal work of Gilligan (1982) and Belenky, et al. (1986), who illuminate how the psychological development of women is different from that of men, rather than being considered dysfunctional or of lesser value in comparison, and underscores the importance of relationship in "women's ways of knowing" (Belenky, et al., 1986). Ruddick (1989) challenges the social norms of her time by wondering if "a mother's chattering creates discourse? Could what we thought and the way we thought be put to use?" (Ruddick, 1989, p. 11). Ideally, a mother's intellect and psychology are in constant flux while adapting to changes in her child (Barlow, 1993; Comart, 1983; Hart, 1992; Ruddick, 1989). Hart (1992) explicates the flexible epistemology of mothering that arises from its practice and underscores how the "knowing" from mothering is an adult educative process based on an alternative concept of work and thus should be regarded as a productive process or "productive work" (Hart, 1992, p. 191). There is a lack of language, however, to describe mother's work, first noted by Ruddick (1989) and addressed by many other researchers (Abbey, 1995; Coulter, 2001; Erkut, S., & Winds of Change Foundation, 2001; Seery, 1996; Stern, 1992) in their attempt to legitimize the knowledge gained from mothering.

Social Action Advancing the Value of Mothering

The Association for Research on Mothering, known as ARM, was founded at York University, Ontario, in 1998 for the purpose of promoting maternal scholarship, both at the university and

community level, and is inclusive of all mothers world-wide, especially for marginalized groups (ARM Website, 2001). I had the opportunity to present this ongoing inquiry at their international conference entitled: Mothering: Power/Oppression in July 2001, at Queensland University, Australia.

Many support groups for stay-at-home mothers exist in local communities. These groups also advocate for opportunities in home-based work, more family-friendly policies in the public workplace, and tax relief for families with children (Burton, Dittmer & Loveless, 1992). The literature that accompanies membership defines the "work" aspects of mothers as managing people, resources, and time (Burton, Dittmer & Loveless, 1992).

Statement of the Problem

Mothering remains devalued in our culture (Crittenden, 2001). Although there may be popular literature that discusses how mothering can inform the work role, there is insufficient scholarly research in this area (Abbey & O'Reilly, 1998). Stern's (1992) conclusion, almost ten years ago, that the learning from mothering parallels the (then) new management paradigm and that the corporate world should value the mothering experience seems to have gone unheard (Crittenden, 2001). Yet, the relatively recent emergence of the Association for Research on Mothering and its interest in connecting the mothering experience with professional roles, as well as, the existence of many professionals who perceive the value of their mothering experience in their professional role, highlights the importance of hearing "mother's voices" within the workplace.

Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this study was to better understand the mothering experience of those professional women who perceived that their mothering experience informed their professional role functioning as internal organizational development consultant/managers. This study afforded an

opportunity to further develop language regarding the mothering experience as well as to hear women's voices in organizational development consulting and managing.

Justification/Significance

There is insufficient scholarly knowledge about how the mothering experience informs professional role functioning. This study also aids in understanding the linkages between the worlds of work and family. While providing a more first person account or subjectivity regarding how the experience of mothering is perceived to give meaning to both work and family roles, this study proposed to provide additional opportunity to legitimize the knowledge gained from the mothering experience.

Research Questions and Definition of Terms

This study focused on the experienced phenomenon of being informed by the mothering experience in the professional role of an internal organizational development consultant/manager. A better understanding of how the experience of mothering informed professional role functioning of some female internal organizational development consultant/managers was the major focus. The questions that guided the study were the following: (a) What is the mothering experience of the internal organizational development consultant/manager who perceives that her experience informed her professional functioning? and (b) How does the mothering experience inform the professional functioning of the internal organizational development consultant/manager?

Mother: Ruddick (1989) defines mother as being a person who takes on responsibility for a child's life and for whom providing child care is a significant part of her working life. This included, then, those who assumed major childrearing responsibility rather than major reliance on live-in surrogate employees or relatives during non-working hours of outside employment, as that would dilute the quality and/or quantity of the experience. Based on Ruddick's (1989) work, daycare providers are

caregivers not mothers. Mothers who use other caregivers during their working hours still commit to arranging this assistance in the work of preserving, nurturing, and guiding their child.

Only biological mothers were used in this study due to the potential nature of the transformative experience of the actual physical process of giving birth. Also, the biological child had to be an adult child to ensure sufficient time for the mothering experience on which to draw. These criteria resulted in all of the mothers being at mid-life, ranging from 52-62 years of age. The age variance did not appear to impact the ability to articulate the usefulness of the mothering experience. Marital status of the mothers varied. Two mothers were married, one was divorced, and one never married.

Mothering: Ruddick (1989) defines mothering as "a work out of which a distinctive thinking arises" (p. 40), thus the title of her seminal volume, *Maternal Thinking*. According to Ruddick (1989), the goals of the "work" of mothering are to protect, nurture, and train a child.

Adult child: at least 18 years of age, which is considered the legal age in most states in order to enter into contracts or execute deeds (Costello, 1991).

Experience: Something personally lived through or encountered (Costello, 1991). This includes physical as well as mental/emotional issues and/or activities that are encountered and handled. It includes knowledge or practical wisdom gained from what one has observed, encountered, or undergone.

Internal Organizational Development Consultant: A salaried employee of the organization upon which the consulting is focused. As differentiated from an external consultant who enters an organization from outside and is either self-employed or works for an organization that specializes in consulting. For this study, a professional who is a member of the local Organizational Development Network (Membership Catalogue of Organizational Development Network, 2002), who has been in practice for at least three years, who are managers, and who perceived that their professional role

functioning was informed by their mothering experience, and are providing services that are generally defined as belonging to the role of an internal organizational development consultant.

Manager: Having supervisory responsibility for people and/or projects. All of the co-researchers were managing projects and/or people at the same time or at different times. Internal consultants who were managers were chosen because the managerial role, in addition to the consulting role, has some common elements with mothering (Fierman, 1990; Frenier, 1997; Kitchen, 1996; Stern, 1992; Watson, 2001). The separation of the two roles in the text is indicated by a slash mark between consultant and manager (consultant/manager). If referring to more than one, the text reads as consultant/managers. This study was limited to self-selected members of the local Organizational Development Network.

The concept of manager has some functional similarities with mothering. It suggests taking care of, or supervision of, usually with a power differential. Good mothers over time ideally give up the power and let go of the responsibility for their adult child. Good managers delegate and reward employees who do not have to be managed to get the work done. However, the manager is always the one ultimately responsible for producing.

Informed: to give or impart knowledge, skills, ways of being with, and ways of knowing (Belenky et al., 1986).

Perceive: to know through the senses. The current study was guided by the position that a person's perception is their "reality." It is their subjective knowledge (Grumet, 1992).

Summary

Articulating the experience of mothering as productive work that offers a learning process that also informs a professional role was the foundation of this study. The main aim was to better understand the mothering experience of those women who perceived that their mothering experience brought something useful to their professional role as internal organizational development consultant/managers

and how the mothering experience informed the professional role functioning. A review of the initial

pertinent literature that led to the conceptualization of the study as well as why this literature was also

reviewed during and after data analysis follows in Chapter II.

Chapter II: Literature Review

My study used a literature review at three stages in the research process: prior to data collection, during data analysis, and after data analysis. The function of the initial literature review, which was completed prior to data collection, helped me frame the phenomenon of interest. This initial review did not necessarily dictate the focus of the study, but represented preliminary conceptualizations of the research issue. Over-reliance on the literature, of course, can lead to researcher bias whereby the researcher may inadvertently focus on finding the "truth" as reflected in the literature rather than on discovering patterns that emerge from the data (Strauss & Corbin, 1998).

The literature at this stage was reviewed to identify the range, scope, extent and type of research that has been done, and to establish the purpose of the study, its background and its significance (Strauss & Corbin, 1998). The literature also stimulated questions that guided initial observations. As data collection and analysis proceeded, the literature, which is considered "data" in itself, continued to be reviewed to verify and elaborate categories emerging from the data as well as guiding theoretical sampling. A final literature review in a qualitative study involves an integration of the relevant literature with the research results, placing the new theory in context with existing work on the subject (Strauss & Corbin, 1998).

Following the procedures above, this literature review was designed to provide an indication of the relevance of the researcher's theoretical sensitivity to the learning that emanated from mothering to the role of an internal organizational development consultant/manager. Literature supporting the conceptualization of mothering as work is presented followed by literature regarding mothers and work. Pertinent applied research regarding these topics is also presented within each section. The most relevant literature regarding the theoretical constructs of adult learning and adult development, which link mothering with professional functioning, follow. The literature regarding the context of the study,

organizational behavior and organizational development consulting with relevant applied studies is presented next. The literature review ends with a focus on the concept of care which emerged as a construct grounded in the data and its relationship to the larger concept of the "ethic of care."

Mothering as Work

In colonial times, economic and family life took place on the farm with all family members being co-workers. The industrial revolution, however, led to the fracturing of the "work" site from the household creating a separation between the "private" and "public" domain and between paid and non-paid labor. These domains were then gendered, and mothering was relegated to the "private" sphere and thus without economic value where it has remained (Crittenden, 2001).

Feminists have addressed this issue frequently (Boris, 1994; Chodorow, 1978; Everingham, 1994; Hart, 1992; Ribbins, 1994; Richardson, 1993). Richardson warns that:

> Although mothering is work, which deserves to be recognized and financially rewarded, it is not a 'job' in the usual sense of the word. It differs from waged work because there is not a fixed job description, no agreed upon hours and conditions of work, and no trade unions. Motherhood is not merely a set of chores; it is work that involves caring for loved ones (p. 26).

Maternal Practice

Sara Ruddick's (1989) seminal work, *Maternal Thinking*, explicates what she considers to be the ideal of "maternal practice," the aim of which is to preserve, nurture, and train the next generation. *Webster's College Dictionary* (1991) defines "practice" as the exercise or pursuit of a profession or the business of a professional person. Ruddick (1989) conceptualizes maternal practice or work in terms of the demands to which the worker responds, which shape and are shaped by certain attributes including cognitive capacities and virtues that make up maternal thinking. Her work is an initial attempt to combat assumptions that mothering does not require specially learned skills and demands, only "love not labor" (p.178).

As with other practices or professions, ideal mothering work is based on certain values such as a commitment to growth, humility, providing a holding place, and virtues such as self-control, resilient cheerfulness, empathy, realism, compassion, delight, and an ability to tolerate ambivalent feelings (Ruddick, 1989). These virtues give rise to certain cognitive capacities, which include the "scrutinizing gaze," reflective assessment of feelings, concrete thinking, and connected knowing which will be explicated below. During this process, a mother is constantly called upon to diagnose or make judgments as to the appropriateness of her behavior and that of her child within the social, psychological, and cultural context in which they exist. Thus, ideally, mothering requires continual changes in behavior in order to adapt to the child's changes. In that sense, as well as due to her own changes through the process of adult development, a mother's intellect and psychology is often in constant flux. Theoretically, then, and in an immediate and daily way, mothers live for and manage change guided by the goals of preservation, growth or nurturance, and training (Ruddick, 1989) which are, however, also mediated by the unique bond between a mother and her child.

In addition to managing change, mothers, ideally, must be humble about their work especially with regard to the goal of preservation. Mothers must realize that there are limits and unpredictability regarding their work in this area. A mother, like other helping professionals, must respect the limits of her will and that of the independent, uncontrollable, and increasingly separate existence she seeks to preserve. If a mother is successful, she will ensure the safety of someone whose will she cannot control. Mothers may be tempted to give up the patient work of control in this sphere and resort to domination or passivity (Ruddick, 1989).

In addition to managing change with humility, providing a "holding place" is fundamental to achieving the maternal work goal of protection. Holding involves the commitment to keep safe that which is vulnerable and valuable. This extends to the safe nature of the physical home, especially during

infancy and childhood, and to the social household or kinship (Ruddick, 1989). On an emotional level, Ruddick (1989) posits that the home comparable to a helping professional's office, should be a place where children can be safe from the harsh realities of the world. It is the headquarters where a mother organizes her children's growth. "Holding" is partially accomplished by a mother's "scrutinizing gaze," which gives just enough attention so as not to be intrusive. The degenerative form of this attitude is holding too closely or too timidly or too materialistically (Ruddick, 1989).

Ruddick's seminal work challenges social norms by wondering if "a mother's chattering creates discourse? Could what we thought and the way we thought be put to use?" (Ruddick, 1989, p.11). She references the possible transformative learning that is possible from mothering. "We think when we are disturbed, and the aim of our thinking is to recover our equilibrium" (Ruddick, 1989, p.31). She focuses on how "conflict" and trouble spur thought. She feels that to identify the disturbances of maternal work requires attending to unhappy moments of life making maternal thinking urgent, especially if there is difficulty with one's child.

One can understand the feminists' fervor about Ruddick's (1989) work. She gives value to the devalued, and perhaps even unvalued, and explicates that which was believed to be instinctual or taken for granted. Prior to her work, the conceptualization of the mothering experience had rarely been given even a "scrutinizing gaze" by popular culture.

Productive Work for Life

Hart (1992), building on Ruddick's work, focuses on the special epistemology of mothering that arises from its practice. This work initially piqued the researcher's interest in this topic. Hart posits, as does Ruddick (1989), that this "knowledge or thinking does not separate emotion from reason as does more industrial-patriarchal thinking" (Hart, 1992, p. 183). This epistemology is alive, contracts and expands, alternately adjusts to the contours of its objects, flows outward, assumes form of its own based

on internal dynamics and is separate from its original context but ready to meet a new context and new tasks (Hart, 1992).

The knowledge base of mothering has to do with the general patterns of biological, emotional, and cognitive maturation including the general stages and phases of development (Hart, 1992). Therefore, the "knowledge" of mothering is constantly created and re-created. "It provides a thinking that does not thrive on certainty and omnipotence designed to rule but endures ambiguity and provisionality with a relentless ongoing doubtfulness" (Hart, 1992, pp. 183-198). Ideally, the mother has more knowledge regarding the child's true needs and sees through pseudo-needs (Hart, 1992).

The mother, through caring, constructs knowledge from sources other than her own. And that knowledge is also peculiar to the person being cared for. Also, knowledge gained in the process of caring suggests an ethical relationship, which acknowledges the importance of recognizing and knowing other's needs. Thus, it ideally does not come from self-interest yet incorporates self-knowledge that is valued and necessary for the process. Mothering knowledge uses a model of the world that is oriented toward production, sustenance, and improvement of life (Hart, 1992 pp.183-188), which is comparable to Ruddick's (1989) preserving, growing, and training for life.

Hart discusses how this kind of knowledge does not lead to "general propositions because it is constantly affirmed or disaffirmed, created and recreated in accordance with the unique and constantly changing reality of the child" (Hart, 1992, p. 188). Hart summarizes:

> The epistemology that can be developed out of the experience of mothering is characterized by non-dichotomous relationships between the knower and the object of knowing, between the natural and the social, between critical judgment and empathetic intuition, between reason and emotion, and between the subjective and the objective. It does not reduce the particular or unique to a mere specimen which can be exchanged with any other by subsuming it under the general, but respects and acknowledges it. Because of this respectful, preserving attitude, I have called this way of knowing 'subsistence knowing.' Such subsistence knowing also stresses complexity and change rather than linearity and stasis, and it implies and structures non-dominating forms of interaction (Hart, 1992, p. 190).

Hart goes on to stress how the "knowing" from mothering is an adult educative process based on an alternative concept of work and thus should be regarded as a productive process or "productive work" (Hart, 1992, p. 191). Hart's work is considered an outstanding contribution to the literature on workplace learning (Tisdell, 1993). Yet, this researcher did not find another reference to Hart's work which underscores the possible resistance to her conceptualization which she admits is from the margin rather than mainstream thought (Hart, 1992).

As with other professions or practices then, mothering develops a characteristic way of thinking or a paradigm that enables her work. However, Ruddick (1989) points out that a special language does not exist which captures the ordinary/extraordinary pleasures and pains of maternal work. Seery's (1996) study on the emotion work of mothering is a seminal effort in this regard. This study is noted here rather in the applied research section because of its groundbreaking nature.

Mothering Emotion Work

Establishing the activities that mothers perform as a form of "work" includes Brenda Seery's (1996) dissertation, *Four Types of Mothering Emotion Work: Distress Management, Ego Work, Relationship Management, and Pleasure/Enjoyment Work (Domestic Work).* Seery (1996) points out that some of these forms of emotion work are performed, usually by women, in the market economy in a variety of occupations such as nannies, educators, nurses, waiters, sales clerks, and managers. Building on Hochschild's (1989) *The Managed Heart*, but omitting any reference to Hart's (1992) work, Seery focuses on the nature and types of emotion work that women perform as mothers which is taken for granted or remains invisible.

Seery's (1996) sample consists of 25 white, heterosexual, middle class women between 25 and 40 who had at least one child over the age of two. She used two data collection strategies, naturalistic family observations and open-ended interviews. Although theoretical sampling was utilized to make the

sample more representative of mothers who were employed full time, there was an overrepresentation of mothers who worked in daycare (Seery, 1996).

Triangulation occurred on three levels: collection of data, data analysis, and methods. Data were obtained over different times of day and during various communications. Two data analysts analyzed all data, first individually and then as a team. The study also used two methods: observations and interviews. The grounded theory approach to qualitative data analysis was used from which four interrelated and not mutually exclusive types of emotion work emerged, namely: distress management, relationship management, ego work, and pleasure/enjoyment work (Seery, 1996).

Distress management includes intentional attempts by the mother to alleviate, reduce, and/or prevent the child's emotional distress. The ultimate goals of this work are to make the child feel better or to prevent her from feeling bad. It is "tending to wounds"— either emotional and/or physical (Seery, 1996). Specific strategies include verbal comfort, changing situations that might cause distress such as teacher-child relationship, and also preventing distress through either "doing" or "not-doing" (p.77) strategies. Helping children make a prior adjustment to a new situation or not showing or expressing one's own negative feelings to children are examples (Seery, 1996).

Ego work includes intentional attempts to create, foster, and/or maintain a positive sense of self in children. It includes reducing feelings of negative self worth as well as helping the child feel that she is important, capable, and competent. Showing interest in daily activities of the child or not yelling, which might ruin her sense of self, are examples (Seery, 1996).

Relationship management involves intentional attempts to manage the emotional bonds and connections between children and other family members. It involves bringing family members closer together by reducing interpersonal tensions. It includes deliberate facilitation and maintenance of positive relationships between family members or peacekeeping strategies like mediation (Seery, 1996).

Pleasure/Enjoyment work also involves intentional efforts for providing others with pleasure and enjoyment. Examples are cooking a child's favorite food, playing games or reading favorite books. It also includes planning and orchestrating, special leisure events, family vacations, and birthday and holiday celebrations (Seery, 1996).

Seery (1996) reviews other types of mothering work which include: practical/maintenance work such as housework or the more physical aspects of child care, health/safety work such as child-proofing one's home as well as nutrition work. Skill work entails developing the child's various skills be they developmental, academic, athletic, or creative. Locating various classes and driving her to them are examples. Values/moral work includes teaching right from wrong, structuring children's lives to promote independence and responsibility, and disciplining for delinquent behavior. All forms of mother emotion work are socially constructed (Seery, 1996).

Seery (1996) concludes that the findings from her research underscore the importance of reconsidering the conventional dichotomous labels of "instrumental" and "expressive" within family studies as well as necessitating a reexamination of the definition of work, and especially to broadening conventional indices of family work to include emotion work as well as other forms of invisible work (Seery, 1996).

Invisible Work

Another seminal work which addresses both the nature of women's emotion work, the lack of language to describe it, and thus its invisibility and devaluation is Fletcher's (1999) *Disappearing Acts*. Admitting to the difficulty in naming the activities she was to study, Fletcher settled on the term "relational practice" to describe what is typically found in studies of the "private" sphere, the home, rather than the business world and her struggle as to whether that "work" then would be trivialized as a result (Fletcher, 1999).

Fletcher's work originated as a theoretical treatise to explore and challenge the masculine systemic bias in organizations from a feminist perspective (Fletcher, 1999). The goal was to give voice to those activities that typically disappear when masculine definitions of work are counted. She defines her work as "a postmodern qualitative study that uses nontraditional research methods and highly selected data to explore the social construction of gender in the workplace" (Fletcher, 1999, p.4).

Fletcher builds on the work of J.K. Miller (1989), *Toward a New Psychology for Women*, who developed the concept "growth in connection." According to Fletcher (1999) growth in connection refers to the process of separating and individuating oneself from others that, unlike the individuation process for men, occurs in a context of relational connection with and to other people. It thereby gives value to relational traits such as empathy, vulnerability, and connection that undergird the relational work that society typically depends on women to perform (Fletcher, 1999).

In addition to the relational psychological perspective of women's development, Fletcher's (1999) work draws on feminist post structuralism. This perspective emphasizes the relationship between knowledge, discourse, and power and challenges the commonly held definitions of work. The third perspective utilized in Fletcher's (1999) study emanates from the feminist reading of the sociology of work. That perspective discusses how definitions of work are gendered as they reflect the historical splitting of the public and private domains of life along gender lines (Fletcher, 1999).

Fletcher's (1999) study was an independent part of a larger action research project, which focused on issues of work, family, and gender equity at a major high-technology company in northeastern United States. Its stated goal was to explore alternative ways of working by observing people who did not fit the "ideal worker" stereotype identified in the organization's cultural diagnosis (Fletcher, 1999). Six female engineers, considered the non-dominant group as compared to the white male engineer, were intensely shadowed using structured observations in trying to gain a "subversive"

definition of work which stood outside the current definition of work in organizational discourse (Fletcher, 1999). A follow-up interview occurred after the shadowing which provided contextualized data about the intentions, beliefs, assumptions, and values that underlie the behavior which had been observed and is referred to as "sense-making." A grounded-theory type of qualitative data analysis followed. After categories were defined, an unstructured round table discussion with the female engineers occurred to get feedback regarding the categories. This process was also used as data (Fletcher, 1999). According to Fletcher (1999), when she compared this organization's cultural definition of work which was biased toward male thinking, which Fletcher considered to be abstract, rational, and linear, her data revealed the inconsistencies, contradictions, and unexamined dichotomies between the traditional definition of work and the feedback from the female engineers which Fletcher phrased "subversive stories told" (Fletcher, 1999, p.46).

Fletcher (1999) uses four major discrete categories to describe relational practice: (a) preserving the project through task accomplishment, (b) empowering others to enhance project effectiveness, (c) empowering self to achieve project goals, and (d) creating and sustaining group life in the service of project goals. In discussing her findings, Fletcher references Ruddick's (1989) work on *Maternal Thinking* and Marjorie DeVault's (1990) work on *Feeding the Family* in describing the process of balancing individual and communal concerns that characterized much of the female engineer's behavior and that was similar to the growth-fostering activities that mothers perform (Fletcher, 1999).

According to Fletcher (1999), Ruddick's (1989) discussion of the thinking, feeling, and reflecting that mothers do before they take action balances the importance of celebrating the uniqueness of the child while simultaneously molding that unique spirit so as to be socially acceptable. Likewise, DeVault (1990) describes how the mother attends to individual preferences of each family member in creating family meals as a social event. Seery (1996) refers to these similar activities of mother emotion

work as relationship management and pleasure/enjoyment work. These activities produce more intangible outcomes such as cooperation, trust, mutual respect, and affection and are embedded in people and social interactions and thus do not fit the public-sphere definition of work outcome (Fletcher, 1999).

This researcher's criticism of Fletcher's work includes her lack of reference to Hochschild's (1989) seminal work, *The Managed Heart*, which defines these more intangible outcomes within the workplace of the airline stewardess nor Hart's (1992) work, which also comes from a feminist perspective and is relevant in explicating the unvalued emotion work that women perform. Also, her use of an engineering firm represents an end point on a patriarchal continuum of work culture and makes her findings less generalizable. In addition, Fletcher does not refer to any of the research completed prior to her study regarding transformational leaders in learning organizations which also suggests a value in relational practices (Rolls, 1995; Senge, 1990).

The strength of Fletcher's work is the explication of the differences between public and private gendered definitions of work and an explanation of what kind of work is becoming more valued in the emerging organizational culture. Her study, however, underscores how the lag time between doing a study and publishing it may make the findings less seminal due to the increased speed of emerging knowledge.

Having addressed the conceptualization of mothering as a form of work, the following section is framed from the perspective of social role theory which studies the integration of the two social roles of mothering and "worker." This perspective, however, continues the two roles in "separate spheres."

Mothering as Informing Work

Enrichment/Spill Over of Two Roles

The study of work-family integration focuses on how the experiences in one role may serve as a resource that enriches life in the other role (Crouter, 1984; Friedman & Greenhaus, 2000; Parasuraman & Greenhaus, 1997). Applied studies regarding the enrichment/spill over effects of two roles include Stern's (1992) seminal study of a cohort of career women who are mothers. The central research question asks how these women perceived the interface between their parenting and careers. This was a qualitative study, which focused specifically on whether women perceived that they had learned skills and attitudes from their mothering experiences that carried over into their workplaces. The study identified the learning that occurred and how it benefited the careers of the women. Stern (1992) suggests that the learning paralleled those characteristics described in the literature as important for leaders in the then emerging business culture.

Stern (1992) collected data from 21 women through focus group interviews using the grounded-theory approach to generate hypotheses. The women had difficulty reflecting on their learning from mothering, as the larger society does not value these experiences. The findings supported the popular literature at that time regarding the fact that mothering is one of the most valuable management training programs available. Mothers are seen as better team players than men (Fierman, 1990). Childrearing teaches many skills such as listening, reacting to crises, negotiating, cajoling, coaching, cheerleading, decision making, and trying to bring out the best in others (Baron, 1987). Women's type of leadership comes from her experience in managing the home and nurturing husbands and children (Nelton, 1991). Many women see two roles, manager and mother, as mutually reinforcing (Nelton & Berney, 1987). Experience juggling business responsibilities often results from having juggled children's lives (Nelton. & Berney, 1987).

As experienced in my study, and recently studied by Coulter (2001), women have difficulty reflecting on the value of this aspect of their lives. This study agreed with Kolb's (1984) theory of experiential learning, which underscores the process of learning that occurs during direct encounter with the phenomenon rather than just thinking about the phenomenon. The experiential learning process is not focused on content or outcomes but is based on a "hands-on" experience. Stern's (1992) study demonstrated that Kolb's (1984) theory accounted for the learning that takes place through mothering as well as the transfer of that learning to work situations. Overall, these women felt that the mothering experience brought added value to their careers (Stern, 1992).

Stern's (1992) career women /mothers discussed learning in the area of skills, attitudes, and personal growth. Skills included problem solving, prioritizing, multi-tasking, negotiating, decision making, flexibility, and relational interactive and interpersonal skills. Attitudes gained were unselfishness, being nurturing, and having compassion, empathy, patience, tolerance, and understanding. Personal growth issues included having to make a "twenty-four hours a day, seven days a week commitment to children" which led to having a more "balanced life," "being more centered," "being less serious about life," "being more mellow" and "laid back," and "enjoying life more" (Stern, 1992, pp. 210-213).

This (then) new paradigm involves integrating life roles, flexibility, being able to deal with conflict, being multidimensional, able to prioritize, and capable of multi-tasking. Of special importance is that these women possessed the "transformational" style of leadership which is based more on interpersonal skills and personal relationships (Stern, 1992; Rolls, 1995).

One limitation of this study was the difficulty in distinguishing between what was attributed to being a woman versus learned from mothering as well as to what they gained through the natural process of adult development. However, the researcher felt that these women reflected on this dilemma

as part of their participation and felt clear about what their parenting had contributed to the development of additional work skills and attitudes (Stern, 1992). This study focused only on middle-class mothers who were functioning well and cannot be generalized to blue-collar mothers who may not be functioning well. Another limitation to this study was the use of the focus group approach without individual interviews, allowing for a possible group contagion effect (Stern, 1992).

Stern (1992) concluded that the learning from mothering paralleled the (then) new management paradigm and suggested that the corporate world should value the mothering experience. Completed almost ten years ago, her recommendations have gone unheard. This research was a second attempt in that direction.

This study differed from Stern's in that the data avoided group contagion by individuating the co-researchers through in-depth individual interviews, as well as triangulating the data through the use of a focus group to review the findings. No attempt was made to select only women who define themselves as successful in both roles. This research was also specific regarding a certain professional group, internal organizational development consultant/managers, as compared to Stern's use of the general category of "career" women. Having provided an opportunity to hear individual women's voices within this professional group was important as scholarly literature after 1995 appears lacking. In addition, this research takes place at a different historic period with regard to the gendering of adult life (Levinson, 1996). The observation that 67 % of mothers return to the workforce within a year after their child is born suggests that women weave the two roles together rather than juggle two separate lives (Youngblade, 1999).

Study of Mother/Work Role as a Seamless Dual Role

Coming from a more feminist rather than the organizational approach of Stern (1992) who conceptualizes mothering and work as two separate roles, Collins (1998) and Abbey (1995) both studied

the dual roles of mothers/teachers with the goal of hearing a "mother's voice" and assisting in making tacit knowledge tangible and accessible. Collin's (1998) study relied on the qualitative methods of biographical interpretation of women's personal narratives while collapsing the traditional dissociation between women's private and public lives. Focusing on the daily lives of eight white teacher/mothers located in Newfoundland and Labrador demonstrated the fluidity between the two roles wherein one set of experiences informed the other. However, Collins (1998) also stressed that the gendered division of labor is repeated within the school setting as well as at home whereby women are felt to be more suited to teaching because of their maternal roles. Since they felt that they carried more responsibility for family than their husbands did, these women chose teaching so that they could blend the two roles. Despite several personal attempts through telephone discussion with the author, I was not able to obtain a copy of the full study. What is presented in this article is a very thin rather than a rich description of these women's lives (Cline, 2001).

Abbey (1995) also uses the narrative inquiry approach to her phenomenological study of eleven white middle class women who were teacher/mothers in Ontario. Her goal was to examine the experiences of motherhood as it related to pedagogy and teaching practices of women and to analyze the tensions that arise when the two roles of mother and teacher are combined. Abbey argues that "maternal experience should be recognized and used to validate and enhance a holistic approach to education" (Abbey, 1995, p.499). As with Stern's (1992) study, Abbey (1995) found that teacher/mothers, as a result of maternal pedagogy, developed a tolerance for ambiguity, became more skilled at multi-tasking; were more flexible, adaptable, sensitive, observant, resourceful, creative and patient; less controlling; and more often used negotiation to solve conflict. They stressed the affective domain ahead of the intellectual, placed people ahead of administrative processes, and were more child-centered in their approach to students (Abbey, 1995).

As in Stern's (1992) study, however, these women devalued their own stories and saw few connections, if any, between their motherhood and their teaching. This led the researcher to develop a protocol of various themes upon which the respondents might reflect prior to the interview (see Appendix D). She also noted that these women lacked the language to put embodied experiences, for example, the birthing process, into words. As well, they found it easier to discuss their work accomplishments rather than those that came from mothering (Abbey, 1995).

How these women dealt with both roles also pointed to the need for a more flexible rather than linear career path as some quit the work world or worked part-time while actively mothering especially young children. Abbey (1995) recommended that mothers should neither be penalized when interrupting their teaching time to have children nor viewed as lacking in commitment or ambition. Abbey (1995) stresses the need for more study to erase the boundaries between work and home, which is a common theme of "feminist/career/mothering" literature (Collins, 1998; MacDonald, 1996; Rossiter, 1988) and including this study, while at the same time, giving women an improved sense of their roles as mothers and empowering them to believe that their lived world is changeable.

Abbey (1995) concluded that maternal traits are not exclusive to mothering and that they can be learned. She wondered how these traits can be encouraged in males, as these traits are more suited to the current social as well as business condition emphasized by diversification, global partnerships, interdependence, chaos, and ambiguity. Her conclusions focused on how to humanize schools in order to cater to women's dual roles.

Another study dealing with a dual role is that by MacDonald (1996) of mothers who are nurses. Mac Donald (1996) studied nine mothers who were nurses using the grounded theory approach (Strauss & Corbin, 1998) which triangulated the collection of data through the use of an in-home personal interview, two focus groups, and a telephone follow-up interview. A third focus group session was held

two years later to discuss preliminary findings. This study focused on how nurses avoided burnout while caring for their family and patients. This study concluded that the positive energy obtained in one's career provided energy for the mothering role (MacDonald, 1996). This finding was similar to the spill over studies of personality enrichment that can be gained from a work role and used to assist functioning in a parenting role (Crouter, 1984; Friedman & Greenhaus, 2000; Greenhaus & Parasuraman, 2001).

Theoretical Constructs of Adult Learning and Adult Development – Links Mothering with Professional Practice

Adult Development

Adult learning and adult development are two interrelated constructs that link the experience of mothering with professional functioning. Adulthood is a season in the life cycle emerging after childhood and before senescence (Levinson, 1996). According to Levinson (1996), women and men go through a similar process and timing in life structure development. He found, however, that women form different life structures from those of men and work on the developmental tasks of every period with different external and internal resources and constraints (Levinson, 1996). He also points out that society is in a period of transition with respect to the gendering of life, meaning the traditional division of life into the domestic sphere for women, which includes mothering, and the occupational world for men. He views these traditional patterns as eroding without any clear new emerging patterns (Levinson, 1996). This research is an attempt to further understand the blurring between the separation of the private and public domains for women as well as perhaps providing more clarity on the resulting new emerging patterns.

Adult life structure is defined as the underlying pattern or design of a person's life at a given time (Levinson, 1996). According to Levinson (1996), the life structure common to both sexes evolves through a sequence of alternating periods that last from five to seven years followed by a transitional period in which the existing structure is terminated and movement occurs toward a new structure that

will fully emerge in the next structure building period. His study focuses on early adulthood, ages 17-22, through the mid-life transition, which occurs between ages 40-45.

Mothering and Adult Development

Levinson (1996) discusses the psychosocial differences in the timing and definition of mothering in the lives of homemakers versus career women in his study. Full time homemakers ultimately were not able to find ongoing satisfaction in the relegation of their functioning to the domestic sphere while their husband's lives were more defined as within the public sphere. This differentiation added to the void within the marital relationship as husband and wife were traveling on parallel tracks. The work that these women attempted during childrearing was usually not of a career nature but just a "job" that provided "pin" money as compared to the "breadwinner's" role of their husbands (Levinson, 1996 p. 126).

On the other hand, those women who remained connected to their professional career experienced the positive spillover to their parenting role. For a time, these women were trying to "do it all" including the "second shift" (Hochschild, 1989) which presented conflict within themselves and between them and their husbands who were expected to assume more of the "domestic" duties. Levinson (1996) also briefly references the learning from children's developmental stages that was reported by career women/mothers (Abbey, 1995; Stern, 1992). There was a sense of loss and liberation as their children reached adulthood at which time the mothers tried to renegotiate their relationship with their children from being parent/child to an adult friendship (Levinson, 1996).

Levinson (1996) discusses the current transformation in meaning of gender and the place of women and men in society. He purports that there are three social changes that are reducing women's involvement at home while increasing their involvement in work. First, an increase in human longevity has necessitated a larger labor force to support the increase of the elderly in the population. Second, the

demand for women's work in the family is decreasing as birth control has limited births and most women have had their last child by their early 30's. Third, the increased incidence of divorce forces women to be prepared to support themselves and their children.

Levinson (1996) deems career women as pathfinders in the journey toward androgyny for women and men. Hearing the voices of career women that are also mothers and learning more about their life structure is a goal of this research. In addition, since 70% of working women are found in the female occupations of teaching, nursing, and social work, this research will also provide a closer look at an occupation that is less engendered: the internal organizational development consultant/manager.

Learning and Adult Development

Boucouvalas and Krupp (1989) present an adult developmental perspective on adult learning. Mothering can be viewed as a facet of adult development which occurs within a relationship and thus sets a context for learning that is impacted, however, by individual differences, psychosocial, socio-cultural, socia-political, and historical influences (Boucouvalas & Krupp, 1989).

Two seminal works, which focus on how adult learning is related to adult development in women, and therefore in mothers, but is different from that which takes place in men include the work of Gilligan (1982) and Belenky et al. (1986). Prior to these works, the major theories about human development were constructed by men about men and overvalued the attributes of men in the areas of autonomy, independence, abstract critical thought, and moral development (Kolberg, 1981; Levinson, 1978; Perry, 1968). Thus, the traits of interdependence, intimacy, nurturance, and contextual thought in deciding moral action were undervalued and instead were framed as deficit states in women rather than as being different and of equal value (Belenky et al., 1986). Thus, women's roles, such as mothering were also devalued.

The models of intellectual development valued the abstract and impersonal as mental processes, which purportedly are more common to men, and thus labeled as "thinking," whereas, the mental processes that are more personal and interpersonal were labeled as "emotion" and relegated to women (Belenky et al., 1986). Thus, Ruddick's (1989) volume, *Maternal Thinking*, is so seminal and has been built upon by many researchers who have written about mothering (Fletcher, 1995, 1999; Hart, 1992; Held, 1993; Stern, 1992; Swigart, 1998; Thurer, 1994). Since Ruddick's (1989) work, feminists have focused more on the description of subjectivity in thinking (Abbey, 1998) and the ethics of care as a model for moral development (Gilligan, 1982; Hart, 1992; Held, 1993).

Mothers come to know what they know and become who they are as a result of mothering through a multitude of learning processes, which include tacit learning, experiential learning, transformational learning, transpersonal learning, and embodied knowing.

Tacit Learning

Women's construction of meaning from their mothering experience leads to tacit learning that becomes tacit knowledge (Boucouvalas & Krupp, 1989; Durrance, 1998; Fenwick, 1994; Polanyi, 1967; Rossiter, 1988; Sternberg & Caruso, 1985) posits that much of what is known is obtained tacitly or unconsciously without awareness through socialization, experience, and practice. Inasmuch as tacit knowledge is gained through "doing" and is largely unconscious highlights the importance of the seminal work of Ruddick (1989) and Hart (1992) who explicated a mothering epistemology and Seery's (1996) study of mothering emotion work.

According to Boucouvalas and Krupp (1989), the process of tacit learning is "unspoken and unthought" (p. 193); therefore, how tacit knowledge is acquired cannot be ascertained. Polanyi (1967) posits that tacit learning relies on "intuition which stimulates the imagination in pursuit of a solution" (p. 343) Here one is reminded of Ruddick's (1989) "mother's troubled thinking" which leads to forms of

Seery's (1996) mother's emotion work through which a mother will learn specific knowledge regarding her specific child and her specific problem utilizing the process described in more detail by Hart's (1992) epistemology. It also gives importance to the hearing of "mother's voices" which is often one of the goals of the more recent research on mothering (Abbey, 1995; Collins, 1998; MacDonald, 1996; Rossiter, 1988), including this study.

According to Durrance (1998), new knowledge is created when tacit knowledge is converted into explicit knowledge. That process has been described as a spiral wherein explicit knowledge can become tacit within an individual, but then, as she reflects on the experience, the tacit knowledge is translated and creates new knowledge that is either tacit or explicit for others to share as in the examples of the work of Abby (1995), Barlow (1993), Brown, et al. (1994), Collins (1998), Comart (1983), Conran (1999), Garvy (1999), Goldman (1996), Hart (1992), Kitchen (1996), Maushart (1999), Rossiter (1988), Ruddick (1989), Seery (1996), and Stern (1992), as well as this study.

Experiential Learning

Sara Ruddick's (1989) seminal work, *Maternal Thinking*, although not based on experiential learning theory per se, nonetheless, refers to the thinking and critical reflection that emanates from a maternal practice and which has been described in more detail previously.

David Kolb's (1984) seminal work on experiential learning posits that human beings are the only living organisms that identify with the process of adaptation, which he calls the process of learning. As "the learning species" (Kolb, 1984, p.1), our survival depends on our ability to react to and fit into the physical and social world which we also create. In the attempt to embrace the rational, scientific, and technological, we have lost touch with our own experience as a process, which provides personal learning and development. Coulter (2001), Crittenden (2001), and Hart (1992), note the ongoing resistance to the valuing of the mothering experience.

Kolb (1984) discusses how people do learn from their experience and that the learning can be reliably assessed. Experiential learning programs have increased within the organizational training field and higher education as well as being the method of choice for the learning and personal development of nontraditional students (Coulter, 2001). Kolb (1984) posits that experiential learning represents "learning as a lifelong process that is soundly based in intellectual traditions of social psychology, philosophy, and cognitive psychology" (pp. 3-4).

According to Kolb (1984), unlike more traditional educational methods, experiential learning theory emphasizes the central role of experience rather than the acquisitions, manipulation, and recall of abstract symbols. It provides a "holistic integrative perspective on learning that combines experience, perception, cognition, and behavior" (Kolb, 1984, p. 21). Experiential learning involves the direct involvement with the phenomenon being studied rather than only thinking about the involvement or considering the possibility of doing something with it (Kolb, 1984).

David Kolb's (1984) model of experiential learning emerges from the previous work on experiential learning of Lewin (1951), Dewey (1963), and Piaget (1970). His model suggests that learning is a tension-and conflict-filled process. In learning from this process, learners must be able to do the following:

1) Involve themselves fully and without bias in the experience

2) Reflect on and observe their experiences from several perspectives

3) Create concepts that integrate their observations into logically sound theories

4) Use these theories in making decisions and solving problems.

Kolb (1984) posits that "learning is a process whereby knowledge is created through the transformation of experience" (p. 38). The nature of this learning focuses on the process rather than the content or outcomes, unlike other forms of learning which aims to modify ideas and/or behaviors.

According to Kolb (1984) learners are not blank minds. They come to each new situation with a set of beliefs and ideas about it which are continually being disposed of and modified. In that learning is continuous, then, all learning is really re-learning.

Learning is an interactional process between the person and the environment (Kolb, 1984). As a holistic adaptive process, it becomes a conceptual bridge across life situations including home, school, work, and social situations as well as occurring over a lifetime. When viewed as a process, by which knowledge is created, it occurs at all levels of social sophistication and any social situation. Experiential learning then becomes the medium through which human beings are rendered more capable of developing and interacting with their environment.

Experiential learning theory (Kolb, 1984) claims that lifelong learning occurs through the involvement and interaction of individuals with their environment. As we study the mothers who are also internal organizational development consultant/managers, we focus on the weaving of work roles and home roles and how these women carry with them the knowledge and expertise learned and accumulated in their homes to their functioning in the workplace.

Watson (2001) discusses the managerial learning process and the importance of knowledge derived from "learning about life" and "learning about self." He posits that the roots of management learning can be found in the individual's family experiences, as well as other adult learning experiences such as school, leisure activities and pre-managerial occupational involvement. These adult learning experiences offer knowledge regarding the process of individual and organizational emergence where learning is a central component. He references one mother in his sample that believed that her mothering experience was central to her development as a manager.

Metchild Hart (1992) in her volume, *Working and Educating for Life,* addresses the devaluation or dismissal of experience-based knowledge such as mothering. She decries the overvaluation of

technology and calls for a reunification of work and life. She criticizes the relegating of raising children to the private sphere when "raising of the next generation should be considered productive labor which is central to social survival and which should be cherished, supported, and protected" (Hart, 1992, p. 205). She calls for changes in the structure of the workplace such as flex-time and part-time work as well as a re-construction of the term "career" and "success" so that raising children can be socially acknowledged and become fully integrated into a person's entire productive life (Hart, 1992, p. 205).

Hart (1992) builds on experiential learning theory, as discussed above, to explicate what she defines as the epistemology of mothering, some of which has been previously described. A mother's knowledge is based on the particular individuality of her child, must be in constant expansion, revision, and at times rejection of general knowledge. She must be able to think in concrete as well as abstract ways about the uniqueness of her child as well as his/her commonalties with other children.

This knowledge requires an "existential dwelling in the object" (Hart, 1992, p.193.) referred to in discussions on tacit knowledge as well as assuming a process of interaction and active involvement in the child's life often referred to as "caring." While raising a child to be socially acceptable, a mother must monitor (critical reflection) herself as well as her child if she does not want to discourage the child's individuation while at the same time retaining her authority which she has also had to be gradually relinquishing. Hart (1992) likened this process, the intricate blend of power over the material and submission to its intrinsic characteristics and possibilities, to the work of the artisan.

Hart (1992) describes an education for life that emanates from the work of mothering, which in its description would provide mothers with a special knowledge that could be utilized in educating or managing employees as well. This knowing would be empathic, attentive, drawing conclusions, and making judgments based on understanding. A mother's "empathic understanding and judgment are so intricately intertwined, we can speak of a form of rational love which neither signifies symbiotic

merging nor indiscriminate acceptance and requires ongoing self-reflection and the creative use of diversity and difference" (Hart, 1992, p. 194).

Productive education, involving the creating and recreating of knowledge likened to the epistemology of mothering, may be considered important for learning organizations if they differentiate employees' developmental phases as suggested by Morris (1995). Hart (1992) challenges the field of adult education to become an education for life and in doing so must reestablish the original connection between human production or work and the improvement and preservation of life and to incorporate this new view into their theories and practices. She underscores the need for the field to help learners reflect upon and understand their individual experience as well as allowing a "learning rhythm" that alternates between short-term learning processes that are focused on information, technical skills and abilities and more long-term learning processes that focuses on the transformation of the sense of self and meaning perspective (Hart, 1992), both of which are addressed in this research. Might career development for women include the mothering experience as an important phase of employee development rather than being viewed as time lost from attaining career goals?

Mothering as Transformation

The learning that occurs through mothering and that is more transformational in nature includes transformational learning, transpersonal learning, and embodied knowing. An important learning theory that built a bridge between mothering and occupational functioning is that of Meizerow's (1981, 1991) transformational learning. The conception, birth, and care of a first child, even if positively anticipated, could be described by new mothers as Meizerow's (1981,1991) disorienting dilemma. Some scholars have discussed the negative issues of mothering including: depression (Brown et al, 1994; Rich, 1976) being overworked (Hochschild, 1989, 1997), psychological conflict (Bolton, 2000; Comart, 1983; Thurer, 1994), the need for positive social masks that disguises the chaos and complexity of the lived

experience (Maushart, 1999), social conflict (Apple, 1997; Bernard, 1974; Hart, 1992) and devaluation of the role (Crittendon, 2001).

According to Mezirow (1981; 1991), there is a perspective transformation process that is essential to transformative change at the individual level. His central premise is that critical self-reflection and rational discourse are necessary for the process. He suggests that perspective transformation is a linear, ten-step, rational process with emotional components, which begins by a disorienting dilemma.

Taylor (1997), however, after analyzing thirty-nine empirical studies on Mezirow's (1981,1991) theory of transformative learning, posited that transformational learning is not exclusively a rational, conscious process and incorporates a variety of nonrational and unconscious modalities for revising or constructing new meaning (Taylor, 1997). Several authors describe the change in self-definition that results from the mothering experience (Barlow, 1993; Comart, 1983; Coulter, 2001; Stern, 1995; Stern, 1992).

Stern's (1995) volume, *The Motherhood Constellation: A Unified View of Parent-Infant Psychotherapy*, discusses pregnancy, birth and delivery and the transformational process involved. Stern (1995) contends that there is a psychic reorganization for biological mothers which may last only a few months or a life-time. His work focuses on the conceptualization of the psychological process of mothering a first child over the first three years of life. The "motherhood constellation" concept served the purpose of defining and mapping the nature of a new, previously unknown and little described clinical domain of parent-infant therapies and aided in the psychotherapy of bonding dysfunctions between the infant and its mother. Stern notes that during early development an infant and its mother are involved "in a process of the greatest and fastest human change process known" (Stern, 1995, p.3). The main function of this early development is to effect change through maturation, development, and

growth. Much of this exclusive relationship is non-verbal and largely pre-symbolic (Stern, 1995), which may explain why women often lack the language to describe this earliest experience of the mothering process.

In a sense, Stern (1995) is studying the "meaning making" of this experience with a focus on the mental schema of "being with" that is evoked in the mother. He posits that mothers have a unique form of organized mental life which predisposes mothers to think, feel, and act in certain ways, similar to Ruddick's (1989) maternal thinking previously described. From a phenomenological perspective, parents have a representational world that impacts the process of the parent's relationships with the baby. Thus, in addition to the more real objectifiable external world, the parent's behavior is also impacted by an imaginary, subjective, largely unconscious world that contains the imagined baby and the imagined self-as-mother. This representational world also includes the parent's experience of the current interactions as well as the parent's fantasies, hopes, fears, dreams, and memories of her own childhood, models of parenting and prophecies for the infant's future. The mother's interests and concerns becomes narrowed more on the growth and development of the infant and less on career and a new psychic triangulation appears between the mother, baby and the maternal grandmother.

There are four main themes and related tasks that emerge during this time. The mother is obsessed with her more biological role to keep this baby alive and thriving as well as her emotional role in relating to the infant, the need for a supporting matrix for this process and her identity reorganization to support the process (Stern, 1995). Stern (1995, pp. 174-175) posits:

> …this organization may also structure aspects of her psychic life far beyond the phase in which it prevails. This psychic re-organization is 'permanent, transient, or frequently permanently evocable.' However this process may have some hormonal influence, is not universal nor innate but more a function of the current western developed post-industrial culture which has certain expectations of the mother-infant bond.

According to Stern, the current cultural conditions that play a major role include: (a) the great value placed by society on the baby's optimal development, (b) the baby is wanted, (c) the culture values the maternal role and the mother is evaluated as a person by her participation and success in the mothering role, (d) the mother has the ultimate responsibility for the care of the child, (e) the mother will love the baby, (f) society expects that the father and supporting context will aid the mother in the fulfillment of the mothering role, and (g) that the family, society, and culture do not provide the new mother with experience, training, or adequate support for her to execute her role alone, easily or well (Stern, 1995). Needless to say, our current cultural and organizational paradigm does not provide the support for all these expectations. Likewise, Stern (1995) cannot predict how the "new family" and "new father" as constructions presently unfolding in the new millennium will impact this process.

Coulter (2001) also discusses the hidden transformation of women through mothering. She points to the need for research to provide a legitimizing of how and by whom knowledge from mothering is acquired. In attempting to give academic credit for mothering, Coulter (2001) notes the academic resistance to award academic knowledge for "women's work."

Empire State College, in 1999, listed twenty thousand titles describing learning acquired from experience. Six thousand were from "independent" learning opportunities as contrasted to opportunities acquired in a professional setting. Of those six thousand titles, only sixty could be regarded as arising from "women's work" and only two used the words "mothering" or "maternal." These figures do not belie the fact that at least 60% of the students were women with children.

She argues that tacit knowledge (Polanyi, 1967) can be gained without an ability to articulate or be conscious of the learning as well as the growing appreciation of the importance of the physical body in knowing. She decries academia's denigration of inarticulate or subjective knowledge that is gained through the experience of pregnancy, labor, and nursing, which is in addition to the knowledge of child

development. She recounts the immense resistance of students to valuing the effect of mothering on their lives and life-views. Based on videotaping of students in the process of exploring what a student might know that is worthy of college credit, they often referred to how mothering "transformed" their perspective thus contradicting the pre-conception about the non-creditable nature of women's knowledge from mothering. Coulter (2001) turns to the Ruddick's (1989) writing as a possible solution to begin looking at a discipline of thought while inviting small groups of women students to articulate, reflect upon, and frame these changes.

Barlow (1993) also discusses mothering as an interactive, self-directed, growth-producing experience. Her focus is the social psychological process, referred to as "expanding the boundaries" (Barlow, 1993, p.74) that women experience as they move from childlessness through the first twelve years of mothering. Using a grounded theory approach and unstructured interviews, eleven mothers who had one or more children under twelve focused on the developmental changes women experience. The theory that emerged was embedded in two linear time dimensions of the engagement stage, which coincides with the first year of mothering, and the immersion stage which represents the ongoing mothering experience. These mothers developed a distinctive mothering epistemology, which resembled the "constructed knower" as identified by Belenky et al. (1986, p. 137). These women integrated reason and feeling into a personally constructed framework guided by inner wisdom rather than external advice and direction. Barlow's (1993) research is important as it also extends knowledge about mothering beyond the first year of the child's life. My research attempted to explicate this mothering epistemology as it informs and how it informs the professional role of the internal organizational development consultant/manager.

Limitations to Barlow's (1993) study included the lack of triangulation of the data to other sources such as journals or significant others, the lack of including mothers that did not experience

changes, the lack of lower socioeconomic class mothers, and similar population age of 35 (Barlow, 1993) Unlike Barlow's population, my co-researchers will be older mothers with adult children. Also, my study will triangulate individual interview data with a focus group of co-researchers to review the findings.

Comart (1983) studied the integrating of maternal and professional identities for first time mothers who returned to professional employment outside the home by six months after their child's birth. She was especially concerned about the conflict that women experience in trying to integrate the two roles. At that time no one had systematically investigated this issue.

This was a descriptive study using three intensive semi-structured interviews with seven professional women after the birth of their first child between three and nine months prior to the investigation. Data were analyzed using the "exploratory clinical method" through descriptive, qualitative content analysis that resembled a grounded theory approach. Similar to Barlow (1995), Comart (1983) discusses the profound impact that motherhood has on the self-concept of the professional woman. Comart (1983) also refers to stages of this developmental progression. The first stage, immersion, is similar to Barlow's engagement phase wherein the mother is immersed in childcare. The second stage is more focused outside themselves comparing themselves to others including their own mother's functioning. The third stage was fraught with conflict as they prepared to return to work. The fourth stage was characterized by their return to work but they were less aggressive, politically active, and competitive within their field than they had been previously. They also described, however, a greater sense of internal strength and courage at work, knowing they had survived the process of birth and new motherhood.

Limitations of the study included the small sample size, the liberal section of the country where the women resided, interviewing during a transition period which does not allow for generalizations

regarding combining career and motherhood over the long haul, as well as personal bias of the investigator whose clinical skills were used to deal with the responses to open-ended questions and uncovering the unconscious nature of some of the material which was being considered (Comart, 1983). My research studied the more longitudinal mothering/professional role experience and used the grounded theory method of data analysis.

Transpersonal Learning

Another learning process that may account for the transfer of knowledge from the mothering experience to the professional role includes transpersonal learning. The initial conception of a separate life that enters the world through the process of pregnancy, birth and delivery is usually described of as a "peak life experience" by both mothers and fathers (Maslow, 1970; Merriam & Caffarella, 1991). According to Maslow (1970), "peak experiences" result in an awareness that one's being is changed, as seeing things differently, living in a different world.

According to Boucouvalas (1983) transpersonal learning is rooted in the field of transpersonal psychology and is described as the fourth force of psychology that extends and has the potential to unify the three forces of psychoanalytic, behavioral, and humanistic psychology. The result of the integrative function of transpersonal psychology leads to a synergistic visionary mode of seeing the world. Boucouvalas (1983) posits that "a transpersonal perspective offers an image of human kind and worldview that respects and celebrates autonomy, individuality and cultural differences while at the same time leads us beyond to the commonalities and potential global identity that all humanity shares" (Boucouvalas, 1983, p. 25). Others have described transpersonal psychology as "concerned with the study of humanity's highest potential, and with the recognition, understanding, and realization of unitive, spiritual, and transcendent states of consciousness" (Lajoie & Shapiro, 1992, p. 91). According

to Boucouvalas (1981, 1999, 2000), the central themes of transpersonal adult development are the complementary dimensions of the connected self and the independent self.

Mothering with Soul: Raising Children As Special Work by Joan Salter (1998) may be viewed as promoting a transpersonal framework for mothering. Considered revolutionary in 1998, it is intended to give value to the mothering experience by illuminating the spiritual roots of motherhood. This volume emerged from the author's conversations with hundreds of young women (Salter, 1998). Salter views mothering as a spiritual activity which nourishes the feeling life of the soul. "It demands a kind of thinking imbued with creative imagination and is a feeling life capable of sacrificial love. It is a total soul involvement that connects both mother and child with profound realities of spirit" (Salter, 1998, p. viii).

The above volume incorporates both the individual and group levels of the transpersonal field (Boucouvalas, 2000). On an individual level, Salter's (1998) work is concerned with understanding and nurturing the stages of transpersonal development and transpersonal awareness leading the mother to the development of an inner experiential knowing (Boucouvalas, 2000). Salter gives examples of transpersonal "inner voices" or "visions" that occurred before or during the birthing process. Salter believes that pregnancy and birthing are "unique experiences which makes it possible for women to reach a greatly heightened consciousness, a state of fulfillment not usually attainable in other ways" (Salter, 1998, p. 11). On a group level, her volume illuminates how relationships are pathways to transpersonal development via, in this case, the family (Boucouvalas, 2000).

Embodied Knowing

Coulter (2001), in her discussion of the transformation of women through mothering, focuses on the notion of the importance of the physical body in knowing, referred to as embodied knowledge (Lakoff & Johnson, 1999; Verala et al., 1997). Her work is reinforced by that of Stern's (1995)

motherhood constellation previously discussed. Inasmuch as the process of pregnancy and giving birth as well as the physical care of young children are very physical processes, embodied knowing is an important source of knowledge for mothers.

Lakoff and Johnson (1999) in their volume, *Philosophy in the flesh: The embodied mind and its challenge to Western Thought* credit John Dewey and Merleau-Pontyas as originally responsible for emphasizing the primordial embodied experience in philosophical thought. They valued the body experience as the primal basis for all we mean, think, know, and communicate (Lakoff & Johnson, 1999). The emerging paradigm in philosophical thought, the embodied mind posits that the mind is connected to the body rather than viewed as separate from it. This model is similar in nature to the emerging mindset within current organizational culture (Anderson & Anderson, 2001a; Anderson & Anderson, 2001b; Bolman, 1991; Pedler, Burgoyne & Boydell; Senge, 1990; Senge et al., 1999; Weisbord, 1987) which views reality as a living system wherein everything is in relationship, connected, and interdependent. Wholeness is considered the essential nature of reality; bridges and connections are more prevalent and important than boundaries (Anderson & Anderson, 2001b).

Lakoff and Johnson (1999) refer to cognitive science as one of the most profound resources for self-knowledge. In basing philosophy on empirical findings of cognitive science they posit that improved self-understanding is possible. They compare the traditional western conception of the person, which results in one with disembodied reason, with conception of an embodied person.

This study attempted to explicate the embodied knowledge that mothers gain from their mothering experience and how it informed the professional role. However, this was difficult, as there is no language that describes this mostly unconscious process. Probing during the discussion of the co-researchers' pregnancy, birth and delivery process and infant care were important as were their responses to probes that might suggest what they learned or how they changed from that experience.

Organizations as the Context of the Experience

Organizational Behavior—The Learning Organization

The emerging organizational culture of the current millennium, often referred to as a learning organization (Chawla & Renesch, 1995; Pedler, Burgoyne, & Boydell, 1998; Senge, 1990; Senge et al., 1999) seeks to develop its members. Morris (1995), in *Development Strategies for the Knowledge Era,* describes how organizations serve as a crucible for individual and organizational development. Like the mother who provides a holding place for her child, Morris underscores the need for organizations to be committed to ongoing individual development. Her metaphors for various employee developmental stages appear like those of a child who is first static, then rolls, then, crawls. She posits that no one specific people-development approach or strategy will fit all organizations but is based on organizational purpose and context.

The learning organization is defined as consciously and intentionally developing its members and transforming itself. Morris (1995) suggests that in knowledge intensive industries, the rate of individual and organizational learning may be the only sustainable competitive advantage. Intellectual capital is the source of wealth. These organizations will provide service no matter where or when. Consultants are constantly challenged to work beyond experience on issues and problems never before encountered. She suggests that the developmental strategies of the individual and organization be tied to adult developmental strategies (Morris, 1995). Thus, the goals of the learning organization parallel those of mothering, to preserve, grow, and train its employees.

Jamie Rolls (1995) who discusses the current expectation of employees to find "nourishment for life" from their work reinforces Morris' (1995) view. That is, they want to enjoy their work, to feel they are making a contribution not only to the success of the organization, but to society as well as in terms of a cultural change. In addition, they want to be respected and able to learn and grow (Rolls, 1995). She

posits that the organizations that will excel in the future will be those that know how to transform--by understanding how to obtain the commitment of employees at all levels while expanding their capacity to learn. Through learning, people will re-perceive their world and their relationship to it while discovering how they create their reality and future (Rolls, 1995).

Leadership and Characteristics of the Learning Company

Given then that learning organizations transform employees as well as the organization, what are the characteristics of this learning company. Of much importance, is the nature of the leader of the learning company referred to as the "transformational leader" (Rolls 1995). Such a leader is often relationship-driven and thus concerned with creating a work intimacy that frees the human spirit to unfold, transform, grow, and flourish in uncertainty (Rolls, 1995). This ability is based on the assumptions that all employees are sources of new ideas, learning flows up as well as down, new ideas are valuable, and mistakes are an opportunity to learn (Rolls, 1995).

Rolls (1995) presents a grid of the leadership competencies and followership expectations within the structure of the five disciplines which include systems thinking, personal mastery, mental models, shared vision, and team learning based on the previous seminal work of Peter Senge's (1990) *The Fifth Discipline: The Art and Practice of the Learning Company* (See Table 1).

Table 1.The Work of the Transformational Leader: A Model of Leadership Competencies and Followership Expectations

The Five Disciplines	Leadership Competencies	Followership Expectations
Systems Thinking	expansionist thinking	understanding the whole
	understanding of connectivity	
	intuition	
	perspective	
	integration	
Personal Mastery	compassion	encouragement
	self and other acceptance	acceptance
	shared power	empowerment
	authenticity	trust
	nurturance of spirit	self discovery
	moral leadership	someone worth working for
	sensitivity	dignity
	humility	autonomy
	mastery	fulfilled potential
	growth oriented	growth
	risk taking	supported choice
	self directed	independence
	tolerance	space to make mistakes
	value ambiguity	support in transition
	learning commitment	learning
	trust	responsibility
	spirituality	self/other connection
	ego subordination	ownership of results
Mental Models	insight	innovation
	introspection	meaning
	challenge assumptions	challenge assumptions
	innovation	
Shared Vision	principles	sense of purpose
	personal/co. values alignment	personal/co. values alignment
	inspiration	motivation
	goals	clarity
	vision	co-develop vision
	vitality	engagement
	mobilize commitment	commitment
Team Learning	cooperation	co-design
	dialogue	self expression
	listening	contribution
	creativity	creativity
	promote harmony	social unity
	encourage relationship	relationship

From The transformational leader: The wellspring of the learning organization. In S.C.J. Renesch (Ed.), *Learning Organizations: Developing cultures for tomorrow's workplace.* Rolls, J. (1995). (p. 104). Portland, OR: Productivity Press. (with permission)

Her leadership competencies include many of the virtues and metaphysical attitudes of Ruddick (1989) such as humility, compassion, self-control, personal mastery, and moral leadership. The mothering emotion work of Seery (1996) is represented by the skills of promoting harmony and encouraging relationships. The notions of compromise, shared power, nurturing spirit, ego subordination, and an orientation to growth suggests Hart's (1992) mothering epistemology.

Senge, Kleiner, Roberts, Ross, Roth, and Smith (1999) discuss the dance of change, which is necessary to sustain the momentum of profound change in learning organizations. Leaders of these organizations are facing ventures of exploration, risk, discovery, and change, without guiding maps (Senge, et al., 1999). Using the metaphor of a biologist and growth in the natural world as a lens, this volume explores the growth and premature death of organizational change initiatives (Senge, et al., 1999). The focus is on understanding the nature of growth processes and how to catalyze them as well as to understand the forces and challenges that impede progress and to develop workable strategies to deal with them. The overall process is termed "the dance of change," which is similar to Harriet Lerner's series of books on the *Dance of Anger* (1985), *The Mother Dance* (1998), and *The Dance of Intimacy* (1989) which discuss how the human process of development evolves with a back and forth rhythm which contains the inevitable interplay between growth processes and limiting processes (Senge et al., 1999). The ultimate change as discussed in the Senge et al. (1999) volume is that of "profound change" wherein a capacity for change is built within the organization so that learning can occur. It combines inner shifts in people's values, aspirations, and behaviors with outer shifts in processes, strategies, practices, and systems.

Leadership in this volume does not refer to top management, but is the capacity of a human community to shape its future and sustain processes of change (Senge, et al., 1999). Thus, there are several layers of leaders within organizations such as first line managers, internal networkers or

community builders (Senge, et al., 1999) whose activities are similar to Fletcher's (1999) description of the more informal social networking activity, as well as executive leaders such as CEO's (Senge, et al, 1999).

This volume does not describe the characteristics of leaders but instead focuses on the activities that the three types of leaders perform and the necessary interrelationship of all three for change to be sustained. These authors believe that development for leadership takes place in daily living around a person's aspirations, challenges and responses, which of course, includes the ideal mothering experience. The focus is on how the community of leaders enables the people of the organizational community to share their future; how leaders nurture the reinforcing of growth processes that naturally enable the organization to evolve and change and what strategies are designed to deal with the limiting processes which also naturally evolve. As with all living systems, including families (Ackerman, 1958), there is the force toward maintaining equilibrium or homeostasis as the natural resistance to change by the current industrial-age organizations (Senge, et al., 1999). Organizational development consultants who assist organizational change have already experienced the likeness of the change process as described above through their mothering experience. To assist them in reflecting upon and adding this knowledge is the purpose of this study.

Organizational Development Consulting

It appears then that leaders in the field of organizational development consulting would value the mothering experience in that it provides specific attitudes, ways of thinking, and skills that would be useful not only in managing others but also to the consulting role wherein the practitioner uses "self" as a tool in the work. The following is the most recent literature in the field of organizational development, which is the context of this study. It is important to understand the present nature of the field as well as

the competencies expected of internal organizational development consultant/managers who are

mothers.

Finding no consensus on whether organizational development was a theory, field of practice, an

area of study, or a profession, William Rothwell, Roland Sullivan, and Kristine Quade (2001) have

edited a series of volumes, *Practicing Organizational Development: The Change Agent Series for*

Groups and Organizations, on the current state of the field of organizational development that is

targeted for internal organizational development practitioner managers, among others. They define

organizational development today as "a systemic and systematic change effort, using behavioral science

knowledge and skill, to transform the organization to a new state" (p. ix). They assert that this most

recent series should be seen as: "documentation of the re-invention of OD, an effort that will take

practitioners to the next level, and a practical effort to transfer to the world the theory and practice of

leading-edge practitioners and theorists" (p. x).

In broadening the above definition of organizational development, the board members of the

series wonder if the organizational development field may be at a crossroad and thus offer a definition of

organizational development as:

> …a system-wide and values-based collaborative process of applying behavioral science
> knowledge to the adaptive development, improvement, reinforcement of such
> organizational features as the strategies, structures, processes, people, and cultures that
> lead to organizational effectiveness (p. xv).

As part of this series, Freedman and Zackrison (2001) in their volume, *Finding Your Way in the*

Consulting Jungle, address the practitioner competencies that are expected. Chapter V of this volume,

Consultant Competence, defines *competence* as:

> …mastery of all pertinent information, know theory and research, strategies, and
> methods, and behavioral skills. Mastery refers to good judgment in determining what
> should be done in any given situation and proficiency to apply pertinent competencies to
> that situation properly. Pertinent refers to all competencies necessary to fulfill one's role
> responsibilities as a consultant in the specific situation (p. 87).

The authors list four sets of competencies as being: (a) interpersonal competence, (b) technical competence, (c) consulting competence, and (d) self-management competence. The most essential interpersonal competencies required are confrontation skills, risk-taking ability, collaboration skills, and ability to manage conflict as well as relationship building with emphasis on authentic and trusting relationships (Friedman & Zakerson, 2001).

Technical competence includes being an expert in stakeholder, organizational, intergroup, group, interpersonal, and personal dynamics as well as being able to diagnose, plan and facilitate the implementation of desirable organizational change. Academic preparation includes a master's or doctorate degree in organizational development or a related applied behavioral science (Friedman & Zakerson, 2001).

Consulting competence includes ability to: (a) analyze and diagnose organizational issues, (b) plan and implement strategies to alleviate organizational dysfunctions, (c) assist the organization in managing change, as well as (d) evaluate the progress of the effort (Friedman & Zakerson, 2001).

Self-Management competence includes: (a) ability to manage personal core values, (b) self-confidence, (c) self-awareness, and (d) personal style preferences. Managing personal core values includes being aware of core values, beliefs, and assumptions—both as an individual and as an organizational development consultant so that there is congruence between yourself and the organizational culture. Self-confidence is especially important in marketing your services. Self-awareness is crucial especially in the area of the need for control, personal contact, belonging and prominence. There is a continuum for each of these needs and consultants must understand where they are with each of these areas so that their way of being can exist without expense to the client or necessary intervention. Personal style preference includes an awareness of your most comfortable way of being and whether there is a fit between your preferred style and client system's normative culture.

The authors underscore the need to meet unsatisfied personal needs outside the client system which again suggests the importance of self-awareness (Friedman & Zackerson, 2001).

Based on mothering knowledge and process as explicated by Hart (1992), Ruddick (1989), and Seery (1996), one would expect that mothering would most likely inform interpersonal and self-management competencies of internal organizational development consultant/managers who are mothers. Hart's (1992) work also alludes to a certain paradigm of mothering that also parallels that explicated by three of the volumes in the series for organizational development consulting practitioners, which follows.

Anderson and Anderson (2001a) in *Beyond Change Management* refer to an "Emerging Mindset" as differentiated from the "Industrial Mindset" as leverage for transformation. The emerging mindset includes and contains the industrial mindset. The four cornerstones of the emerging mindset are: (a) consciousness impacts results rather than being only based on external reality as in the industrial mindset, (b) there is abundance rather than scarcity of resources to obtain what is desired, (c) that reality is interconnected and based on relationship and wholeness rather than distinct parts as in the industrial mindset, and (d) everything is in constant motion and specific process dynamics influence how results are produced rather than based on discrete events of the industrial mindset (Anderson & Anderson, 2001a).

Olson and Eoyang (2001), in *Facilitating Organization Change*, refer to an emerging paradigm that is evolving from the science of complex adaptive systems as compared with the traditional model of organization change based more on the Newtonian or Industrial model discussed above. The "Complex Adaptive Systems" evolves from three key principles: (a) order is emergent as opposed to hierarchical, (b) the systems history is irreversible, and (c) the system's future is often unpredictable.

Watkins and Mohr (2001) in *Appreciative Inquiry* also refer to an emerging holistic framework in dealing with change, which is constant and chaotic. It treats organizations as organic systems rather than machines. This emerging paradigm is based on the post-modern quantum relational theories rather than the older modernistic Newtonian linearity.

Women in Organizational Development Consulting

Inasmuch as this research is illuminating the connection between the mothering experience and internal organizational development consulting, it is important to understand the current model of the organizational development practitioner who is also involved in maternal practice.

To date there has not been any literature that specifically focuses on the topic of mothering and organizational development consulting. As previously mentioned, Kaplan (1994) briefly described the work and mothering experiences of a few of her professionals.

> … YY sees consulting as a maternal function and is willing to use her self to betray when necessary in the service of creating a more just culture or in the service of understanding forms of oppression. Just as when she was raising her sons she had to risk their hatred for a while to do what she thought was good mothering and the right action, maternal thinking (Ruddick, 1989) principles operate in how she does her work. 'I don't make a split between the way I do my mothering and the way I do my consulting', p. 104.

Her work also was important in hearing the voices of women in the profession since they had been underrepresented in the literature and research (Kaplan, 1994).

Kaplan (1994) presents a qualitative study of the experiences and perceptions of thirty-two women who were external consultants in the field of Organizational Development. Their voices were important as their careers paralleled the developments in the profession in addition to the changing context of women's issues. She used in-depth interviews based on the interpretive paradigm and phenomenological approach and was concerned with four research questions: "What are the changes that women have experienced in their careers as women organizational development consultants? What are the challenges they have encountered? What are the contributions they have made? And, what are

the lessons they have learned and want to pass on to other women in the field" (Kaplan, 1994, p. viii).

The main findings told the story of women doing the work of consulting as part of their inner journey in the context of oppression which was helped and hindered by their relationships with both men and women (Kaplan, 1994, p. viii).

Her study indicated that women in organizational development consulting do have an experience that was unlike that documented in the current literature at the time of the study. These women experienced challenges concerning sexism, racism, and ageism and the need to separate difference from dominance (Kaplan, 1994). Kaplan (1994) urged a re-examination of women's relative invisibility, difficulty being authentic, the constraints of partnering with men, and the difficulty they experienced in attempting to join collectively to heal themselves, organizations, and the future of the field (Kaplan, 1994). The present work also adds to that knowledge by presenting "women's voices" in organizational development consulting that have not been heard since 1995. In the course of hearing of the mothering experience as it informs their professional role functioning these women provided an update on similar issues as addressed by Kaplan's work.

Kaplan's (1995) work, as well as four other articles about women in organizational development consulting, appeared in a thematic issue of *Journal of Organizational Change Management*, Volume 8, 1995. Recognizing the recent changes to the business of consulting, i.e., dramatic growth, increase in revenues and development of consulting practices within major corporations as well as the entrance of more women into the field, the thematic issue was meant to demonstrate the special contributions of women which have previously been underreported (Covin & Harris, 1995). Previous to this issue, only three studies had addressed this topic, (Correa et al., 1988; Larwod & Gattiker, 1985; Szwajkowski & Larwood, 1991) directly.

The editors of this issue cite that women "face unfair discrimination" such as being passed over for management positions (Covin & Harris, 1995, p. 8). They discuss how discrimination further affects women in that men are selected in order to appease supervisors who are perceived to prefer male consultants in addition to the perceptions of potential business clients who see men as more capable in decision making, taking risks, and working with numbers which are critical consulting skills (Covin & Harris, 1995). From another perspective, there is also lack of diversity within the context of the organizations seeking consultants (Covin & Harris, 1995).

Women bring their own ways of consulting which emphasize connectedness, co-operation and mutuality, and with it a new way of thinking, rather than separateness, competition, and individual success which serves to exclude women and minority groups from full organizational participation (Covin & Harris, 1995). The editors of the issue underscore the chaos of change which needs adaptive capability and include articles that address that new way of thinking. In fact, Correa, et al., (1988) found that women scored higher than male training consultants on nine of the ten areas studied which included, participant learning, emotional involvement, verbal participation and conference facilitation, all of which are highly valued in the consulting arena.

In addition to Kaplan's (1995) work, another research study by Waclawski, Church and Burke (1995), report on the types of interventions used by women in organizational development consulting and those aspects of organizational development consulting that they find rewarding and motivating as well as the values they believe are important to practitioners. They developed a survey that they mailed to 1,500 organizational development practitioners selected randomly from the membership rosters of three professional organizations. They received 416 responses of which 36% were women in the field. They based their findings and conclusions on the responses of that sample. Their conclusions about the profession as a whole suggested that women are more likely to practice as internal professionals (57%)

than in private consulting firms (43%). Furthermore, these women were well educated as well as having some type of academic affiliation (43%). They also represented a wide variety of industries.

Despite the fact that organizational development is considered a humanistic endeavor, the current interventions of choice by these woman practitioners were those concerned with business effectiveness and the bottom-line rather than the more invisible emotion work that women do as presented by Fletcher (1999). They were more oriented towards large-scale organizational issues and away from group dynamics and individual growth and development. Likewise they were more seeking personal gain as major motivators, (e.g. power, financial rewards, selling skills and techniques). Their important values for tomorrow, however, were more humanistic such as creating openness in communication and empowering employees to act. The authors felt that although women may be motivated by the desire to help people in organizations, they must focus their energies on achieving success on a more pragmatic and bottom-line-orientation. They chide the reader to "not let the mundane concerns of today, however, serve as an excuse for ignoring the founding and defining principles of the field" (Waclawski, Church & Burke, 1995 p. 21), namely, to improve the human condition within the workplace.

Two other practitioners, Bonnie Stivers and Jane Campbell (1995), explored consulting positions in leading accounting firms. They learned that male and female accounting consultants are not seen as possessing similar attributes nor are they seen as equally possessing the characteristics of successful accounting consultants.

Marilyn Harris (1995) presents a more personal account about being a woman consultant over the past twenty years. She focuses on various paradoxes she has had to come to terms with involving being accepted by others, sexual discrimination, expectations of others, life choices, and linkages between career and family roles. She placed her family vacation as a priority in developing her consulting work calendar, and she valued the support of her family especially during times that she was

not valued as a consultant. She writes about learning breakthroughs and personal transformation that she experienced during her career (Harris, 1995), but she makes no specific reference to her mothering experience.

Care and the Ethic of Care

As mentioned in the introduction to this chapter, a literature review also takes place concurrently during and after data analysis. The concept of care was initially coined by one of the co-researchers in this study, SC, who believed that mothering taught her to bring a more "caring stance" to her professional role functioning. The researcher saw the other themes that emerged from data analysis that included BB's "being fully present" and GC's "protecting by fighting for trust and safety" as additional strategies of the construct "caring stance." This led to subsuming all of the themes into a larger construct of "care." Perusing the literature on care led to the notion of the "ethic of care" and its possible operation within organizational structure and practice as noted below.

However, prior to data analysis, Derry's (1999) work already had set the stage for thinking about the relevance of the mother-child paradigm to organizational ethical practice. Derry (1999) discusses the value of the mother-child paradigm to the workplace, and more specifically, to business ethics. A claim is made about the recognition of the mother-child paradigm as a foundation for societal well being. He then applies the lessons learned from parenting to both civic roles and work environment. He references Virginia Held's (1993) work in offering the mother-child relationship as a basis for a moral agenda for society that might replace that of the rational economic man. Her research paradigm suggests that our work life may be informed by our primary familial bond. This builds on feminism's project to explicate and validate the experience of women as does this research.

Derry (1999) substitutes the concept of mother with "parent" so that his ideas would be more marketable and the activities referenced as less gendered. This leads to his "Parent-Child Theory of

Business Ethics." The theory of rational economic man is compared with the mother-child paradigm. Rational economic theory is based on relationships of a contractual nature whereas the mother/child relationship emerges from a more deeply involved nurturing process of separation/individuation. He discusses however how the activities of parenting parallel the responsibilities faced by all the natural, cultural, and organizational systems that exist. Yet the theory of rational economic man avoids the complexity of family life and envisions a world of unencumbered men using the ethic of justice to solve moral dilemmas.

Applications for organizational culture would begin with the premise that we are deeply and involuntarily connected and we care about each other's survival more than our own. If this were the case, as in the mother-child paradigm, how would various workplace issues like downsizing, hiring, training, promotion, compensation, and recognition of individual contributors be approached? The influence of the answers to these issues would begin to value and integrate the model of the mothering person and child in organizational transformation.

Turning now to literature more focused on care and the ethic of care is the work of Noddings (1984), Tronto (1993) and Crittenden (2000). Building on Gilligan's (1982) work which focuses on how the more feminine ethic of care develops and is differentiated from the more male form of moral development, the ethic of justice, Noddings' (1984) version of care places the "caring for" person in the private space of both idealized mothering and the more gendered profession of teaching. Tronto (1993) focuses more on the political nature of care and in that way separates it from the more domestic realm. Crittenden (2000) then reworks both Noddings (1984) and Tronto's (1993) more common idea of care as a motherly function and explicates care as well as its roots in "women's way of knowing" as an ethic for corporations and governments, environmental questions and sensitive foreign policy decisions.

Noddings' (1984) volume, *Caring: A Feminine Approach to Ethic and Moral Education*, presents a theory of care building on Carol Gilligan's (1982) *In a Different Voice,* published two years before. Noddings' work advanced a theory about how moral persons ought to behave and proposed a more feminist view of morality than Gilligan's (1982), that saw moral maturity as a combination of care and justice. Noddings (1984) expanded the feminine side of Gilligan's (1982) work. She gives "mother's voices" to the notion of care based on her perception of the idealized practices of mothers and teachers, which limited the generalization of her work.

Noddings (1984) claims that the "concept of care is rooted in receptivity, relatedness, and responsiveness" (p. 2). Although she labels her work as not being feminist, she fails to clarify her meaning of "feminine" and she is not critical of the (then more) sexual division of labor that women experience which almost forces women into roles that "care." Nor does she discuss the possible abusive behaviors of mothers that exist in reality. Her main goal is to demonstrate that an ethic should not only be concerned with notions of logic, rationality, and deduction. Instead it should ask for more information with regard to context, that is, feelings, needs, impressions, and a subjective sense of personal ideal rather than to more male universal principles. It should be rooted in the affect of the human heart and referred further by her to be the "subjective experience" (p. 4.). She outlines her suggestions about moral education and the role of teachers and administrators in this endeavor. Ultimately her ethic of caring is subjectively grounded and based on the nature of the stance that one has established with the other which will then guide appropriate behavior.

Tronto's (1993) volume entitled, *Moral boundaries: A political argument for an ethic of care*, argues that it is necessary to change the focus on women's morality and how women are more moral than men as the key to combating the unlimited concern with productivity and progress and substitute the care ethic instead. She extends caring beyond Noddings' (1984) private and more emotional realm

and instead places it within the more public and rational realm of politics. She also argues that the need

for more universalistic principles in the ethic of care and that this ethic can be applied to distant others.

Distant others are exemplified by, for example, an international issue such as sexual slavery in

Thailand. She calls for an expansion of the boundaries of morality to include global concerns. Her

theory of care rests on four elements of care. The first element is caring about, noticing the need to care

in the first place. This is followed by the taking care of, assuming responsibility for care. The third

element is care giving, the actual work of care that needs to be done, and forth, care receiving, the

response of that which is cared for. (Tronto, 1993). These four elements of care lead to four ethical

elements of care, namely, competence, attentiveness, responsiveness and responsibility (Tronto, 1993).

These elements are further discussed in the conclusion section of this study.

Crittenden's (2000) dissertation*,, Clarifying care: Elaborating and expanding the care ethic,*

presents a philosophically framed critical analysis of both Noddings'and Tronto's theory, combines

them, and then places them in an altered form which he labels as *NT Care* and which is compared to

Noddings' care theory. As an ethics scholar, he incorporates Tronto's notions that care should involve

principles, that empathy can extend to distant others, and that care should extend beyond the private

realm. His model is an attempt at removing care from the more feminine/private stereotype. He creates a

new picture of care that serves both home and work. The personal becomes political within the context

of global consumption, i.e., individuals can buy responsibly and by educating their children about proper

consumption they care for both their children and "distant" others, such as distant sweatshop laborers

(Crittenden, 2000). He paints a world where there would be a relationship of mutual benefit between

buyers, retailers, manufacturers and laborers (Crittenden, 2000). He is not hopeful however that his form

of idealistic social activism will be "bought" by the public, but views his work as a "little piece of

kindling" (p.256) added to the fire of feminist movements.

Others have written about the possible role of the ethic of care in the more public arena of business. White (1992) discusses the implications of Gilligan's ethic of care as an explanation for the results of two studies that found men and women handling ethical dilemmas in business differently. White (1992) makes a claim for the emergence of a female epistemology within the business context which had not been explored at the time of his writing. He contrasts the notion of safety and danger within the ethic of justice and care. Within the more autonomous ethic of justice, safety comes from the ordered movement of people on the hierarchy and from having a protected zone that keeps us separated from one another. Safety within the ethic of care comes from the connections in a network of caring, protecting, and nourishing relationships. Preserving the web is important for safety as compared to protecting the space for separateness within the ethic of justice. Based on this different worldview, female marketing professionals were more disapproving of how managers in three hypothetical moral dilemmas, within the context of marketing, chose to respond. The authors of these studies concluded that the females in the study were more ethical than the males. White (1992) discusses the results based on the differences he addressed above. He suggests that the business world should try to identify the value of both outlooks and find ways to nourish and utilize the benefits of both within the same organization. He underscores the importance of Gilligan's ideas within organizational practice.

Liedtka (1995), building on White's (1992) work, proposes to begin a conversation about the relevance of the ethic of care for the present business context. She notes that there has been an increase in business literature regarding a language of care and relationship building as ways to improve the bottom line. She wonders if this focus is just another management fad or does it begin an important dialogue about the possibility of enhancing both the effectiveness and moral quality of future organizations.

She compares the market driven business transaction with the more caring business relationship within the context of the role for the customer, employees, supplier, organization, senior management and shareholders. The importance of the customer, employee, and supplier are primary within the context of the caring business. In contrast, the customer is considered ancillary to the market transaction. Employees are considered expendable and replaceable and suppliers are considered interchangeable. Of primary importance to the market business is the organization and its senior management as well as its shareholders who are considered supporting for the caring business.

Her seminal concern is the issue of organizational size. Based on the importance of collective strategic decision making so central in the caring business and the primary importance of the employee, she calls for new organizational forms which are contrasted with the current hierarchical model in both size and organization. A decentralized form with ability to marshal collective voices in strategic decisions is crucial. Addressing this issue will result in the need for an interdisciplinary approach that includes the fields of ethics, organizational theory, and strategy. The importance of fieldwork within the context of organizational practice is underscored (Liedtka, 1995).

Focusing more on specific types of organizations or professions, Scott, Aiken, Mechanic and Moravcsik (1995) discuss aspects of organizational caring within the field of health care. They highlight the fundamental importance of caring in the doctor-patient relationship and offer suggestions to achieve that end. They discuss why caring matters, and how organizational dynamics impede caring. Areas addressed include how medical professionals cope with stress and its impact on moral and job satisfaction with special emphasis on burnout. A fundamental issue is that caring takes time. They conclude that administrative and organizational features of the medical setting have a profound effect on providing caring service. They note the complex interactive effect of different parts of the healthcare system, which suggests that changes are needed in all the sectors. Caring must become a concern to

everyone who provides care to patients, either directly or indirectly, and in all situations in which care is given. They emphasize that the practice of medicine is a *calling* concerned with the art of healing and may represent the last real ethical frontier. If a caring attitude and behavior is integrated with healthcare, can it serve as a model for other services critical to maintaining the fabric of society (Scott et al., 1995).

Other studies that deal with the ethic of care and the social world of caring professionals in nursing and teaching focus more on the notion of burn out. Becker (1991) used grounded theory to discover the processes nurses use when faced with ethical situations in practice. A descriptive theory of human connection emerged that was grounded in the core value of a respect for human dignity, and self-determination and its value in combating burn out. Agard (1996) is also concerned with the nursing profession and the issue of burn out which results from the organizational powerlessness yet responsibility of care-givers and the fact that women are expected to take responsibility for more general care-giving in our society. Turner (2000) focuses on the care of self as an antidote to burn out in teaching.

<div align="center">Summary of Literature Regarding Outcomes of Mothering</div>

It is important to remember that not all mothers exhibit the following characteristics of the experience. The literature presented here describes the ideal mothering experience. Moreover, the limitations of the qualitative research studies presented do not permit wide generalization.

Nevertheless, since research on mothering is relatively recent, knowledge about the role is important in an effort to better understand the experience. The majority of the literature that addresses the learned outcomes of mothering relates to the skills acquired from the experience. There is a language that describes these phenomena. The skills mentioned included flexibility, multitasking, decision making, creativity or resourcefulness, observational (scrutinizing gaze), prioritizing, problem solving, managing change, teaching, physical maintenance of body and surroundings. Relational practice skills

included: negotiation, sensitivity to the other, handling ambivalent feelings, self-control or management, empowering others, giving pleasure to self and others, and distress management.

There is also a language to describe ideal attitudes connected with mothering most of which are pertinent to relational practices. These words include: selflessness, nurturing, compassion, empathy, patience, tolerance, understanding, humility, vulnerability, respectful, committed, welcoming change, democratic, realistic, and preserving. Likewise there is some language to describe the ideal cognitive capacities developed, which include flexible thinking, concrete thinking, subjective thinking, and diagnostic ability.

In the area of personal growth, the literature refers to balanced life, internal strength and courage, personality enrichment, expanding of social-psychological boundaries, psychic re-organization of the motherhood constellation which can be transformative as seen in the changes in sense of self and meaning perspective, and the total 24 hour/seven day a week commitment to care for another.

The goals and values that emanate from mothering include preserving (which includes providing a holding place), nurturing, training, improvement of life, non-dominating, sustenance, mutual respect, affection, trust, cooperation, developing human capital, being ethical, empowering others, empowering self, creating and sustaining group or family life all of which are useful in dealing with the current organizational climate characterized by global partnerships, diversity, interdependence, chaos, and ambiguity (Abbey, 1995; Crittenden, 2001; Hart, 1992; Stern, 1995).

Types of learning referenced include experiential learning, transformative learning, tacit knowledge, transpersonal learning, embodied knowing and connected knowing. The knowledge base for that learning includes child growth and development, which is based on the biological, emotional and cognitive maturation and stages of development. Other knowledge bases include the subjective

knowledge of the unique child, a mother's self-knowledge, knowledge of the affective domain, intuition, embodied or natural body knowledge.

With regard to the language used to describe the mothering experience, many authors refer to it as missing, not valued, invisible to the public, non-verbal and even pre-symbolic. The work roles informed by mothering in the literature include adult educators, teachers of children, nurses, and external organizational development consultants. The paradigms within which mothering is described are mostly feminist in nature but also include the lens of organizational and psychotherapeutic frameworks.

Summary

This literature review began with a focus on mothering as a form of work and then took a closer look at the dual role of mother/worker. Relevant literature of the theoretical constructs of adult learning and adult development that link the mothering experience to the work role was presented. The emerging organizational culture of the learning organization was described as a place which would value the learning from mothering obtained through experiential learning as applied to the field of organizational development consulting. It looked at the nature of knowledge transformation and activities that mothering includes that appear in the literature of women in organizational development consulting. This study introduces "mothers' voices" in organizational development consulting which is virtually non-existent. This study will be of interest to professionals in the academic areas of organizational leadership, cognition studies, organizational development consulting, mothering, and adult development and adult learning.

This purpose of this study was to illuminate the mothering experience of the internal organizational development consultant/managers who perceive that their mothering experience informs their professional functioning. Participants as co-researchers were provided an opportunity for

consciousness raising as to the adult educative process that emanates from the mothering experience. This study attempted to further develop the language to describe the experience. Legitimizing the knowledge gained from the mothering experience of these particular consultants may add value to the role. Participants also contributed a women's voice in organizational development consulting which has been lacking. This research also presents a unique connection of the mothering experience with a specific corporate work role, as compared to the generic "career" women of Stern's (1992) study, and that is less gendered than the role of teacher or nurse in previous research (Abbey, 1995; Collins, 1998; MacDonald, 1996).

Chapter III: Method

Chapter III describes the research design, procedures for participant selection, data collection, and data analysis. The study employs a case study approach using the grounded theory method of data analysis (Strauss & Corbin, 1998), which is an iterative, comparative analysis to organize the constructs and relationships found in the data. The result is a theoretical scheme that describes the lived meaning of the mothering experience as applied to professional role behavior for three female internal organizational development consultant/managers who believed that their mothering experience informed their professional functioning.

Research Design

As stated in Chapter I, scholarly literature minimally documents (Kaplan, 1994) the lived world of female internal organizational development consultant/managers as informed and influenced by their experience as mothers. A case study design is used to gain an in-depth understanding of the situation and meaning for those involved (Merriam, 1998). Case studies are intensive descriptions and analyses of a single unit, such as the internal organizational development consultant/manager/mother. The case study method can accommodate a variety of disciplinary perspectives. This study attempted to integrate mothering literature with adult learning and organizational development theory. Yin (1994, p. 9) further states that if "the research question contains a 'how' or 'why' statement being asked about a contemporary set of events over which the researcher has little or no control and where the boundaries between the phenomenon and context are not clearly evident, a case study approach is appropriate." How the mothering experience informs the professional role functioning of the internal organizational development consultant/manager is an example of both conditions. Inasmuch as there are no published theories that explain this experience, a grounded theory method of data analysis as presented by Strauss and Corbin (1998) was selected as a systematic beginning of theory development.

The study design provided an opportunity for these internal organizational development consultant/managers to share their experience in a series of two taped 90-minute face-to-face interviews over a six-month period. Ideal theoretical sampling was attempted, wherein the selection of the next case study emerged from the findings of the first case study but was not always possible due to the constraints of the participants and researcher which are discussed below. However, in all cases, a preliminary analysis of each interview was completed before a second interview was begun as well as before the interviewing of a new participant. In all cases, the second interview was built upon the previous interview. Participants reviewed each transcribed interview for accuracy prior to the next interview. The typed transcripts, researcher observations of the participants during data collection, and participants' resumes were the raw data used for analysis. Participants served as co-researchers in having an opportunity to validate the themes that emerged from their narratives and how their themes fit with the core category of "caring" that emerged from data analysis.

Research Questions

This study focused on an experienced phenomenon: the female internal organizational development consultant/manager's perspective regarding how she experiences mothering in terms of its impact on her professional role functioning. These questions guided the study: (a) What is the mothering experience of the internal organizational development consultant/manager who perceives that her experience informed her professional functioning? and (b) How does the mothering experience inform the professional functioning of the internal organizational development consultant/manager?

Participant Selection

Rationale

Explicating the experience of mothering is difficult. Language regarding the role of mothering has emerged only recently. Less than 20 years ago, Sara Ruddick (1989) initially coined the term

"maternal thinking" (See Chapter I). Stern studied leadership qualities that emerged from the mothering experience in 1992. In 1995, Stern conceptualized the motherhood constellation. Seery's dissertation in 1996 described the emotion work of mothers. More general scholarship regarding mothering is relatively recent (Abbey & O'Reilly, 1998; Brown, Small, Asbury, 1994; Chodorow, 1978; Crittenden, 2001; Glenn, Chang, & Forcey, 1994; Hart, 1992; Hochschild, 1989; Ribbins, 1994; Rich, 1976; Richardson, 1993; Rossiter, 1988). The Association for Research on Mothering (ARM) was founded in 1998.

Therefore, as the nature of this study relied on the ability of the respondents to be reflective as well as to describe their experience of mothering, it was decided to have participants self-select if they believed that their mothering experience informed their professional role functioning. Also, since an important experience of mothering is its ability to transform some women psychologically, especially during the pregnancy, birth, and delivery experience, limiting the study to women who mothered their natural born children was important. In addition, since this study was focused on the more longitudinal view of motherhood, internal organizational development consultant/managers who had at least one adult child were selected to be able to glean a longer perspective on combining the two roles.

The mother/professional chosen as a pilot case was a married African-American, aged 50, who had one son, aged 17, who was in the process of adolescent individuation, which is an important developmental stage for both mother and son (Viorst, 1989). According to *Webster's College Dictionary* (1991), 18 is the legal age in most states when a person is responsible and may enter into contracts and execute deeds, thereby becoming an adult. In consultation with several members of the research committee, it was felt that the son was close enough to adult status to be useful as a pilot study.

The description of the professional role of an organizational development consultant varies widely (Anderson & Anderson, 2001a; Block, 2000; Boleman & Deal, 1991; Nevis, 1987; Varney, 1976; Weisbord, 1987). Therefore, it was decided to utilize a woman's membership in the local

professional association as a definition of the professional internal organizational development consultant. Selecting consultants who had practiced for at least three years assumed sufficient experience in the professional role. Manager was defined as being either a project manager and/or a manager of employees who were directly responsible to the co-researcher for supervision.

The past president of the association reviewed the total population of female internal organizational development consultants in the membership with the researcher and identified those who had children and would be most likely to participate in the study. The researcher then called each professional and first screened for the existence of a biological adult child before inviting her to be part of the study. A pool of four women was identified as possible co-researchers (see Appendix A).

For more variability, attempting to include women of different races, different ages, and from different organizations having different client bases was important. Unable to enlist women of other races for the larger study, all the co-researchers were Caucasian. Their ages ranged from 52 to 62. The organizational context of the study varied to include the federal government, a quasi-federal governmental agency, and a private small business which contracted with the federal government. None of the co-researchers was employed by the same organization. All respondents needed to be geographically accessible for in-home interviews. A pool of four internal organizational development consultants was obtained. The total number of cases used also depended upon the analysis of each case and the level of saturation of categories presented.

Role of Participants

Participants as co-researchers are integral to the qualitative research process, and especially so, for research on women (Reinharz, 1992). Feminist methods in social research have emphasized the importance of involving women in the construction of data about their lives. The researcher develops a sense of connectedness with people. By not using a standardized format, the research questions, rather

than the method, drive the research (Reinharz, 1992). Oakley (1981) first emphasized the importance of intimacy and self-disclosure as well as a belief in the interviewee. The work of Gilligan (1982) and Belenky et al. (1986) were also seminal efforts in this regard in that they provided their participants an initial opportunity to be heard, thereby originating the phrase "women's voices" while delineating how women's epistemology and moral development differs from that of men.

In this study, the co-researchers played four roles (adapted from Klunk, 1999). The term co-researcher and participant are used interchangeably in this study. Initially, the co-researchers were asked to tell their narrative aided by the research questions. Then they reviewed and verified the transcripts of the interviews for accuracy in reflecting what they meant. The co-researchers then met as a focus group once the interview data had been analyzed and the themes of each case study were constructed. Participants were asked to verify that the themes of their narrative regarding their experience accurately reflected their experience. Lastly, the participants were offered an opportunity to further discuss the research questions and possible conclusions that emerged from the data.

As part of the screening, each co-researcher agreed to follow the study protocol which consisted of two 90-minute taped face-to-face interviews and participation in a 90-minute focus group which served as the primary data collection method. The first interview was guided by the identified questions and probes that appear in Appendix C. After the initial interview, the researcher transcribed the interview and prepared the transcript for review by the participant. The researcher also did a preliminary analysis to formulate questions and probes for the second interview which focused on gathering more data on areas that were not sufficiently addressed in the first interview. The second interview followed the same protocol as the first interview with a transcription prepared by the researcher and sent to the participant for her review. The researcher considered the categories as saturated when the co-researcher began repeating information during the second interview without providing any new information. These

interviews were then coded, whenever possible, before interviewing the second co-researcher so that the researcher knew what categories needed more development with regard to the research questions. This protocol was followed with all four co-researchers.

The participants were required to sign a consent form (see Appendix B). Confidentiality and anonymity was discussed. Each participant chose to use initials, rather than a code name, for the purpose of anonymity (see Appendix A).

<center>Interviewing Method</center>

Qualitative interviewing rests on the following philosophical assumptions: (a) understanding is based on people's description of their world in their own terms; (b) there is an inherent obligation for the interviewer to protect the interviewee and the interviewer; and (c) there are standards by which to judge the quality of the research, the humanness of the interviewing relationship, and the accuracy of the write-up (Rubin & Rubin, 1995). The process by which co-researchers are allowed to form explanations and theories that are grounded in the details, evidence, and examples in these interviews, as well as talking back, clarifying, and explaining their points, is referred to as grounded theory (Glaser & Strauss, 1967). Qualitative interviewing is characterized by its flexibility in terms of content, flow, and choice of topics that can change to match what the interviewee knows and feels (Rubin & Rubin, 1995).

The model of qualitative interviewing used in this study is based on that presented by Rubin and Rubin (1995) in *Qualitative Interviewing: The Art of Hearing the Data*. Their model borrows from both the interpretive and feminist approaches and stresses the importance of giving the interviewee a voice (Rubin & Rubin, 1995). Using this method is based on the importance of giving mothers their own voice (Brown, Lumley, Small, & Astbury, 1994), as well as hearing the voices of women in organizational development consulting (Kaplan, 1994). Accordingly, an empathic engagement (Anderson, Armitage, Jack, & Wittner, 1990) interview style was embraced.

This research did not adhere to the feminist research method of the need for self-disclosure on the part of the researcher nor intimacy with the co-researcher as it was felt that such goals would interfere with listening and the relative objectivity in data collection. For these reasons as well as based on the advice of the past president of the professional association who suggested those women who would have interest in the topic, the researcher did not share that she was a psychotherapist. Being a psychotherapist, however, was considered important to the interviewing process regarding this topic as well as to providing clinical judgment during data analysis.

Data Collection

Pilot Study

Some years ago, while the researcher was describing her dissertation topic at a meeting of the local professional association, a female colleague spontaneously responded that she had removed herself from management, as it was too much like mothering. The researcher asked her if she would consent to be part of her study and she agreed. She met the study criteria except that her oldest son was 17 not 18 and still residing at home. Of great importance (Yin, 1994), was that she was congenial and accessible. After collaborating with committee members, it was decided that this African-American professional internal organizational development consultant/manager/mother could serve as a pilot study.

A pilot study serves many purposes. It assesses whether developed questions and probes are appropriate and yield rich data. It also assesses whether the lead researcher is capable of good listening and interviewing skills. It can be useful in deciding the method for data collection. Also of great importance is the role of the interviewee as a collaborator in helping to determine topical areas that would be most fruitful considering the problem to be studied. Inasmuch as studying the holistic experience of the mother/professional is relatively recent (Garey, 1999), being able to have a broad focus for initial inquiry along with concurrent review of the literature was important (Yin, 1994). The

research professor on the committee and committee chairwoman both reviewed the transcriptions and provided feedback. The researcher did a preliminary analysis to formulate questions and probes for each subsequent interview.

Data were collected via two 90-minute taped face-to-face interviews, as well as telephone discussion with the pilot interviewee about the accuracy of the interviews and her feedback as to the appropriateness of the questions asked and other areas that could be explored in learning about the experience of the mother/professional. Appendix D (Abbey, 1995), lists the general topics that emerged from the literature as being the most fruitful in studying the presenting problem and was to be used with participants in the larger study. As the literature underscored that language was missing to describe the mothering experience, assisting in the development of such a language was one purpose of the study. This led to the decision to utilize a topic approach based on previous research (Abbey, 1995). However, it became evident that the richest data emerged in the larger study when the researcher followed the lead of the co-researcher using an open-ended format of interviewing rather than using specific questions gleaned from the literature. The researcher took responsibility for assuring that rich data were obtained about the three main contexts of experience, namely, mothering, managing, and consulting. See Appendix C for the interview questions that guided the larger study.

Larger Study

SC, who was the first to agree to be a co-researcher, was interviewed in her home. She introduced me to her dog, who she rescued, as well as to her husband, a psychotherapist. She shared that she was missing her youngest daughter who was in Australia as a foreign exchange student. SC was interviewed in a taped 90-minute face-to-face interview. She appeared guarded and had obviously given the topic of the research much thought. Her interview was transcribed immediately afterward and delivered in person by the researcher. The first interview was coded and analyzed before arranging a

second interview which took place a month later. The second interview was also transcribed immediately afterward and sent to SC for approval. The second interview was then coded about a month later and analyzed.

GC's first interview was held two months after SC's two interviews were completed and coded. GC was interviewed in her large executive office. Her first taped face-to-face 90-minute interview was also transcribed immediately and preliminary analysis was done before her second interview was held three weeks later. During the interim, she also received a copy of the first transcription by mail, and her second interview was mailed after it was transcribed.

As BB was going out of the country on vacation for one month and wanted to complete our work before she left, I interviewed her before the coding of GC's interviews were completed although a preliminary analysis of her interviews had been done. BB was interviewed in her home for her first 90-minute face-to-face interview, which was transcribed immediately. A preliminary appraisal was done of her first interview prior to her second face-to-face interview which was scheduled for a few days later. She approved the transcripts of both interviews approximately a month later after her return from vacation.

JM also was anxious to complete the interviews immediately after she was selected to replace a potential participant who had to cancel her participation in the study. Her first 90-minute taped face-to-face interview was held prior to the second interview with BB. She was interviewed in her home. Her transcript was done immediately and sent to her through the mail. I was able to slow down her process and scheduled her second interview approximately a month later after I had completed preliminary appraisals and was almost finished with the coding of BB's and GC's interviews. This is an example of how the ideal research process must be adapted to the availability and pressures of the participants and the researcher (Janesick, 2001). Also important here is that access and entry are sensitive components in

qualitative research. In order to honor the time frame for data collection that the participants had scheduled into their lives, I had to begin interviewing one person before I had completed interviewing the previous participant (Janesick, 2001). NOTE: JM was not part of the final analysis (see Appendix A).

During the individual interviews, each co-researcher submitted an updated resume which noted additional educational experiences and work history. Demographic information deemed useful for the study, such as ethnicity, age, and marital status, was obtained during the interview. Assuring that the mother was the biological mother of her children was part of the initial screening of potential co-researchers. This was important based on Stern's (1995) work regarding the transformational quality of the motherhood constellation which originates in the pregnancy, birth, and care of an infant. Also, the initial screening ascertained whether the mother had lived with and was intimately involved in the care of her child outside of working hours. This was important to provide rich data about the maternal experience over the long haul.

The focus group was held after coding and analysis was done on all the interviews. The focus group served the purpose of triangulating the data. The participants were asked if their theme resonated with them as being appropriate and how the overarching theme of "care", which resulted from the analysis, fit with their theme and how it might show itself in their professional functioning. They were also asked about their feelings about being a co-researcher in the project. See Appendix C for questions that guided the focus group.

Analysis and Interpretation of Data

A systematic approach to developing grounded theory (Strauss & Corbin, 1998) was applied to the analysis and interpretation of the data as presented in the transcribed interviews. These analytic tools (Strauss & Corbin, 1998) helped the researcher to be more objective and stimulate the inductive process,

which ultimately builds theory about the lived world experience of the mother/professional from the data.

The early stages of data analysis consisted of coding, a process by which the data are fractured and placed into categories, which then generated concepts grounded in the data and lead to the emergence of themes and patterns (Strauss & Corbin, 1998; Coffey & Atkinson, 1996). The important analytic work, however, is in establishing and thinking about linkages (Coffey & Atkinson, 1996). Codes represent the decisive link between the interview transcript and the researcher's theoretical concepts (Coffey & Atkinson, 1996). Coding, then, is a process of both analysis and interpretation of the data, which alternates between the collecting and coding of the data to verify the basis of the emerging ideas, which culminate in developing a larger theoretical scheme.

Coding is differentiated by Strauss and Corbin (1998) into three types:

1) *Open coding* is the process of identifying concepts of phenomena and discovering their properties and dimensions as found in the data.

2) *Axial coding* is the process of relating categories to their subcategories around the axis of a category, thereby linking categories at the level of properties and dimensions. The connections represent a paradigm model. The development of a paradigm includes phenomena: causal conditions, consequences, action and interaction strategies, context, and intervening conditions.

3) *Selective coding* is a process that integrates and refines categories to form a larger theoretical scheme.

Line-by-line coding is especially useful at the beginning of a study in order to generate as many categories as possible. Or, coding can be done by analyzing whole sentences or paragraphs. This method is especially useful when there are several categories and the researcher wants to code specifically in

relation to them. Yet another way to code is by viewing the entire document, especially when comparing it with other documents and asking whether it is the same or different from the other documents, and then coding for those similarities or differences (Strauss & Corbin, 1998, pp.119-120).

First, a line-by-line analysis was done for all 15,413 lines of interview data collected. Appendices E, F, and G contain summary codebooks for each participant, developed from open coding. During axial coding, the researcher also documented the process of analysis through memos and notes which included observations that the researcher had made of the participants during data collection. This included further questions, insights, categories, relationships, consequences, actions, and interactions. Whole sentence and paragraph coding led to the generation and development of concepts, categories, and propositions through the constant comparison method, which is an iterative process that led to learning about the experiences of the mother/professional, the phenomenon of this study (see Appendices E, F, and G for examples of the types of coding and the development of concepts such as GC's core category of "protecting" in the Code Book and Family Tree and actual coded data from which the concept emerged.)

After open coding, the process of axial coding was completed, whereby open codes were categorized and grouped to form new codes, categories, or subcategories. For GC, for example, lines of data were open coded and labeled as "herding," "real needs," "rescue," and "retain". I asked myself if these codes belonged together. Do they have something in common? I went back to the text and read for meaning and definition. These codes represented how GC dealt with her XYZ staff. To her, these were strategies she used to keep her staff safe while also insuring her management goals. This also suggested how she protected herself by protecting others. These codes were then entered on the family tree under the category of safe within the larger XYZ context code, which was a category under the larger context

code of management in the family tree. Placing open codes and their relationships to other codes and categories on the family tree represented the axial coding process.

During the selective coding process, the core categories emerge. Stauss and Corbin (1998) describe the core category as the central phenomenon around which all other categories are integrated. Then other categories are compared and related to the core category. This is also done using the family tree. The initial step in this process is to create a story line. The story line is based on the data and described what the participant brought from mothering to the professional role functioning of the internal organizational development consultant/manager. The story is then expressed in narrative form. The next steps consisted of relating the data to the categories and finally to the core category. The goal is to list the properties and dimensions of the central phenomena that emerge from the data. They can then be grouped, compared, and related to each other at a more conceptual level than axial coding. According to Strauss and Corbin (1998), being able to validate one's theory against the data completes its grounding. Creating narrative memos are then compared and validated against the data.

For example, I was able to put all of GC's codes into a format that indicated that they were the context of the core category, strategies or actions/interactions of the core category, causal or intervening conditions of the core category, or consequences of the core category. GC repeated the pattern of protecting in response to problems and situations she found herself in. GC's story line then emerged from which the narrative was written. It appeared that GC's background, which consisted of a mentally ill mother and home situation that was often chaotic, was a causal condition that led her to need to protect herself and others. This same process was used in the coding of BB and SC and is located in the *Findings* chapter before their narrative. GC's family tree is located in Appendix F. BB's family tree is located in Appendix E. SC's family tree is located in Appendix G.

Unlike the core category of "protecting" that emerged from the data, the category of "idealized perception" was embedded in the data and emerged because there were inconsistencies between the reported behavior of GC and BB about what they believed about their behavior and what they felt about mothering and their self-reported stories about their actual functioning in the three roles of mother, consultant, and manager. For example, one of GC's codes was patience. She reported that she learned how to be patient as a mother. However, she reported that she would often scream at her children which was inconsistent with her belief that she learned patience through being a mother. Furthermore, the code "anger" appeared repeatedly. There were two properties for anger codes, GC's anger and her children's anger. Being a patient mother may not be consistent with having angry children.

Theoretical Sensitivity

Strauss and Corbin (1998) define theoretical sensitivity as "the attribute of having insight, the ability to give meaning to the data, the capacity to understand, and the capacity to separate the pertinent from that which is not. All this is done in conceptual rather than concrete terms" (Strauss & Corbin, 1998 p. 42). Strauss and Corbin (1998) speculated that theoretical sensitivity could be acquired through various sources, such as professional and/or personal experience, as well as the literature review regarding the phenomenon under study. They warn, however, that these same experiences might prevent the researcher from seeing the routine or obvious or, worse yet, assume that the participant has had the same experience as the researcher. In addition, ongoing analysis of the data sensitizes the researcher to new ideas and insights.

Strauss and Corbin (1998) stress the need to maintain a balance between objectivity and sensitivity. The method of analysis necessarily causes the researcher to become immersed in the data, which gives rise to the mutual shaping process of data and researcher. The researcher can maintain objectivity by periodically asking, "What is going on here?" and "Does what I think I see fit the reality

of the data?" (Strauss & Corbin, 1998, p.45). In addition, maintaining an attitude of skepticism helps maintain objectivity. All knowledge about the data should be considered as provisional and should also be compared with data in subsequent interviews or observations (Strauss & Corbin, 1998, p. 46). Lastly, objectivity is maintained by flexibly following the research procedures of making comparisons, asking questions, and sampling based on evolving theoretical concepts.

Being a therapist offered the researcher the opportunity to view mothering and professional behavior from several perspectives. Having experience in parent counseling, career counseling and individual psychotherapy offered the researcher some objectivity with regard to the intersection of both roles. On the other hand, there was a tendency to be clinical and judgmental, as for example, when hearing about the social functioning of the co-researchers' children. Memos served to warn the researcher (who was a therapist and a mother) about these biases.

Coding the first interview before scheduling the second interview enabled this researcher to obtain more data on the categories that needed further evidence. Having a focus group of all co-researchers to review the findings of the larger study assisted with theoretical sensitivity. Concurrent literature review led the researcher to be more sensitive to the boundary issues of the two roles and the processes by which the roles were either juggled or woven together.

Ethnograph

In order to facilitate the data management process, the computer software package THE ETHNOGRAPH (Seidel, Kjolseth, & Seymour, 1998) was used to manage the qualitative data. This software is often described as a "code-and-retrieve" package (Richards & Richards, 1994). It required that the researcher first code some type of qualitative data by denoting the start-and-stop lines for various coded segments. Then the stop-and-start line for each coded segment and its code word are entered into the computer. THE ETHNOGRAPH stores the information and then searches the data for

the text data associated with specific codes. It also maintains a database of memos and notes, which is important in portraying the process of the validity of the research. After the coding is completed, a written narrative of the mother/professional's experience was completed, which emphasized the major themes that emerged. The co-researcher verified the accuracy of the themes that emerged.

Merriam and Simpson (1995) discuss several strategies for the purpose of ensuring internal validity: (a) triangulation, the use of multiple investigators and sources of data, (b) using the co-researcher to validate findings, (c) peer/colleague examination, (d) statement of researcher's experiences, assumptions, and biases, and (e) submersion/engagement in the research situation, thereby collecting data over a long period of time to understand the phenomenon.

Triangulation and peer examination can again be used to enhance reliability. Also, an audit trail, whereby the researcher must detail how data were collected, how categories were derived, and how decisions were made throughout the research, is another method by which reliability or consistency is assured (Merriam & Simpson, 1995, p. 116).

For this study, triangulation occurred through the use of a focus group of all co-researchers to validate findings. Also, in addition to the formal research committee, the researcher obtained feedback from the research professor of the study and other doctoral students in an ongoing coding class. Data collection took place over a six-month period of time, which provided substantial time in which to understand the phenomenon.

External validity, defined here as the generalizability of the research to other users, is usually left up to the consumer of the research. Strategies that can strengthen the rigor in this area, however, include a thick description, multi-case design, modal comparison, or random sampling within the phenomenon being studied (Merriam & Simpson, 1995, p. 103). The use of appropriate questions and probes, and

multi-case design was selected to represent as many contextual variations as possible, aided this study with regard to external validity.

The themes and variations about the mother/professional's experience within the context of her own life and culture was integrated with a multi-disciplinary review of scholarly literature. In order to assure that issues of validity and reliability were met, collaboration with co-researchers, research advisor, and chair of dissertation committee, and other doctoral students within an ongoing coding class occurred. It is important to remember, however, that the final concepts and design of this study emerged from the data collected.

Summary

Since scholarly literature is lacking regarding the study of the holistic experience of internal organizational development consultant/managers who are mothers, the selection of the case study method utilizing the grounded theory method of analysis was an appropriate approach that yielded rich data. Using an open-ended interviewing technique and collaboration with the interviewee as co-researcher gave rise to the emergence of "women's voices" both as mothers and as professionals. The grounded theory form of analysis of the data enabled an understanding of the beliefs regarding the value of the mothering experience to the professional and helped to clarify the connection between the private "work" of mothering and the public "work" of the internal organizational development consultant/manager professional.

Chapter IV: Findings

This chapter presents a summary analysis of the self-reported beliefs and experiences of three internal organizational development consultant/managers regarding how their mothering experience informed their professional role functioning. Inasmuch as there is a lack of language to describe the mothering experience, this study sought to illuminate and better understand that experience and to discern what knowledge it brought to their consulting and managerial functioning. This chapter offers descriptive data in the form of three narratives that were organized to include a general demographic description of each co-researcher, followed by background data regarding her family-of-origin, as well as adult developmental experiences in addition to mothering such as adult continuing education, psychotherapy, and intimate relationships. This is followed by a self-reporting of their mothering, consulting, and management experiences as well as their beliefs regarding the influence of their mothering experience on their consulting and managerial functioning. Each narrative is preceded by a review of the axial and selective coding process that produced the storyline from which the narratives were written. A summary of the findings completes the chapter.

The Narratives

The purposes of the narratives were: (a) to give voice to women in organizational development consulting and managing, (b) to develop a language to describe the mothering experience, (c) to describe the reporting of what these professionals believed they brought from mothering to work, as well as, (d) to describe their self-reported behavior in the three roles of mothering, consulting, and managing. To ensure the confidentiality and anonymity of the participants, the researcher used initials for the participants and omitted specific organizational locations and names.

After learning of the study's purpose, four professionals, aged 52 to 62, volunteered to participate. All four professionals were Caucasian and were employed by federal, quasi-federal, or

private contractors to the federal government. Each professional was a biological mother of an adult

child ranging from 19 to 36 years of age. Two of the professionals were married and resided with their

husbands; one was divorced twice and was living with a significant other; and the other had never

married and lived with her adult daughter.

The researcher clarifies participants' phrases, words, or pronouns with the use of parentheses ( ).

The summary of the findings of the study follows the narratives.

BB

Coding BB

There were many contradictions in the data obtained from BB. Examples of these appear in the summary of findings in Chapters IV and V. A major category of "idealized perception" was more embedded in the data and became more evident when the researcher triangulated the data with the research professor and graduate students in the coding class. Based on this finding, BB's core category of "being fully present" (see Appendix E) became her ideal core category.

The ideal theme of "being fully present" varied along the dimensions of context which included her background, values, the work contexts of organizational development consulting and management as well as mothering. (see Appendix E for Family Tree). Her background was highlighted by the absence of being fully present as indicated by action/interaction code words of "lost," "depressed," "isolated," and "acting out" which described her (context) adolescence. Her mother was not fully present to BB by denying her husband's alcoholism and focus on externals. BB's background was also a causal condition in her own inability to be fully present until she went into recovery from alcoholism as well as then being an ideal for which to strive.

Within the context of BB's core values, many of the codes define strategies for being fully present: anchor, grounded, dialogue, and listening. The consequences of being fully present include intimacy and being authentic.

Within the context of mothering, her ideal strategies of being fully present include being supportive, letting go, and disciplining with consequences. These strategies led to outcomes or consequences of being fully present such as flexibility, integration of core values with behavior, and conflict with her son. Caring for her infant son was a causal as well as an intervening condition to her being transformed, which then served as being another causal condition to her becoming more fully

present. But because she was not fully present to her son, he served as a catalyst that led her to recovery from alcoholism which then led to becoming more fully present. AA meetings helped her learn to listen, an important strategy of being fully present.

Within the context of work, strategies used in organizational development consulting to be more fully present include coaching, and more systemic strategies such as attention to process and the development of people resulting in the outcomes of vision and voice. As a manager she strove to be more fully present within the context of team and task but realized she intimidated men, thus not being fully present perhaps by the intervening condition of transference in the process.

BB: "Being Fully Present"

BB is a twice divorced 59-year-old Caucasian female who has been employed as an internal organizational development consultant/manager at the same corporation for the past ten years during which time she has also been in recovery from alcoholism. She is the mother of a 29-year-old married son. BB described her mothering, consulting, and management styles as represented by the construct of "being fully present" which she defines as being able to listen without judgment and be genuinely engaged with another person. However, BB's own description of her behavior in these three roles seems inconsistent with her label of them, representing more of an idealized perception of them. For example, her alcoholism during her son's childhood rendered her less than being "fully present" in any of her roles. Instead, the construct of "being fully present" is more of an ideal that she is still in the process of achieving.

In addition, although BB reports that mothering brought many resources to her professional functioning, her experience with Alcoholic's Anonymous, graduate school, National Training Laboratory workshops, and psychotherapy also provided her with learning how to be more fully present making it difficult, then, to clearly differentiate mothering from her other adult learning experiences. Thus, BB's perception of the impact of her mothering on her management and consulting style may represent more her idealized perception. Clearly, the contribution of mothering, within the context of these other experiences, is likely to be complex, interactive, and non-linear.

Background

BB described herself as the "lost child" from a dysfunctional alcoholic family, which denied her father's alcoholism and instead focused on external appearances rather than feelings. Like a "lost child" she initially floundered scholastically, professionally, and romantically. She spent two years in the Peace Corps with her first husband before finally graduating from college in her late 20's. She worked part-

time without a focus on career and was also disappointed with graduate school. At age 30, she felt that

she was then ready to have a child and welcomed her pregnancy. During her son's first years, however,

she divorced her first husband with whom she shared the physical custody of her son and who was a

very involved parent. During the remainder of her son's childhood she failed in another relationship and

a second marriage to a heavy drinker and was an active alcoholic herself. For the past seven years she

has lived with a psychotherapist/minister who also informally counsels her and her son despite the

ethical issues that might be involved. However, she contends that despite being a failure at adult

relationships earlier in her life, she has achieved emotional intimacy with her present significant other:

> So for the last seven years, I have been learning about taking responsibility for my
> unconscious. He is like incredible. He is relentless. Our relationship is really very deep as
> a result. Very deep. Because he will go to breakdown (hers). I ask him how does he
> differentiate me from his clients and he says, "You don't give me a check."

Mothering as Transformation

The mothering experience involves a complex psychological system that can be both cause and

effect in some important ways in the life of BB. She reported that the motherhood experience was

transformational for her but this was a more idealized perception as to what it actually offered her son.

Her ideal was to provide her son with a sense of self by being fully present to him. At the same time,

mothering her son "grounded her to life" and to the emergence of her own sense of self as it indirectly

led to the beginning of her recovery from alcoholism.

BB's ideal of what she was trying to provide for her son comes from her assertion that she

honored her son by being "fully present to him" which includes non-judgmental listening and authentic

engagement while also demonstrating unconditional love:

> …Mothering, parenting is not easy. There are always different things coming up,
> different circumstances, and not just dealing with the kid, but with the universe of schools
> and teachers and relatives and others who would like you to mother or parent a certain
> way. So there are all kinds of influences. That is the primary thing that has influenced
> me. So, getting clear on what is important about being a mother to that kid, what do I

need to do no matter what? And it has always been about, loving the child and knowing that he is loved, lovable, and being on his side. So he knows that there is somebody with him all the time. That, it isn't, it doesn't matter what he does, or what kinds of things he is encountering, and so he can learn that he can be on his own side, to love himself, and to demonstrate that, is the most powerful thing. So that when there is another tier of things, you can give him a good education, a good home, teach them manners, there are all kinds of tiers of things, but for me the core is, is this loving him, is this being on his side, is this understanding him, is this hearing him, is this listening to him, so that he can learn to do that for himself.

Being able to provide the above requires the presence of a certain sense of self. BB shared that her own emerging self did not begin until she became a mother. She reports that her early experience with motherhood may have been transformational as it provided a "clean slate," separated from her more painful childhood. She was able to start over and become responsible for nurturing another person. She saw that the relationship between herself and her infant son was genuine as he really needed her and she really wanted to take care of him. When talking about the possible transformations that pregnancy and motherhood might bring, BB responded:

> Not until after Nick was born. Ah, I think that being pregnant was just, that is what I wanted to do. It wasn't transforming yet. When Nick was born and I began to take care of him, that was my first true experience in loving responsibility. Up until then, I didn't have responsibility for anything. I equated responsibility with what you had to do in life. Duties. I didn't like it. I didn't want to be responsible for anything. I felt like I wanted to be like Peter Pan and be a kid the rest of my life. So when I became a mother, it was, oh being responsible for something can be a real joy. I was totally into it. And it changed my whole idea about what I thought responsibility was about.

When the researcher asked BB to talk more about how mothering changed her sense of responsibility, she replied:

> Well, I didn't feel I wanted to be responsible for anything and now all of sudden I did. And that was a huge change. That meant that I was willing to think about being present, caring for my baby and the thing that startled me so was I loved doing it. It wasn't a duty. It wasn't, I wanted to do that. It was not something that someone else imposed on me of told me I had to do or I better do this.

When the researcher asked BB what she loved most about being a mother, she shared that:

I was good at it. To think that I really had fun, I enjoyed playing with Nick at all ages and seeing his friends. I enjoyed seeing the world through a child's eyes you get that wonderful opportunity to go to the zoo with a kid that was so fascinated with a little kernel of corn on the path. Everything was like something fascinating. So like the world opens up and if you are open to that experience, you like to share that with a kid. It was totally wonderful.

When the researcher asked BB to share some memories about the time when her son was a baby, she continues:

He was an easy baby. His father and I were having difficulties. So that is what sticks out for me. How different my experience with being a wife was from being a mother. So, I wasn't very good at being a wife, I wasn't very good with adult relationships, so finding some connection in my heart and the skill I was developing as a mother was very wonderful especially since I had no skills as a wife, laughing, neither my husband nor myself were good at intimate relationships and didn't really understand how to be with each other and so that was very difficult. So I found that I could sit in a chair and rock my baby and be there with him and I could cry, I could be happy, I could, you know, and it felt like this was a clean slate, someplace for me to start that wasn't all messy with all the other baggage I was carrying around and it was demanding but rewarding as my marriage was demanding but wasn't rewarding because I didn't know how to do it. So those are some of my memories of that time was the contrast between the two.

Recovery Process

When her son was 13 years old, he confronted her about her poor mothering which was a catalyst for her to seek recovery from her own problem with alcohol. In this sense, then, the experience of motherhood indirectly led to the transformational process of recovery which suggests an idealized perception that she was "fully present" for her son during his childhood and consequently provided a catalyst for her further growth.

In talking about her recovery from alcohol:

It really interfered with everything I valued, and everything I want and it was getting more and more serious and I was 43 when I quit. So I was still young enough to say, I can choose about my life and I chose and this was about in Nick's 8th grade. He was 13. So, he was in the eighth grade, he called me the worst mother in the school. Now his best friend, Josh, who was now his best man, looked at him. Josh was over a lot and a nice kid, and he said, if you think your mother is the worst mother, you don't know what a bad mother is. (Laughing.) I wasn't doing anything really horrible, but it was not a good time. We would fight about stupid things, and you know, I didn't have patience, and I didn't

> want to sit and help him with his homework, and you know, all this stuff that drinking does in terms of marring one's judgment and patience and how one would be in the world. So in the 8th grade, he told me I was the worst mother. I believe, in fact that that was when I hit bottom, for me.

> So just by whatever great luck, laughing, I stopped and so every year thereafter, it got much better. Within a year or two or three, I don't remember quite what, when we talk about this he says I was the best mother ever after AA and has said this ever since.

She credits AA and Adult Children of Alcoholic's meetings for teaching her how to be fully

present both at home and at work.

> I can talk, I have had to practice listening and really almost consider it a discipline I need to develop and AA helped me enormously, sitting there for hours on end, just hearing people, really being present to whatever is being said. So I know that there are also people who think that I have a way of doing things even though I think of it as very open, not everybody experiences it that way.

Mothering Adult Children

Some evidence of her more idealized perception about her relationship with her son emerged

when she shared that she still relied upon imaginary dialogue with her son to clarify her own thinking:

> To this day, I will say if Nick and I were having this conversation and he were 8, (prior to her abstinence from alcohol) what would he tell me.

Further evidence exists regarding her more idealized perception that she taught her son to be

fully present. She shared that he needed counseling in junior high school, as he was not able to cultivate

friends and was lacking in self-esteem. Then more recently he required counseling, provided by her

significant other, to help him be able to listen to his fiancée' before she would marry him. Rather than

listen, he would attempt to "fix" her problems and avoided emotional intimacy. During his emotion

work with his fiancée he supposedly gained an intimacy with himself that was lacking and is necessary

before one can be fully present to another.

Mothering and Adult Development

In an attempt to further differentiate the impact of mothering from other adult development experiences, BB describes her ongoing imaginary dialogue with her deceased mother during her active mothering experience and the relevance of her being mothered to her relationship with her son:

> So my way of dealing with that was, rather I have had bits of therapy for years, I just carried on conversations with her as if she were still around, telling her how I felt and what was up for me and what my life was like, and I built her, an .imaginary mother, about how she might have responded and changed over the years along with me. And, so it was very interesting, about ten years ago, probably now, I am now almost 60, so I was about 50, I had gotten sober and I, you know I had this life and I was feeling like, you know, change, I had really said, okay, I have all this life to live, and I am going to try to live it. So that was fine. My mother is buried in XYZ, which is where I was from

And later during the focus group discussion regarding separating of adult development from the mothering of children experience, she underscores again, the importance of being mothered herself and how that impacts the mothering of her son which she felt differentiated the present act of mothering from her other adult learning experiences as well as, on the other hand, the difficulty involved in doing so:

> You know, I am not a psychologist, so I have no business even saying this but you know Winnicot's theory about the Good Enough Mother, so I am thinking about how important it is that the mothering kind of caring as a dimension of being an adult. I am not sure that you, you can get grown up by any number of means, so how does the mother group get differentiated from any other kind of group, and I suspect that it is very powerful because it connects us to our own original experience, there is a lot of stuff going on, unconsciously and below the surface that is probably really powerful. I couldn't begin to unravel that to say that is valid. That is pretty powerful unconscious anyway. So if you haven't had that experience, there, that isn't to say that you can't be compassionate and it is gonna be differentiated somehow because you are adding your own mother experience unto your experience of being a mother. So it is something different that is added to that growing up.

Influence of Mothering on Organizational Development Consulting

BB has spent the last ten years doing internal organizational development consulting at the same corporation. She relates that having been born in 1942, she was raised to "just" get married rather than

have a career. She was able to work part time until her son was three years old but she relates that she

was not particularly ambitious at that time. She then had a series of management positions, which led to

her current position. She has a Masters Degree in Organizational Development Consulting.

BB describes her present professional role:

My job at XYZ is as a learning and leadership development consultant. I am at a director
level which means that I have responsibility for certain programs and the design and
development of them. We are introducing a new competencies system which will impact
on succession planning and leadership development and assessing skills and figuring out
who should be where and what kind of leadership skills we have in the aggregate and all
that kind of stuff. I am also leading a coaching program which means that I am in charge
of um, the screening, I was going to say, acquisition, but that is not quite the right word,
but hiring and managing of external coaches that we use for executives, that is currently
my favorite thing. And a lot of miscellaneous other kinds of projects, one of them is, not
so miscellaneous, the employee opinion survey which I am responsible for managing but
also for understanding the impact of the data and the reports in the organization and the
action that should be taken, so I have developed a whole process for that. And I am
working that process in my own division. So those are some of the things, it is
programmatic in that sense from a formal OD standpoint. The way in which I understand
this as OD is of course how is the systems impacts of a competency system, the systems
impacts of an executive coaching system and the same with collecting employee
opinions. How is that impacting culture and how is culture impacting that and what are
those interesting intersects and what does that mean.

BB perceives that her role of mother, organizational development consultant and manager, are all

experienced as being tied to the same maternal core values of being intimate and authentic which further

defines the construct of "being fully present." In reflecting on the commonalties of the three roles she

responded:

Common to managing, doing OD work, and mothering. I think (pause) being really,
acting out of core values, that in order to do good OD work, you have to be conscious, I
think, of the value you are holding for an organization, cause organizations have these
slippery cultures. And to be a mother, when it is so confusing, each situation is different.
And as a team leader, each situation is different. You have to rely on some core way of
behaving in the world. I think it is common to have a sense of what values are you
operating out of, they are fairly transparent to people. Ah, that is one way I would
describe it. I would also describe it as, how do you humanize the process, how do you
stay present in the relationship of the mother-child, the relationship of the team leader
and the team and if you study, sort of, the analytic group, Bion and those people, if you
are the leader of a team, you can really get a lot of stuff transferred onto you. And so if

you understand some of that, whether you go along with it all the way, those things really act themselves out every day. So, in OD too, it is like, what are you really trying to do on behalf of the organization. What is the system, how is the system changing in a way that really is going to be meaningful. And I think that a lot of times, you know, businesses re-organize. Right now they are talking about the government. If they didn't know or didn't act. There is only so much you can do. What could you possibly do to them, make them be fuller, better, happier, whole, better leaders, everything. How can you help people live into their own potential or organizations for that matter? You know, some people do it in team work and some people do it through coaching. All different ways.

She particularly values the maternal emotion work (Seery, 1996) of providing a space for

employees to gain voice and vision in service of a work task:

> I think that the most meaningful times for me in my practice are when I can create some kind of space for people to be able to be authentic in whatever the task is and I like to connect it with a task at work as that is okay and I think that is useful to say, what are we trying to accomplish here, where if we are building a relationship in service of what because I think in the workplace there needs to be that orientation needs to be there, it is a business and I am quite comfortable with that, and it is about both at the same time. What is it that we need to talk to each other about to get this done? (Laughing.) And I am very moved when I see people emerging in that space (tears form in her eyes) as authentic. And it might be simply to say that, my vision is this, and I have never been able to say that before. I didn't have any place to tell somebody before. I didn't think that anybody would hear whatever that is, or me, that is where my most powerful work is in that domain.

When the researcher asked her to tell some stories that describe when that happened she shared

about an opportunity she had to do that:

> Yeah, one time a large division, a large-scale version of it. A division of probably over 1,000 people wanted to find a way to let people have some voice in the changing of their vision. They were really moving out of a processing of XYZ into an automated environment and their vision was to be really different than they had been, and a lot of the people were processors, and they were not visionary in any sense of the word, and they had a sense that they wanted people to participate in that, so that people would understand, what this sea change was that they were about to go through and they asked me to help them figure that out. It was wonderful work. In the sense of doing that, I used dialogue and appreciative inquiry and talked to a group outside of Boston, at Cambridge.

BB shares a story about how the listening skills she learned while attending AA meetings and

which she believes she incorporated into her later mothering behavior was used to teach communication

in the workplace and how it impacted a participant in the class:

A woman came to me not too long ago and she said you have no idea about this, but I was in one of your classes. I teach classes from time to time. I was in one of your classes and you told a story about your son and she said, that week, my stepson was in trouble with the law or something. And I have thought about your story and I listened, something about how I learned to listen to my son. And she said I listened to him, and he started talking to us for the first time in his life. And I want you to know how you made it possible for me to have a relationship with person who is really significant and I didn't have that before. So, I mean, sometimes you just don't know, what you do. And I kind of want to walk in the world in a way that I can be as authentic as I can, just because, if that does anything, whether I know it or not, it is good.

There is evidence that BB is still working on becoming more fully present at work. She credits a workshop for managers as part of NTL training in preparation for a certificate in organizational development as helping her soften from being more intimidating, especially towards men:

This was something I learned more recently. People had said things about how I could be intimidating. But this was a real piece of work I did at that workshop. Not knowing that that was the work I would have to do. But that is what happened. Since then I have been perceived as a lot softer. And I still can be very firm, but a lot softer and less intimidating. So therefore more effective. But it came out in that workshop. The men were really like, they felt very intimidated and they acted all kinds of ways about it. That was the work that it turned out for me to do. So that is a specific thing I learned, there were other things as well.

Influence of Mothering on Management

BB has managed up to 21 people in the past. However, she is considered an individual contributor at this point, as she does not have anyone reporting directly to her. Instead she now provides leadership for a project which includes four team members and is involved doing organizational development work to improve the environment in the division for which she works.

When the researcher asked her to speak more about the parallels between mothering and management that she had mentioned earlier:

Well, the biggest, broadest parallel is that as a mother, what is the most important thing I have to give to my child? And when I got really clear about what that was about, that anchored me in everything I do. And the same is true at work. With all of these changes at work going on, one year I may be managing people, one year I might have a terrible boss and the next year I have a great boss. I know, things just change in the workplace so

much, to hold onto the core, how do I want to be treated, what is it that are my values that I want to act out with people and I think I learned that first as a mother.

Just as her relationship with her son, in some complex way, contributed to her emerging sense of

self, she credits her employees as assisting her in learning about managing more respectfully:

> I was very fortunate in having two people in particular who, one of them was very blunt and very outspoken and simply told me face to face what was up in how she felt. The other who was much more gentle and much more appreciative of my inexperience and though I was managing her, she was a far more mature about these topics. She was, her ability to hold, the values that she held, extended to me as well which was, be careful about other people's learning.

Another example of how "being fully present" in the workplace and perceived as being

transferred from mothering, BB describes a recent situation in which she was able to be authentic with

her superior who needed her "mothering emotion work" (Seery, 1996) regarding handling a difficult

experience.

> My boss is the senior vice president of human resources. And he is relatively new. He is a guy who gets anxious easily, overwhelmed with stuff and he called me into his office the other day, prior to a three hour meeting which I was going to design and facilitate with his direct reports and some other people. And he says I don't want to do this meeting. I hate three-hour meetings. Do we have to do this meeting? And he was completely discombobulated. And I looked at him and I felt like a "mother," this poor guy who was out of his mind with pressure and stress and he was about to trash this work that I had just prepared for and so it was like, I was ready to do this, so I was quite calm about the whole thing because I was actually fully prepared which I was very glad about so I wasn't anxious in the presence of his anxiety, so I just sat with him and I said, let us talk about what we want to do at the meeting and see if we can do it in less time. And he said, Okay. And what happened for me was that I cared about him because he was so anxious, even though I could have chosen any number of things, or could have felt any number of other reactions, and I think that is sometimes the mother in me, that says, this poor guy. It may just be the human being in me, but it felt very "mother" like. It felt very much like I just had helped this man and it wasn't about me or my project or the work I had just done or any of that. That, sometimes there is just caring is connected for me with mothering and that is what I felt, like I would feel if a kid was hurt or something, that you just set everything else aside and all of a sudden it is all about this poor anxious human being who has way more power over me, but suddenly, I had way more power over him. Just in that moment! (All laughing.)

And she continues:

> And I was, I had planned it, I had designed it and it was a big, a three hour meeting with all those people in management, and important thing for my standpoint, but it was all put aside just because of that he was being clearly vulnerable in a certain way. So caring for me is connected with the mothering and that is sometimes, I can do some of my best interventions, that was just a little one that was unplanned and just in the moment. But there it was, an opportunity and it was really linked to my mother self. If I hadn't had all that experience as a mother I may not have been totally comfortable in that place.

Since she learned about taking responsibility as a mother with her son, she is sensitive to her responsibility in her managerial role as well as both to her employees as well as to herself. Her difficulty is in being clear about her own needs is described below:

> Even though an employee may be willing to go there. I always think, what is my responsibility in this. I really need to step up to this and what is hardest for me personally, is to get clear about what I need, what I want, is that legitimate and how do I share that with somebody else and negotiate about it because if I am trying to accommodate their need in order to motivate them or to understand them, in order to be more compassionate around them, then what do I do with my own need. It is just a question of, am I willing to do that. And, I don't know if I am always good at it; it is a life long process.

Summary

Although BB reports that mothering brought many skills to her professional functioning, she also credits her experience with AA in teaching her how to listen. In addition, graduate school, NTL workshops, and psychotherapy also provided learning in how to be more "fully present." Her own alcoholism led to a more idealized perception that she was "fully present" to her son. Instead, her son confronted her about her lack of adequate mothering which began her recovery process which is ongoing. In an indirect way, then, mothering has been a transformational experience, but not in the way she perceived it to be. In addition, BB gives recognition to the motherhood constellation (Stern, 1994) which focuses on the mother's unconscious meaning making from her own experience of being mothered. Her case brings evidence that what she believes she brought from mothering to the workplace, "being fully present," is more of an ideal which she is still in the process of becoming. The

mothering experience for BB is a complex psychological system that indirectly interacts with her

background and workplace behavior in some important ways as both cause and effect.

GC

Coding GC

There were many contradictions in the data obtained from GC. Examples of these appear in the summary of findings in Chapters IV and V. A major category of "idealized perception" was more embedded in the data and became more evident when the researcher triangulated the data with the research professor and graduate students in the coding class. Based on this finding, GC's core category of "protecting" (see Appendix F) had to be defined as her "ideal" core category.

The ideal core category of "protecting" varied along the dimension of context which included her background, values, work contexts of management and organizational development consulting, training groups she attended, children she taught earlier in her career as well as mothering and her self. The other codes shown on the family tree can be related to protection as either a strategy, consequence, or causal or intervening condition. This then leads to the story line for GC from which the narrative was written.

Besides being a context of protection, her background wherein she protected her mother, was not protected as a child (a negative condition of protect) but learned to protect herself served as a causal condition of her need to protect. As a manager, she rescued staff, a consequence of protection. She expected loyalty from her staff (a consequence) but instead was abused (consequence and a negative state of protection). Her protection of executives via her consulting led to political power and visibility or impact (a consequence of her protection). She became quite intimate with her staff and colleagues (an outcome of protection). Her protection of people in a training group (context) also resulted in abuse (a consequence).

As a mother she bragged (strategy) about the success of her adult children (a self-protection) and her present friendship with them (consequence). She protected her children by fighting (strategy) for them when they acted out their anger at school. She protected her children by holding back in career

(strategy) and being a stay at home mother (strategy). She was not able to protect her daughter from the accident which caused GC much guilt (consequence) or her children from inadequate housekeepers. Instead, her children protected her by doing cooking and cleaning when they were adolescents. She claims she was good at perspective taking (a strategy) and patience (strategy) with her children, suggesting an idealized perception of her mothering. She claims she learned to trust (an outcome of protection) life from being a mother and that she kept her children safe (consequence of protect). In as much as the code words "fighting" (a strategy of protect), "trust" (a consequence of protect) and "safety" (a consequence of protect) appeared more often than most of the other codes, those words were added to GC's theme, "protecting by fighting for trust and safety." Clearly, GC was still evolving toward her idealized vision of protection across all contexts.

GC: "Protecting by Fighting for Trust and Safety"

GC is a 60-year-old married Caucasian mother of a 39-year-old married daughter, a 36-year-old married son and a single 31-year-old son. She has been employed as an internal organizational development consultant and manager of a counseling program for the past 17 years. GC's mothering, consulting, and management style are represented by the construct of "protecting by fighting for trust and safety." However, GC's reporting of her behavior in these three roles suggests that she had an idealized perception regarding her claim. Her childhood with a paranoid schizophrenic mother appears to have contributed to her replicating her early life within the three roles. Her narrative theme of "protection" appears to be related to her own experience with her schizophrenic mother. Her perception as to how mothering changed her and how the mothering experience informed her professional functioning is not supported by the stories of her actual functioning in the three roles and suggest more of an idealized perception toward which she is still evolving.

GC believed that her mothering experience brought positive influences to her organizational development consulting and management roles. However, she also experienced five years of psychotherapy, a two-year clinical program regarding family dynamics, NTL management training, as well as organizational development certificate classes which makes it difficult to differentiate her mothering experience from other adult learning experiences. In addition, these other adult learning experiences have functionally similar psychologics with each other as well as with the present expectations of mothering. This further confounds the process of differentiating the mothering experience from within this larger context. Her case suggests, however, the powerful influence of her "being-mothered" experience upon her own mothering.

Background

GC's mother was a paranoid schizophrenic who was not hospitalized until GC was 12 years of age at which time a boyfriend of her older sister realized that her mother was sick and needed care. This reality was probably a causal condition that led to her theme of "protection." In discussing her adolescence, GC remembers especially:

> My mother was always sick, physically ill and mentally ill. …There were times when we just weren't that well cared for. We had a large extended family. There were many people helping him (her father) maintain the family. The only reason she got hospitalized then was because my sister was dating someone who was studying clinical psychology and he came into the house and said, your mother is crazy. I remember him (her father) taking her to doctors, doctors coming to the house. I am sure I went to a psychiatrist with her. People in the 40's and 50's didn't know. And then L. came along and said, there is a sick lady and she got hospitalized involuntarily.

GC remembers having to protect and care for her mother and at the same time, she felt abandoned by her father who struggled to keep the family intact:

> She would get sick seasonally. In winter it was a bear in bed, almost all winter with me caring for her. I was about the only one who could get her to eat. And in the summer she would just go nuts. And then it was every other day. So you had to know when you could bring friends home. That is how I started my adolescence. And I took care of myself. And I always knew how to survive.

> In further discussion about her adolescence and the individuation process, she remembered:

> Well, I fought with my father because I never thought he loved me. I guess, I don't know. I guess I wanted more from him because I wasn't getting it from her. Our family was definitely polarized, it was me and my mother and my sister and my father. I thought he loved her (her sister) better; it wasn't the same.

> In discussing traits that she may have brought from mothering to her work:

> I probably always had the skill of perspective taking. If you grew up in the kind of home I grew up in you had to be aware of your environment and that was part of the survival skills.

One of the protective strategies she has used throughout her life is that of "fighting" for what she believes. According to GC, her mother was powerless within the family but encouraged GC to be assertive and to value this strategy:

> But I must tell you that my crazy mother loved me for that too. My mother, I have a memory of my mother, we lived in a semidetached house in the city and she was looking out the front window, and I was out on the stoop, with an old lady, and we were the landlords. She (the old lady) was trying to tell me what to do. And I told her that I didn't have to listen to her, as I was the landlord. What a nice thing for a 4-year-old to say to this lady. My mother, I look up to see mother beaming, because my mother could never say, unless she was crazy, that she could never take care of herself and say what needed to be said. She was so proud of the independent little girl, just like Pippi Longstocking. She really encouraged it. And when I do these things (fighting for what she wants), I am doing one for my mother. Really, no, I see her smiling. You go for it, take care of yourself kid. So, it (fighting) can be fun.

GC met her husband when she was 13 and found him to be very nurturing. She married him at 18 and had her first child at age 22. Being true to his promise that he would protect her from her mother, they moved away from her mother when she became pregnant with their first child. The marriage has endured assisted by individual and couples counseling.

Mothering as Transformation

Although GC had difficulty remembering what she was like before she had children and after she had children, she felt that it was a very defining experience:

> I am a very different person because I am a mother. I know that I am what I am because I have been a mother, but saying that, I was so young when I became a mother, I was married at 18 and a mother at 22, I was so young, I kinda of in a sense, grew up with my kids, so it is hard for me to remember what I was like before I was a mother. Yes, I really didn't and I think that was a defining moment for me, I may have not told you this, but when I brought my daughter home, I don't know how many weeks you had to stay in the house before you were allowed to go up stairs and go out and drive, maybe it was two weeks, I remember my husband watching her while I went to the supermarket and I am pushing this cart in G. and saying, I am a mother! I am a mother! I had to keep telling myself that I am a mother and I took that role, very, very seriously. But it was like I had to convince myself that I was that.

Because of her background of having to mother her own mother, good mothering was especially important to GC who decided to protect her children by being a "stay-at-home" mother until her youngest child was in school. She describes herself as a 1950's television mom. However, by her own description she reports having emotional outburst at her own children. When the researcher asked GC to describe herself as a mother she replied:

> I think I was a pretty good mother. It was very important to me. I yelled too much, I know I did, but they don't seem to remember that. R. (her husband) was there as my back up, when I yelled, he let me know that I was yelling too much. I don't even know what I was yelling about, I was a screamer. That is the only thing I can think of that I did wrong.

GC believes that through her mothering she came to trust "process" because most situations with her children turned out well despite the challenge of raising three very different individuals:

> I think, when you become a parent, especially a mother you learn to be flexible, learn to be patient, and you learn that things will work out okay. I learned to trust. I have always trusted my kids, I trust my staff. Actually my staff is like a bunch of kids. Ah, possibly the patience, it is all the things that you learn as a mom, you know, I feel sorry for people who don't have kids. That is life altering. It really is. It is the feeling that someone's life is more important than your own. There is nothing that you won't do. I find that people who don't have children to be narcissistic.

In reflecting on our first interview, GC added:

> And again, how do you experience success in the home; it is much easier to translate it into having faith in authenticity and honesty. My kids know what they saw was what they got. They always got the truth, they didn't always like it, but they knew they didn't have to figure me out, I told you. And I think it is very important to be authentic and honest as a role model, I was a very honest and authentic mother and I am an honest and authentic therapist and OD person.

She related many stories about her children's angry behavior and her responses:

> I was fiercely protective of them. I would defend them against any thing and they knew that. If D. got in trouble at school for throwing French fries, I would go and argue with the principal, so what is so terrible about throwing French fries?

> Especially these women, they fought a lot, so what did he do. He would do like putting tacks on her chair, or killing the plants in her room, day by day he was putting something into her plants. (Laughing). B. Well, he is a character and a half.

C (her daughter) had temper tantrums when she was a little girl until she was about 4. When she turned 5 she was the sweetest most wonderful person in the world. And I used to say where did all that anger go? I was afraid, what did I do? She expressed all this anger before and then it disappeared.

GC continues:

I needed to keep my children safe, which was very important. Emotionally safe. I messed-up one physically. I still have a lot of guilt about C's (her daughter) accident (her daughter was hit by a truck while crossing the street. GC had decided not to walk her daughter across that street and was in the car watching when this happened.)

And about her son:

He is a sweet little boy (her oldest son) who appeared to be compliant, but he is the one who got in trouble in school. He is the one that was throwing the French fries. He was the one that did his adolescent pranks. And he is the one who was in the emergency room all the time.

GC had difficulty firing housekeepers that her children did not like. The children solved this

issue by urging her to let them take care of meals and cleaning which they did during their adolescence.

The stories reported above suggest beliefs about her mothering represent more of an idealized perception

as compared with the stories of her actual mothering behavior.

Mothering Adult Children

GC protects herself from any thought that she was not a good mother by bragging about the

successes of her children as adults and the friendly relationship she has with them:

B (her son) is on the phone a lot. My kids are dispersed. I have a daughter here with a family. My oldest is a daughter who has twins, she lives here in XYZ. She is here and we have a very good relationship. My next child lives in Europe where he lives with his wife and almost two-year-old daughter and they are coming back very soon. But the contact is great. With e-mail and phones and airplanes, we see them a lot and they will be coming back. B lives in XYZ and we have seen a lot of him. He phones constantly, e-mails constantly. Probably between e-mails and phone it is almost daily. D. in Europe, several times a week. My daughter-in-law is fantastic about sending me e-mail photographs that cheers me up. Or sometimes the baby will get on the phone and leave a message. We talk to them personally at least once a week and e mails through out the week. My daughter C is here and catch as catch can, her life is becoming more complicated as the kids get older but daily contact too, but there is not the pressure for daily contact. I probably hear from her less than the others. I think we have wonderful children. We feel like that is our

proudest achievement, is a nice family, and we really do. And my son-in-law who lives here was offered a job in New England and one of the considerations that led to him not taking it, he likes his life here, he likes knowing we are here for backup. We don't see a whole lot of them. They used to come over every weekend, Sunday dinner, but it is not possible for them or for us anymore, but knowing that we are.

Later when I asked her to describe herself as a mother now she added:

Now I am their friend, advisor, we are colleagues, ah; I don't hesitate to go to B. for advice. D. I will go to for financial advice. Ah, now he is not always right, and I lost a lot of money in the stock market because of him, laughing, but I trust D. with those kinds of things. B (her youngest unmarried son), as I said, is much more of a soul mate. C (daughter) is my buddy, my friend.

In further discussing her youngest son whom she considers as a soul mate:

B is very private, very, very private. The only way we knew that he was going with a girl, is when C (her daughter) would intercept a phone call. He was very private. He didn't want anyone to know his business. He knew if the others knew they would tell me, so, he didn't want us to know anything. We didn't know about this woman in his life, we didn't know about her for how long. Again, we found out as C. (her daughter) called and she (the girlfriend) answered.

Mothering and Adult Development

GC has a bachelor's degree in education as well as masters in education specializing in

counseling and personnel services. She has a wide range of professional certifications including several

from the National Training Laboratory, one of which is focused on organizational development and

included a sensitivity training group for managers. She also obtained a certificate in Organizational

Development in 1995 from a local university and completed a certificate in Psychoanalytic and Object

Relations Family and Marital Therapy in 1994 (GC resume, 2002). She believed that these adult

learning experiences assisted her in being able to understand her anger during her children's earlier

years as well as the working through of her own marital issues. She and her husband worked on their

individual individuation process, which had been truncated by having married at such a young age. This

work was also aided by her individual psychotherapy for a period of five years during the 1990's. As

stated previously, GC's mothering experience has been entwined with many other psychologically focused adult learning endeavors that are difficult to disentangle from mothering.

Influence of Mothering on Organizational Development Consulting

Although the above adult learning experiences make it difficult to separate out specifically what mothering brought to the workplace, GC believed that the mothering experience over the long haul has taught her to have faith in the organizational development process:

> I have a strong faith in the process in OD. And I think being a mother has helped me have that kind of faith in the process especially since they (children) are successful now. I have learned, we can make mistakes. We make mistakes, the kids make mistakes, and that is okay. In the end, it will be if you just keep going, it will come out okay. I truly do believe that that is what has given me faith in the process.

However, instead of humanizing the workplace, which is a goal of organizational development, GC's reported behavior in this role suggests that her beliefs in this sphere represent a more idealized perception:

> And while doing that, I protected folks and the folks that just came in, they knew, like with my kid, don't mess with me. I am very easy going and very accommodating but if you mess with me, I am going to fight. And XYZ found out that I am a fighter. They expected me to roll over and play dead and let them, it was like an aggressive corporate takeover. I built this place and you are not having it. So far (knocks on desk with fist) I am not saying I am going to win totally but so far I have been able to give them 6 months of heartache and I love it. Who knows what the future is going to be? They are afraid of me. And I love it. (Laughing.)

And relating what a colleague told her recently:

> People are afraid of you. (Laughing.) He says you don't always behave in ways that people expect you to behave. Oh, and you mean that I defend my position. And you know, I am no fool, I know that I get away with what I get away with because I have friends in high places, but why do I have those friends in high places, because I have been doing a damn good job for 26 years, you know, I have earned the respect of people in very high places in this department, they have been my clients, they have been my colleagues. I have seen them in XYZ, I have seen them in supervisor management classes, and they call me in when they have problems.

Continuing to report her consulting behavior:

I love the politics, I love the power, it turns me on!

Yet, GC believes that the mothering experience also led her to being more collaborative in her organizational development work:

I think OD is a collaborative way of working with people, you work in a collaborative way with people who are going to be impacted and that is also the way I manage my staff. Much more of a collaborative relationship. And if I go back to being a mother, I was probably that way as well, there isn't such a great age difference. I mean, I was always the parent, I wasn't their friend, I was the parent. But it was much more of a collaborative relationship, and to go back to your perspective taking, I am thinking, without knowing that was what I was doing, I was always putting myself in their shoes, it was very hard for me to not, to think what it must be like for them, my saying no to something, or not wanting to put myself out for them about something. So those are my great thoughts about it.

GC is often concerned about her team's visibility while doing organizational development work:

We just pulled off something big, last week, making a new leadership person look very good, and it was hairy. A lot of things were happening at the last minute. Lots of decisions were made at the last minute. High levels, high exposure. The possibility of looking bad was horrible. But we pulled it off and it was great.

A few months after our individual interviews, the focus group of the co-researchers met in GC's office. GC reported that her department was about to be dismantled and she hoped she would be working in the area of managing change within the larger agency. GC stressed that being a mother of three children, each of which had a different temperament from the moment of birth, gave her a belief in the importance of individual differences which is so important in the field of organizational development as well as management. However, her reported behavior above suggests that her beliefs are a more idealized perception regarding her claim.

Her constant need to "protect by fighting for trust and safety" is seen again in the narrative below:

Again, I was the safety person in that group. I didn't always agree with what, I was probably a threat to some of the trainers; there was a different trainer each month. There

was one person coordinating it, at some level they were threatened by my experience, but not that I did anything, it was just that what I brought to it…they were doing a feedback experience, I can't remember how it was designed, I didn't like it and I voiced objection to it, and I didn't feel like it was a safe way. And in the beginning we were giving each other feedback. I just didn't like the design at all and ah I was right. My friend immediately let me know that her friend had been really hurt. I can't remember but she came to me and let me know what had gone on. Again, I am always the safety person and then the group projected onto me all the hurt and anger and I had to be the one to fight the authorities and tell them that they had messed up, look at what you did. I told you, I fight for my kids at school, I fought for those kids in my class (when she taught emotionally disturbed children), you university people, you messed up, I told you, and you were going to mess-up. Ah, I will fight for whatever I believe in.

Influence of Mothering on Management

GC perceives that protecting her staff from re-organization is similar to mothering:

But I am much more concerned about my staff right now, so this is where the mothering piece comes in. I have two counselors, one of whom escaped from XYZ to come to work for me cause he wanted to work in this kind of program and will never go back to work for XYZ. I am really worrying about him and protecting him and his job.

Likewise, she often refers to her staff as a family that has rather intimate relationships with each

other. However, she is aware that the two families are different. On the other hand, when there is

synergy in how the employees work together, she is reminded of her children:

I can honestly say that I look at my staff very much as a family and even though they might not be, I am not old enough to be their mother. I think of them pretty much that way. I mean, I look at the individual differences and I try to give each of them positive reinforcement. I do all the nurturing. It is not always appreciated. It is very different. It isn't as nice as it is in a family. This family here is not as healthy as my family back home (her nuclear family). And that was hard for me to realize cause I kept thinking I treated my children a certain way and everything worked out okay, including the challenges. I treat these people the same way and it doesn't always work out the same. And it took me a while to realize that they didn't have those healthy earlier relationships, they are bringing their baggage to the workplace and a lot of that gets acted out here and I really don't have control over.

She continues:

Okay, when I think about managing, I told you, I hire very creative individuals and bright people. One of the pleasures of working with them, is when we had a staff meeting, we are sitting, the ideas, I just sit here and feel tremendous pride. That to me is a real

pleasure. Getting them together and watching them work together cooperatively and that is very similar to the feelings I had when my kids were getting along.

But like mothering, she is aware of the competition of her staff for her attention and resources as well as performance ratings. However, again, she recreates her "family of origin" at work when she allows employees to abuse her and accommodates their lack of loyalty to her. She, as well as her husband, is critical of her management style. The following passage also suggests that she is aware of her need for further growth as a manager:

> And I am doing something wrong. I know I am doing something wrong. My husband tells me all the time, you are not, I am not establishing that I am the person in charge. I am letting them do this to me. So that is the frustrating part of management. I don't enjoy it, managing. I really don't. The reason I do it is cause I don't want to be managed by one of them. (Laughing.)

Summary

GC's perception of her mothering and its influence on the work roles of organizational development consulting and management are not supported by the data regarding her self-reported behavior in these three roles. She believed mothering changed her by making her more "process" (going with the flow) focused and adapting to the individual differences between her three children. Instead, she reported that she was impatient and angry when her children were younger and she also defended what appeared to be their angry behavior with school personnel. The belief that she had a "soul-mate" relationship with her youngest adult son was contradicted by the fact that he reportedly would not share information about his romantic life with her.

GC believed that she used collaboration in her consulting work but her reported behavior, as discussed previously, suggests her beliefs represent more of an idealized perception. She also believed that she "protected" her staff and department as a manager, yet her reported behavior offers some evidence that her beliefs in this are, as well, are more of an idealized perception toward which she is still evolving.

In addition, due to the multiple impact of other adult learning experiences in the educational, relational, and psychotherapeutic realm as well as her own "being -mothered" experience, the contribution of mothering to workplace behavior remains complex and indirect. It appears that GC's self-report as to how she mothered her own children, how she does her consulting and managerial work, as well as that mothering transformed her from that young girl who mothered her schizophrenic mother are not consistent with her beliefs. Rather, what she perceives about her mothering and its impact on her consulting and management experience represents more her idealized perception. GC's case represents an example of the importance of what the "being-mothered experience" may have on the mothering role which may lend credibility to Stern's (1994) findings regarding the influence of the motherhood constellation.

SC

Coding SC

SC's core category "bringing a caring stance" varied along the context of her background, values, work contexts of organizational development consulting and management, and mothering as shown on her Family Tree (see Appendix G). SC's background offered a caring experience despite having been raised with six other children. This was then perhaps a causal condition for her caring behavior across the other contexts.

SC's values represent strategies of caring for self such as balancing mental and physical health, caring for the world as evidenced in her cross cultural work projects mostly focused on maternal and child health, and caring for extended family. Responsibility and self-discipline are also strategies of caring for self and others.

Within the context of mothering, caring strategies included ownership of her over-structured way of being, self awareness, nurturing, caring for self and fetus during her first pregnancy, and prioritizing her daughters over work during certain times of their development. Being vulnerable regarding her relationship with her daughters is a consequence of caring. The intervening condition of her transformation by her relationship with her youngest daughter occurred because she cared for this daughter who challenged her. She called parenting an opportunity to behold (a caring definition) and shared the responsibility for it with her husband in a partnership, which is a strategy of caring. Her husband's career field is psychotherapy, a caring profession. She regretted not being able to be fully immersed (her definition of a caring mothering strategy) with her daughters because she always worked full time.

SC believed she brought a caring stance to her consulting role especially after being challenged by her relationship with her youngest daughter. This included caring process strategies such as letting

go, the courage to confront oneself, to own one's projections onto others, to reserve judgment, and to care for self by obtaining energy from volunteer experiences with children that she then brought to her work.

Within the managerial context, SC spent much of her time in caring relational process strategies aimed at producing results from her projects and empowering (a caring strategy) the people she supervised. She delegated whenever possible in order to give responsibility to her staff. She believed in a servant-type leadership strategy, which consumed time (a caring intervening condition resource) and accepted the pain involved, a consequence of caring, in developing others, which is another caring strategy. She showed that she valued (a caring strategy) the context work that her staff did which is often less valued, or invisible, than process focused work. She brought a sense of her credibility (self-care as well as a consequence of caring) to her management work. The more invisible caring-for-the-project strategies of coordination, negotiation, and awareness of the dependent-independent conflicts of the project leaders who used her consultation were evident.

Overall, SC's core category of "bringing a caring stance" was verified by her most recent job description of bringing "care" to an engineering firm.

SC: "Bringing a Caring Stance"

SC is a 52-year-old married Caucasian mother of a single adult daughter, age 19, currently attending college and an adolescent daughter aged 16 who resides with her but who was living in Australia as an exchange student during the time of our interviews. At the time of our interviews, SC was a project manager for a small women-owned business which contracts with the federal government. Later, during the focus group, SC described herself as being currently employed as an internal organizational development consultant to an engineering firm who hired her to create a more "caring" atmosphere in the workplace. SC's mothering, consulting, and management style is represented by the construct of "bringing a caring stance."

Background

SC is appreciative of her parents' caring and how each of the seven children in her family of origin were protected and loved. In describing her childhood home:

> I remember my sister when she got glasses. She was nearsighted and at some point when we were fussing with one another, and going at it with one another, and I said something about her being blind as a bat. And my father who was letting us fuss with one another just put a stop to the conversation and he took me aside and he said, "She cannot help it. I don't want you ever to talk to someone like that." I felt whoa. And my sister sitting over there grinning but that I felt then that home was a safe place and nobody is going to trespass on you and you learned not to trespass on others (referring here to her father's message to her). I always felt loved, secure.

However, SC did not appreciate how difficult it was to raise seven children and the need to organize most events such as where to sit in the car or a specific seat at dinner. To this day she relishes being able to sit where she pleases at workshops or classes. She felt confined by the boundaries that were needed to raise seven children which resulted in less freedom of choice. SC felt she tested the rules to some degree but she was grounded for late hours even when she was in college as she lived at home. To escape from this overly structured setting, she managed to organize a year abroad for herself during her college years where she could live, not one of seven, and be able to experiment with alcohol, hours,

and how not to get caught. However, by her own admission, she is an overly structured mother, a trait that might be traced to the lessons learned within her family of origin wherein dealing with seven children necessitated much organization.

Even though she was perhaps an overly structured parent, SC chose a husband who is professionally caring, a psychotherapist with whom she could partner. She felt she received support from him in dealing with difficult work situations. In discussing their parenting however, it appeared that he served as her backup but that she assumed the primary responsibility for parenting as well as at times being the primary wage earner when her husband was a student and in the process of a career change. When we were discussing the definition of a good marital partner:

> Somebody who does not assume that his needs predominate either in terms of demands he is going to make on you in terms of family or his career, not being the dominant one. It is really important to have a partnership there.

She formed partnerships with her children's caregivers as well as her husband to provide the best quality of family life, which included caring for extended family members. However when the researcher asked SC to talk about the various caregivers for her children, she indicated how difficult it was to share her children with others:

> We had the same caregiver for 6 years who now comes to take care of our dog when we need her. This was not someone I was competing with. We were not trying to see whom the child loves best. I had to get over the fact that my child had a loving relationship with this person. Those things were not easy to do. But we were feeling lucky that we had someone whom would work with us on whatever.

Mothering As Transformation

SC valued the caring of her supervisor during her first pregnancy. Due to medical complications she had to retreat to bed for several months to protect that pregnancy:

> Ah, and that will give you call as to pause and say, whoa, this is pretty significant, this is serious, this really put me in touch with how much I really wanted the baby and how much I wanted to be a mother.

She was grateful for a flexible work schedule, which also allowed her to bring her baby to work. Flexibility in the workplace was absolutely crucial when her children were young. And then her husband became unemployed and decided to return to school, so she had to work full time before she wanted to. Her husband then was able to share in more of the child care at that time. She and her husband have been a team over the years in being responsible for family responsibilities, although it appeared that she carried the major responsibility for her daughters when she referred to the fact that her husband was available to pick up the slack in areas such as chauffeuring their daughters to their activities.

Strategies used in the caring process as a parent include providing structure, moral and technical support with school work, making children's extracurricular activities a priority, and multi-tasking at work and home to make sure neither domain is neglected.

When the researcher asked her if she could separate what parenting brought to her work versus the process of adult development, she was adamant that parenting had changed her dramatically:

> I just don't see that I would be the same person. Therefore not the same person at work or at home. Ah, I can't prove that uh, but it, there is something about the, you can have certain intense relationships, you can have intense nurturing relationships that are probably the equivalent to parenting, you are a caretaker for someone who is completely dependent on you or you are the kind of a person that takes complete responsibility for someone else's well being, for what ever reason. It is a stance, and it is to me and certainly in OD, there is just the experience of having a stance of some sort, it just having been in that place, I have a different perspective than I would, had I not stood in that place or taken on those responsibilities, ah, or opportunities is how I should look at them. I think that ah, I have a child who is definitely one who slowed me down as she insisted on smelling the roses, literally.

This process is discussed at greater length under the organizational development heading. SC felt that one of the consequences of being a caring mother is the vulnerability she feels in her relationship with her daughters and the emotional pain she suffers at times. During our interviews she was particularly concerned about her youngest daughter's safety, who was in Australia as an exchange student for six months. She shared that as she felt the mother of the Australian household was not as

structured as herself particularly with regard to curfews, her daughter was having to make more decisions on her own regarding her activities.

When the researcher asked her to describe herself as a mother, her response described portions of *Webster's College Dictionary* (1991) definition of caring, that is, a combination of worry, concern, protection and providing a holding place:

> I think, vulnerable, probably is the most important thing I discovered being a mother, that incredible vulnerability to emotional pain. These little beings that stir, that I am terribly concerned about. My children put it as nicely as they can, they consider me as being too much of a worrywart and you know, certainly, loving. I feel compelled to instruct, to share whatever the wisdom I gained with them, and probably bringing along stuff from my parents, bringing very high expectations for them. Trying to provide a pretty strong structure, but not, try not to have that be unreasonable. Ah, trying to be supportive of their growth and development, exploration, trying their wings in various capacities, ah, trying to provide a safe place where they can, that unconditional place, they always have a place to come home to. That at least here it is okay to cry. They may not feel safe or comfortable to do it elsewhere that is always an option, but it is also a place to bring your happiness, not just your sadness.

Mothering Adult Children

At the time of our interviews, SC's oldest daughter was in her first year of college. In talking about her oldest daughter's adolescence and the mothering emotion work that she did during that time:

> And at the same time they are getting ready to be independent and so they are incredibly needy and at the same time resentful of being needy and that is so emotionally draining ah, so I would say that that was, I would not call that my most effective time as a professional. I was very aware. Happily, I was in a fairly good place at work where I had put in a lot of energy early on. I could do a good enough job, not my best job, absolutely not my best work in doing OD work.

She talks more about some decision points that she faced in doing the emotion work of mothering which combines the worry, concern, and protection of caring:

> She (her 19-year-old daughter) was very driven about getting her good grades in high school and working really hard, but would have let things go, as a kid might, till the last minute. And, so you are there at 11:30 at night and she's got some paper and the computer won't work and all of sudden you find yourself driving with this kid, not that she isn't capable of driving as she can drive, but she emotionally, because you know, you have that awful choice between, is this a time she has to suffer her consequences. Having

let things go to the last minute. Or saying, no she has put too much into it, so if it means we are up at midnight at Kinko's and she is printing out the paper because the printer at home won't work, that's exactly what we did.

SC still supports the academic work of her college age daughter via e-mail.

Mothering and Adult Development

Mothering is but one experience that impacts development in adulthood. Educational and work experiences also serve to shape personality in complex ways. SC's academic training includes a Master's Degree focused on Latin American Studies and Economic Development from a major university specializing in international studies. She has also been involved in continuing professional education in organizational development, consulting, adult training, strategic planning and financial management. She is fluent in Spanish.

SC's past and present employment experiences repeat her caring theme. Much of her employment experiences have been about "caring for the world" through being employed by governmental agencies responsible for international development as well as the Peace Corps. Many of the projects she has managed have included those concerned with maternal health in foreign countries. In her own words:

I am pretty caring and passionate about the people that I work with and about the work that I do.

When her children were in elementary school she and her husband decided to improve their quality of life by moving to a foreign country for four years which increased family time and provided a slower pace of living. Live-in childcare was more feasible, her husband was able to spend more time with the children due to his work schedule and she was in closer proximity to her children's activities. Her only regret was that she envied her husband's time with the children. In fact, early on she considered working part-time but family finances and her husband's career change necessitated that she be the major breadwinner. She talks about her regret with regard to her mothering because of work:

A piece of life that I have not had (is) that experience of being fully focused on (my children)…There were times when I felt jealous of my husband's availability…having more access to the kids than I did.

In talking about that time, she still was very actively mothering:

As she (live-in child care person) was 19, it was like acquiring another child, so she was clearly helper. My husband and I were very active parents. What I remember about those years was putting a high premium on family time. There were times in the midst of my children's growing up years when I was painfully aware of having gotten on the slower track professionally.

Influence of Mothering on Organizational Development Consulting

SC's mothering theme of "caring" is very evident in her current consulting work. In discussing

her present position which is different than the position she had at the time of our initial interview, SC

shares in the co-researchers' focus group:

This is a group of people who are you know, very bright, very high functioning, very, very, "T" in the way they operate and just were in a pretty painful place. I think, they just did not have a, they were just kinda of at one another too much. There was too much lack of caring in their environment. I was recruited into the job by the guy who had the job previously, and that is sort of what he knew about me and I ah, I interviewed with people for the job, they were pretty quick to share the kind of pain they were having and what the hope they had for the change in leadership, etc. It was very clear to me what that was, so I mean it is very easy when you feel that, it is like, it is a good opportunity, but I felt pretty comfortable being exactly who I was, comfortable being because I heard all over the place that that was what they wanted and needed. Maybe not on a daily basis, but laughing, but in certain circumstances.

SC continues after she was asked about the strategies she uses in her current position:

Well, coaching and team building stuff. Um, and again, as a facilitator doing a lot of that, just sharing with folks how I am responding so people get a little bit braver to either do it themselves but at least normalize that what is going on, is you know, something. And, then just trying to inject a little bit more humanity, I was joking about finding chocolate on my table. Such little things that humanize a work environment. It is something we can do on the job. It is an okay place to come and eat. There are lots of things about how I do business that are just deliberate in a lot of ways, but are genuine to me, but I am also paying attention to just what is needed.

And she herself feels that the main effect of being a mother on her professional role is the stance that she takes which is one of caring. In discussing how her stance of caring comes from the mothering experience, she was asked how her younger daughter slowed her down, SC added:

> We don't have to accomplish. We have to experience the moment. Enjoy the fresh air. Let's go for a walk. Does it really matter if certain things don't get done? Finished? Just because you had a plan in your head that things have to be done.

The researcher asked if her daughter actually said these kinds of things to her:

> Yeah, as a little tot. That was always her approach. Let us just be right here and now. So for me, it is not just the act of parenting but the opportunity that is presented. And the consequences of making the choice of not doing that and then choices you live with now.

In sharing her thoughts about what other mothering activities were helpful in doing organizational development, SC replies:

> Yes that (letting go) is a really big one. Yeah, for me it was really big because when I was fortunate enough while I was at Peace Corps, being able to do some work with Harrison Owen and become familiar with open space, that was very, very powerful in that sense and just getting. And to me, it is not just the letting go but it is providing the right amount of structure and I think that is a lesson that goes, came from parenting, goes back to parenting, ah, is just that structure can be supportive and without structure, you know, it can be utter chaos or disaster but that will probably more often than not, I tend to err on the side of over structure. . You know, and whether it is your kid's summer and you have them over programmed or whatever it is and so just carrying that lesson in terms of just what is the appropriate amount of structure to provide this group or this situation in order to get it done. And when is it me. And, as a parent you ask yourself, am I doing this for my kid or am I doing it for me? Ah, in this situation, trying to bring in this self-awareness. And sometimes you do it anyway, but you own it and you say, we are doing it this way because I need it to be done this way. (Laughing.) Because of my needs for comfort or whatever need to know that things are okay. I have tried to do this with my kids to just say, curfew is for me. This is not about you. This is about me. Ah, you carry that over into your work and sometimes, we are doing the work this way because, that is the way I can be most effective. Yes, ah. I do think that, and I don't know how relevant it is to OD but the multitasking, the broader system is a very congruent experience. You are staying attuned to multiple things. You can carry multiple agendas. Ah. My experience is that women who are mothers seem to be naturally better at that. Yet, I think it is a critically important OD skill.

Perhaps the greatest contribution of mothering to doing organizational development consulting work was SC's becoming more process oriented, again, due to her relationship with her younger daughter:

> Well, it made me more sensitive to the journey rather than to the end. The journey. I think that is quite relevant to work in OD. It isn't that one doesn't focus on process, but sometimes process can be pretty mechanical and so paying attention to some of the details, ah, how people are feeling, how they are responding when their attention is elsewhere. Ah, checking in with people when there seems to be disconnects going on, that kind of thing. Rather than just, let us keep moving, and the other things are just distractions, a greater weight to what at first blush may seem like distractions.

When the researcher wondered if finding out what is going on underneath is part of process, SC replied:

> Yes, yes. But I think that, at least my experience with a number of folks is that process becomes a little mechanical. Ah, that there is a way of going about it, it becomes a design rather than a way of attending to people. I think, to me, it is more along the lines, I got interested in, maybe not all because of K. (her youngest daughter) but I got interested in Gestalt, the use of self-more.

When the researcher asked if she could expound on that point she replied:

> Ah, I think, there is a certain courage that comes with, that's validated by having someone, again, something that is off message, off the topic, that suddenly becomes important and therefore, at some point along the way, I picked up some ability to have courage around that, if there was something going on, if I couldn't name the discomfort, I could acknowledge my own discomfort with something and ah, that and that was genuine. That there is a, maybe it is more the, being more comfortable with that, if there is something not right, I don't have to take responsibility for fixing it, even for naming it, I just bring it up and that in and of itself is appropriate use of self, whereas earlier in my career I might have noted and felt the same thing but thought I better figure this out and do something. Ah, rather than just saying, it is enough for me, here and now, to just acknowledge what is going on but not take responsibility for that. Being present in the now in the moment. And I think of her (her daughter) as a very in the moment kind of person that she is both very perceptive and in the moment.

Earlier she had shared an example of the above as well as how the experience of childbirth and parenting was re-experienced during a training project:

> Oh, gosh, probably some of these, pause, doing some big events we have put on when I worked at Peace Corps, ah putting on some big training event and ah again the amount of

time, the amount of time it took to put every thing together and then to have it all come together, probably the thing that came closest to me and again, I think for me there is an epiphany thing that is related to child birth, I had image of being a mother and there would be this little being and that I would be, pretty much in control of that being, ah, and it just was never that way.

And SC continues:

And I think that was really helpful thing to realize because it gave me a place to go with, as a person, I did stand up training. I did training in management and worked with some partners that were wonderful and were just very rigorous about being extremely well prepared and having things very well thought through. Ah, and then there were times you can do all that but you just have to let it go as it is not the right thing at the right time for the group of people you are working with.

SC goes on:

Ah, and I think there is just something about reading the parenting books, the ah, being knowledgeable about child development, ah, thinking through what you want to do with or for your child, whatever, but somehow, doing all that, yet being in the moment, and being tuned into what the child seems to need.

SC continues discussing the "letting go" process:

And that is the kind of thing that hit me in doing training. I can remember very much having a training session totally prepared; it was a really good one. Yes, a group that was just, they were going through some conflict and dissatisfaction etc. And no matter how good the stuff I had, they were in no place to hear it. And with the help of another, more experienced trainer, just questioning, saying how do you think it is going to go, what do you think might happen. Do you think there is something that would be more effective? I remember really totally letting it go and doing something with them that was more in tune with letting them kind of get in touch with what they were feeling and needed to do right there at that moment even though it didn't advance this content agenda that we had. You know, and recognizing later on that when they were ready for that, and it wasn't even my turn anymore, but I had gotten them to a point where they were more ready to work again, and that was more important than whatever the content was that I was going to give and in fact, they could pick up that stuff from whoever they were dealing with the next point when they were ready to the work of it.

In discussing other organizational development functions, SC experiences the invisibility of

relational practice aimed at project maintenance in the workplace:

Just bringing different groups together around a topic and seeing you know, usually around, can we come up with agreements, with agendas, that sort of thing? I think that

what is, ah, kind of striking, I mean one of the awful things of course is the invisibility often of such work.

Influence of Mothering on Management

SC's mothering theme of "caring" is evident in her management style which includes examples

of mothering emotion work aimed at empowering the ego of employees. For SC as a manager, her

caring is done through the strategy of coaching:

> I was really playing a very strong coaching role because I had a staff person who was very, very good at strategic planning and facilitation, and is not an OD professional, does not identify herself as such, but has some real strong, but doesn't have a lot of self-esteem around it, so, on a typical day for me would be, sitting, being available to her as she is thinking through designs, often working with her and a client together, ah, you know, in again, in a role that I made sure she stayed in front and center, and I was in the background and you know, but that she felt that she had all the support she could get.

Her mothering theme of "caring" was also demonstrated through the maternal goal of protection

and maternal strategies of "modeling" a caring and flexible work schedule. In describing a typical

workweek, SC offered:

> But also, then trying to, not model or encourage people to work really long days. There were events, for example, in the safe motherhood, maternal health, where, in the days, just before the event, we work crazy hours, and work weekends but that was not a typical pattern. I was really trying to make sure that we were working pretty sane days which to me meant closer to 9 hours rather than 10 or 11 and that it was perfectly okay for people, if they put in 40 hours that was fine and ah, so that was something that was pretty important to me and have some flexibility around that. So have people organize our work so that people could work from home if there was a need to do that and people could work slightly different hours that other people and that we would try to have some coverage for one another.

Her caring management style is to delegate thereby further empowering her staff:

> Ah, had to do, one of the things I found out about working for a small business was that, which was a little surprising for me, was that the strong sense of hierarchy in a small business and very little delegation, so that as the project director, I had to sign off on everything, and they expected that I knew everything, so that I, I do believe in overview, but my management style is really delegator and ah, I had some staff too who were used to that style and who were used to signatories authority and that wasn't possible in this situation, so that has been a difficult thing.

When the researcher asked her to describe some difficult management situations her example illustrated the complexity of relational practice (which is similar to mothering emotion work), her sensitivity to the issues involved, and how her attempt to manage in a caring way resulted in some emotional pain for her:

> I had a management situation in which I was, I inherited, I was part of a group and our boss left and because I was senior in terms of grade, not in terms of age, longevity, but my grade level in the government, so I was made the temporary in charge of the office, and two things happened. There was a recently arrived employee who had not been performing well and one of the first things I found out was that our boss had her on a formal program, the government has to be formally notified if you have a performance issue and she was on probation, so I had this kind of very structured. And it was difficult as she was a woman about my same age, African-American who had a real strong chip on her shoulder and I had another woman in the office whom I had worked with a lot, she was quite a bit older than I was and ah, was superb in her work, she was French by birth and very forthright and put what she thought out on the table and had very high expectations about her own performance and her people's performance and these two women could not get along at all.

And she came to realize the amount of time that was necessary to develop a caring relationship in the management process:

> So in addition to one having the performance issue, I had this conflict situation between these two employees, one of whom I felt close to and one of them that I did not know very well. Ah, and just a boss, the next level up just wanted me to manage these two and not cause a lot of trouble for her and not really knowing what to do, discovering how difficult it was to even sit down and negotiate a civil conversation between the two, but just, in some ways I guess, one trying to take a lot of time, I was impressed about how time consuming this was. It didn't feel like productive work, and it was a really good lesson in management that those are the things that you just have to give it so much time cause the only way I was going to get anywhere with the woman I didn't know well was to spend a lot of time with her and let her get to know me, not to be threatened by me, have her understand that I was not out to get her, that I was really interested in helping her in making success, and indeed, as it unfolded, one that which is not untypical, is she had a lot of pressures going on in her personal life but because she didn't trust us, she couldn't share that kind of stuff with us. But as she got to know me a little bit, just again, there is unending amounts of time being available to listen, I got to know some of that, but it wasn't the kind of thing that I could share with other people because it was pretty personal. Ah, but at least it gave me a picture of her that was a little bit different. As I said, I knew this other woman and tried to push her a little bit in terms of her own values and things to give an opportunity to this woman. It was several, not always pleasant and not always successful sessions of just trying to get the two of them to talk very concretely

about what it was that bothered one about the other and trying to negotiate some solution and see if we could stick to it, and some of them would stick and some of them wouldn't. Just very, very, difficult.

When the researcher asked about the outcome for the woman on probation she replied:

Well, that was, ended up to be a wonderful story because she got successfully off probation and really, and she gave me a lot of credit which I didn't feel like I deserved. I ran into her a few years later, shortly thereafter I went off to Guatemala when I came back she had moved into a different role, doing some career advancement, but she felt I had been the first person who gave her a break and she gave me a lot of credit, and again, it is situations that it was the right thing to do, there were not a whole lot of other choices. I certainly did not identify that I had done anything very clever or smart, or, and that's it I guess. I had read all these books about conflict-resolution, whatever, thinking there is some magical thing I can do or be. No, it was just sloppy, and it was messy, and it was time consuming and painful all round. It never was easy and at times if felt like it was costing something in terms of my relationship with the other woman, you know, you had some downs before you came up again. So you pick up a few battle scars.

Summary

SC is courageous to confront and negotiate when necessary and takes ownership of choices and consequences. She tries to minimize negative strategies such as projection and being judgmental which runs counter to caring. She cares for her staff by being concerned about their recognition and empowerment especially when they are doing "process" versus content type work:

Trying to, making sure that people understood that this (process work) was of equal value. I had some disparity in terms of people getting recognition for what was being done.

She earns "battle scars" (emotional pain) from work situations that have been difficult, both in management and internal consulting. However, she also discusses the carryover energy that she receives from community projects with children done on a volunteer basis and applied to her work with adults:

My role was to be a facilitator of children and it was just really nice to get that kind of energy, and just be reminded of human potential for creativity.

Other outcomes of caring are the emergence of the dependence/independence angst of employees whom she manages, mentors and coaches. She references behavior on the part of employees or clients who portray their own dependence/independence struggles similar to that of her oldest daughter:

> (When talking about consulting clients) We are really not trying to create a dependent relationship. They may say thank you very much but we do not need you anymore. And then later …asking for help to pull something out of the fire at the last minute. Being of assistance, not taking responsibility, you know, walking that fine line between taking ownership or responsibility for things.

Although the researcher experienced SC as being guarded in her sharing, it was evident that she had prepared in advance to discuss the topic in a very reflective manner. Her sharing in the focus group about her present work of "caring" assisted in the definition of a language that is relatively absent in research on mothering.

Despite the potential influence of her relationship with her husband, and her professional and continuing education that are other adult developmental experiences, SC was adamant that her mothering experience with her youngest daughter transformed her into a more process oriented organizational development consultant and her experience with her adult daughter's adolescence provided experience which she utilized in being a sensitive supervisor. Her mothering-like emotion work was evident in her modeling, coaching, and management of employees and clients as well as in the maintenance of projects she managed. The fact that SC was most recently sought out by contractors to work in her present engineering workplace because she has gained a reputation for using "caring" as an organizational development consulting strategy strengthens her argument.

The impact of her background including the effects of the motherhood constellation led to her being an over-structured "worry-wart" mother which may have caused her more "process oriented" youngest daughter to seek relief as an exchange student in Australia (thereby perhaps repeating her mother's college experience abroad).

Findings

This section of the chapter presents a summary of the analysis of three internal organizational development consultant/manager/mothers' reporting and beliefs regarding how their mothering experience informed their professional role. Inasmuch as there is a lack of language to describe the mothering experience, this study sought to illuminate and better understand that experience and to discern what knowledge, skills, attributes, or attitudes seem to be related to their consulting and management experience. Grounded theory analysis of the interview transcripts indicated that the co-researchers' reporting represented more of their idealized version of mothering, consulting, and managing. However, their idealized image of these roles is not consistent, especially in two cases, with their self-reported behaviors in the three roles. Also, due to the influence of other adult learning experiences such as continuing education, psychotherapy, and intimate relationships as well as their own earlier experience of being mothered, referred to as the "motherhood constellation", it was not possible to discern how and in which unique ways mothering impacted professional functioning. Clearly, the contribution of mothering in the context of these other experiences was likely to be complex, interactive, and non-linear, thus making it difficult to disentangle the relationship between mothering and professional functioning.

This research provided the co-researchers an opportunity for a reflective journey with regard to the research questions. These women admitted that they devalued their life experience as mothers and were surprised that someone would be interested in their stories. The research process served as a catalyst in thinking about the interface between mothering and professional role functioning and provided an empowering experience for the co-researchers by bringing value to a devalued role.

The Language of Mothering

An important purpose of this study was to assist in developing a language to describe the mothering experience. The ideal constructs that emerged from the data served this purpose and are stated below. A second, but as equally important, purpose of the study was to give voice to women in organizational development consulting who have not been heard about in almost ten years. It was important to hear their stories. Their idealized image of what they believed they brought from mothering to their professional role functioning is also represented by the three themes that emerged from the data: "being fully present," "protecting by fighting for trust and safety," and "bringing a caring stance." However, despite the fact that it is not possible to clearly explicate what mothering offers and how mothering impacts the work role, the ideal of what they believed they brought from mothering to work can be subsumed under the larger construct of "caring," which has a strong functional relationship to their earlier experiences as mothers.

For BB, "being fully present" was defined as being able to nonjudgementally listen to and be genuinely engaged with another person, that is, being authentic and having the capacity for intimacy. For GC, "protecting by fighting for trust and safety" meant standing up for staff or children despite their behavior and providing an environment that was safe for them. For SC "bringing a caring stance" was defined as being concerned about the recognition and empowerment of her clients, staff, daughters and herself as well.

Idealized Perception

There were sufficient contradictions in the self-reports of mothering in these narratives to suggest that the functional similarity of mothering to both managing and consulting led the co-researchers to share what they thought was good managing and consulting by using mothering as a reference point. This resulted in their describing their idealized version of their professional functioning

rather than the reality of how they actually performed. Perhaps the ideology of the "good" mother in our present culture also led these women to recall and present their mothering behavior in the most positive way, as many women do, especially in ordinary discourse.

In two of the cases, BB and GC, who came from the most dysfunctional families-of-origin, there was a clear indication that there were many contradictions between what they reported and what they believed about their behavior. The learning involved in all three roles, as compared to their reported behavior in each of the roles is inconsistent. Even for SC whose reported behavior in the three roles was more consistent with the ideal that she felt she brought from mothering to work, there were some inconsistencies. However, she was aware of how her "over-structured" mothering continued despite the positive impact that her earlier relationship with her youngest daughter had on her ability to "let-go" in her consulting work. Curiously, that daughter had chosen to live for six months as a foreign-exchange student during the time of the study.

Mothering as Transformation

For BB, mothering led to an emergence of a self. For the first time in her life, BB wanted responsibility and caring for her son "anchored her to life." Becoming a mother was an epiphany. The process placed her in a new paradigm with regard to responsibility versus duty. According to her belief system, caring for her son was a responsibility she loved, was good at, and did because she wanted to. She discovered that she wanted to nurture another. A second epiphany occurred when her son served as a catalyst in her beginning recovery from alcoholism. The process of "becoming" a self is a life-long journey that BB is still experiencing.

GC believed that, over the long haul, mothering helped her trust life. She made many mistakes as a mother but believed that her children were successful adults, and thus she learned to trust "process." Also, as a mother, she believed that she learned to be authentic and honest and believed that she brought

those virtues to the workplace. Although she may have discovered what it meant to be authentic from her mothering experience, the ability to demonstrate that quality in reality proved difficult for GC. Based on the disconnect between her self-reported mothering and professional behavior, as compared to her beliefs in this area, GC appeared to be inconsistent about her mothering and how it changed her or informed her work.

SC believed that the birth and care of her youngest daughter transformed her by "slowing her down" and made her take time to "smell the roses." In general she believed that becoming a mother led her to taking a more "caring stance" especially in her professional roles.

The transforming experience of mothering did produce some significant changes in the co-researchers' thinking about mothering and themselves, but it did not always translate directly into changes in professional behavior as evidenced in their self-reported behavior in those roles and the presence of the confounding influence of other concurrent adult developmental experiences. However, they believed that the transformation from mothering impacted their professional behavior in important ways. The motherhood constellation discussed below may have been an important event in that transformation.

The Motherhood Constellation

An unexpected finding was evidence of the importance of the motherhood constellation (Stern, 1995), namely: an unconscious force on the mothering process that can result in a psychic re-organization that may last a few months or a lifetime. One of the most important components of the constellation are the memories of the mother's own childhood as well as the greater influence that the maternal grandmother plays in the early stages of caring for a first child. During the focus group, BB noted its influence on her mothering when the group was addressing the impact of other adult developmental experiences as differentiated from mothering and its impact on their work. BB believed

that the mothering experience, rather than other adult developmental experiences, had a greater impact on her, mainly because she had been mothered and that experience influenced her mothering as well as her work behavior. She related how she had imaginary discussions with her deceased mother especially after the birth of her son. From the perspective of Stern's theory, BB's mother had not been "fully present" to her during her childhood, as well as during the birth of her son. And it turned out that, BB, in turn, was not "fully present" to her son until she began her recovery from alcoholism. BB believed that her facility in "mothering" her boss came from her mothering experience, which was also impacted by having been mothered. The co-researchers shared in the focus group that they believed a woman's parenting is differentiated from that of men by the fact that women give birth to become a "mother" who was also "mothered."

GC's entire life appeared, to her, to be a reworking of the impact of having a mother who was schizophrenic. SC suggested that her "over-structured" mothering appeared similar to what one would expect from her own mother who raised seven children. All of the co-researchers perceived that their being mothered or their own mothering experience had some oversimplified causal connection with their present professional behavior.

The presence of the "motherhood constellation" lends evidence that undermines outcome studies of mothering. Inasmuch as this is an unconscious process, its impact cannot be separated out from mothering behavior in studies that describe a more casual/linear relationship between mothering and the emergence of certain attributes, attitudes, skills, and personal growth from the experience that are transferred to the work place.

Mothering Adult Children

Mothering emotion work continued for these mothers of adult children. Maintaining a relationship was especially important. Informal discussion after the focus group was "protection"

focused, filled with worries about how their adult children's lives were playing out, as well as safety issues regarding the younger of the daughters in the study and the "letting go" process. In the focus group, BB was concerned that with their busy schedules she was not relating with her son as much as she would like. It appeared that she continued to have a somewhat dependent relationship with him by relying on imaginary dialogue to help her clarify her thinking. Her failure to be "fully present" to her son when he was younger may have led to his need for therapy around intimacy issues with his present wife. They had recently reminisced over dinner about the time that he accused her of being a terrible mother, obviously an important marker in BB's adult development.

Another example of idealized perception in the case of GC emerged. When discussing that her youngest son was a kind of soul-mate for her, she also shared a recent incidence that laid claim to the fact that he kept information about his romantic life from her. Being a good mother was crucial to GC. She had a great need to assure me that her children were all successful and shared, unasked for, details about how often they were in communication with her as an indication of the depth of their connectivity.

SC was sensitive to her daughters' dependence/independence issues and was preparing herself for her oldest daughter's first visit home after beginning college and her youngest daughter's return from six months in Australia and the possible conflicts that would arise. She was astutely aware that her younger daughter, especially, would not want to return to the same relationship with her mother after her return from Australia where she was allowed greater independence than she had prior to leaving home. SC imagined that she would have to use more coaching and less disciplining as a parent.

Mothering and Adult Development

Although there was consensus about the difficulty of disentangling the contribution of the mothering experience from other adult developmental experiences, the co-researchers believed that the mothering experience with its connection to the impact of being mothered, or the motherhood

constellation, brought deeper changes to their lives than would have occurred if they had not been

mothers, or if they had merely "grown up" which was their conception of adult development. Does their

belief emerge, in some complex way, from "women's ways of knowing" (Belenky, et al.), the subjective

knowledge that appears more intuitive in nature and cannot be verified but is considered an important

source of knowledge within the more feminist research paradigm?

Influence of Mothering on Organizational Development Consulting

Although it is difficult to ascertain how or in which direction mothering influences

organizational development consulting, the themes of protect, nurture, and train that Ruddick (1989)

posits as ideally being the main activities of the practice of mothering, appears functionally similar to

the organizational development consulting experiences of the three co-researchers.

BB's present work in organizational development is that of a learning and leadership

development consultant. This role is mainly focused on training employees regarding new competencies

necessary for succession planning, and leadership development. She is also in charge of a coaching

program for executives, which might be considered a nurturing as well as training activity. Protection of

the organizational culture is served by collecting employee opinions, as well as being aware of the

systems impact of the coaching and leadership programs that she designs and develops. She felt that in

order to do good organizational development work she had to be aware of her core values. Despite the

fact that her reported behavior indicated that she was still learning to become "fully present," both

within her personal and professional life, she believed that she first learned about being intimate and

authentic as a mother. She is concerned with humanizing the workplace for employees, helping them

live up to their own potential, to gain voice and vision in the service of work through the programs she

designs and develops.

GC believed that mothering helped her to have faith in the process of organizational development consulting. Despite her self-avowed mothering mistakes over time, she felt that her children were successful because she persevered. She believed that she brought that perseverance to the process of organizational development consulting as well. She believed also that her continual empathizing with her children, despite evidence to the contrary, led to more collaborative relationships in doing organizational development consulting despite evidence that she relied more on her own personal organizational power to effect systemic change.

SC was hired by her current employer to bring "care" to the engineering workplace where employees were experiencing emotional pain due to the lack of "emotional intelligence" (Goleman, 1995) by the leadership. Almost four years ago, such activity "disappeared" during the process of defining what constituted "work" in Fletcher's (1999) study, and hence the title, *Disappearing Acts*. SC believed strongly that her mothering experience, especially with her younger daughter, brought a "caring" stance to her organizational development work.

Her younger daughter forced her to be more process focused and to have more courage in not owning a problem that might arise within a client group. Now, instead, she merely shares her present moment feelings about it. She felt her youngest daughter was a very perceptive and an in-the-moment person and that that relationship helped her be more sensitive to her use of self within the process of organizational development consulting. An additional learning from that relationship was the importance of "letting go" and the need for being sensitive to the amount of structure a group needs. She learned to own the answer to the question about the nature of an intervention--does it originate in the needs of the group or from her? In her mothering, she was aware of her tendency to err on the side of "over-structure," but owned that fault as coming from her needs rather than from what her daughters needed.

Multitasking was also a skill that SC believed mothers were better at and the importance of it in organizational development consulting work.

Influence of Mothering on Management

As with the case of organizational development consulting, it is difficult to separate the influence of the mothering experience on management. Some believe that management skills emerge from various life situations over time and mothering is considered one of those experiences of pre-learning to becoming a manager (Cook, Heppner & O'Brien, 2002; Merriam & Clark, 1991; Watson, 2001). However, all of the co-researchers were involved in many other adult learning experiences in addition to mothering, such as psychotherapy, continuing education, and intimate relationships. Thus, again, the impact of mothering on professional functioning must be considered to be complex, interactive and non-linear when combined with these other adult learning experiences.

BB believed that given the chaos that exists in most organizations like her own, knowing her values and what she can give in managing people helped clarify her behavior. Also, she believed strongly that she first learned to clarify her values in being a mother due to the often-ambiguous situations that emerge from child rearing. Knowing her values anchored her in all the work she does. Inasmuch as the act of managing systemically travels up as well as down, she was able to recently provide mothering emotion work in the form of distress management for her boss. For her, this kind of caring was linked to her mother-self. She also believed that she had first learned about responsibility from being a mother and that she was more aware of her responsibility to her employees whom she has managed. Her greater challenge in managing was being clear about what her needs were. Her reporting of her actual behavior as a manager was at times inconsistent with her beliefs indicating that she was still in the process of learning how to manage effectively, especially men.

GC continually faced the threat of re-organization of her programs within the federal government. Thus, she felt like a mother who was continually worrying about "protecting" her employees' jobs. She often referred to her staff as a family as they had been together for a long time and had fairly intimate relationships with each other. She admitted that she felt like the mother of her employees and was disappointed that they brought their own family-of-origin baggage to the workplace. When she treated them like her children, the results were not the same. This suggests that her mothering experience made her less effective as a manager.

As the mothering experience also contains the "being mothered" experience, GC's reported managerial behavior indicated that she allowed her employees to abuse her emotionally as well, and she had difficulty asserting herself with them. She was aware of these issues and even her husband was critical of her management style. Like BB, GC had recently provided "distress management" for her boss who needed to "save face" over a workplace conflict having to do with a promotion for one of GC's staff. Idealized perception is particularly evident in GC's belief system regarding her managerial functioning.

SC brought her mothering "care" to the workplace through the management skill of coaching which involved a great deal of mothering emotion work focused on improving the self-esteem of her staff, as well as delegating with the goal of empowerment. She was also sensitive to the dependence/independence angst of the staff whom she managed. She protected her staff by modeling, as well as encouraging a balanced family/work life. SC's caring management involved a time commitment to the process of management that included building a trusting relationship by listening, dialogue and, at times, resulting in her own emotional pain, much like what she experienced as a mother.

All of the co-researchers found management to be their most difficult work role. BB and GC were still learning to be more effective managers and were, at times, inconsistent in their reporting about

their management behavior. SC avoided management positions in favor of staff positions when she made career transitions as evidenced by her present employment, which did not include management responsibilities.

Influence of Mothering on Career Development

How mothering might impact professional functioning can be viewed through the lens of the career development processes of the three co-researchers. Although only SC, the youngest of the three mothers, worked full time during her daughters' entire childhood and adolescence, all of the mothers held back in their upward career mobility at some time during their active mothering experience. SC related how she was aware that she was not fully present to her work during her oldest daughter's adolescence. BB worked part time without a clear career path during her son's early childhood. GC was a full time mother until her youngest son was in elementary school but admitted that she needed to be enrolled in academic courses to "keep her sanity." The above patterns may represent cultural shaping of expectations for women. The majority of women today are expected to "do it all." They need to have developed within a career should they divorce and need to be the single breadwinner. SC's husband experienced career changes, which left SC as the main financial support for the family, which she regretted, as she didn't get to spend as much quality time with her daughters as compared to her husband. GC, the oldest of the mothers, was from the 50's culture wherein women were dependent upon their husband for financial support while they had total responsibility for care of the family. BB was single during much of her son's childhood. The lack of clear career goals and enough financial resources allowed BB to work part-time during her son's early childhood.

There was evidence of the presence of various constructs used to define the work/family balance. The constructs of juggling, sequencing, and weaving, are used to define the way mothers handle the two roles of parent and worker (Garey, 1999: Gould, 1997; Hochschild, 1989). SC wove her mothering with

her work role to present one seamless dual role. GC 's description was one of sequencing by not

working until her youngest son entered school and then that of juggling the two roles as was more

common during her era. BB's experience was more of sequencing nature wherein she initially did not

work, then worked part time before working full time. She did not feel she juggled two roles as she

shared custody of her son with his very involved father so that she had periods of time during the week

that she did not parent.

Summary

Although mothering contributes to professional functioning in some complex and indirect way, it

is not possible to clearly understand its impact within the context of the other adult developmental

learning experiences. The three co-researchers believed, however, that their mothering experience

brought important changes to them and their work. Despite the evidence of idealized perception in their

presentation of their mothering behavior and its impact on their work, the larger construct of "care"

emerged as their ideal of themselves as mothers as well as how the mothering experience informed their

professional role. Conclusions regarding the findings of this study, a discussion of its limitations as well

as suggestions for future research are addressed in Chapter V.

Chapter V: Conclusions and Recommendations

Introduction

This inquiry was about understanding the mothering experience of three internal organizational development consultant/managers, each of whom perceived that their mothering experience informed their professional role functioning. The study sought to give voice to women in organizational development consulting as well as to assist in the development of a language to describe the mothering experience and how it informed professional practice.

The study presented three narratives that focused on the self-reported behavior of the consultant/manager mothers in their mothering, consulting, and management roles as well as their beliefs as to how their mothering experience informed their work. The findings suggested that although mothering contributes to professional functioning in some complex and indirect way, it was not possible to clearly understand its unique impact within the context of other adult developmental learning experiences. However, the co-researchers believed, despite idealized perception in two of the cases, that their mothering experience brought important changes to them and their work. The constructs that emerged from the data were the more ideal core categories of "protecting by fighting for trust and safety" in the case of GC and "being fully present" for BB. The theme of "bringing a caring stance" was more consistent in the life and work of SC.

This chapter first focuses on the possible explanations for the contradictions that emerged around how the reported behavior of two of the mothers differed from their beliefs with regard to the research questions. The chapter then presents a discussion organized around the two research questions: (a) What is the mothering experience of the internal organizational development consultant/manager who perceives that her experience informed her professional functioning? and (b) How does the mothering experience inform the professional functioning of the internal organizational development

consultant/manager? Limitations of this study and suggestions for future research follow. Finally, implications of this study with regard to the concept of "care" which subsumed the three ideal and more subjective themes that emerged from the data follow. A more abstracted idealized vision of an "ethic of care" for organizational practice completes the chapter.

Idealized Perception

One explanation for the emergence of idealized perception in the narratives of BB and GC is more related to the nature of this study. Perhaps knowing the research topic and being self-selected as believing that mothering informed their professional role functioning, these co-researchers used their mothering experience as a frame of reference to report what they believed mothering brought to the other two roles that also have a functional similarity with mothering. The self-reported data about their actual behavior in the three roles was reported in the form of stories and was differentiated from their beliefs regarding the research question. They were not aware of the discrepancies during the interview and they were equally unaware after they read the verbatim transcripts of the interviews.

Ideology of the Good Mother

There is another possible explanation of the appearance of idealized perception on the part of GC and BB as seen in the discrepancies between their self-reported mothering behaviors as differentiated from their belief system about their mothering behavior. Although there is an ideology of the good mother within our culture (Abbey &O'Reilly, 1998; Apple & Golden, 1997; Glen, Chang & Forcey, 1994; Kaplan, 1992; Maushart, 1999; Phoenix, Woollet, & Lloyd, 1991; DiQuinzio, 1999; Rossiter, 1988; Swigart, 1998; Thurer, 1994), no mother can be a "good" mother all of the time. Many have discussed the negative aspects of mothering (Bernard, 1974; Brown et al., 1994; Phoenix et al., 1991; Rich, 1976; Rossiter, 1988; Thurer, 1994) and the fact that women feel pressured to report only the positive aspects in ordinary discourse (Bernard, 1974; Brown et al., 1994; Rich, 1976; Thurer, 1994).

Grumet's (1992) challenge in this arena states: "To what degree does reflection, even when subjected to rigorous discipline, distort experience to fit idealized forms?" (p. 40). Much of the description and research on mothering tends to focus on the simplified dichotomy of good mother versus bad mother (Coll, et al., 1998). To the extent that this has influenced the ideology of the good mother there surely is a tendency for mothers to "distort their experiences to fit the idealized good mother forms" (Grumet, 1992, p. 40).

Bruno Bettelheim's (1988) volume *A Good Enough Parent* was an attempt to rectify the trend in dichotomizing mothering into either good or bad which still exists today (Coll, et al., 1998; Phoenix, et al., 1991). Historically, mothering has contained the culturally constructed conflict between a mother's self-development and her relationship with her child (Coll, et al., 1998; DiQuinzio, 1999; Knowles & Cole, 1990; Youngblade, 1999). Mothers today are expected to have both satisfying careers and still be responsible for the ongoing psychological development of their children far into adulthood (Bocknek, 1986; Booth, 1999; Goldscheider & Goldscheider, 1999; Hays, 1996; Richardson, 1993; Youngblade, 1999) In this study, the co-researchers' informal conversation following the focus group still contained the theme of "protection" while talking about their adult children, which reflects the long term persistence of the sense of responsibility for their children. This, too, may enhance the shape of the memories of their past mothering.

From a similar perspective, Goleman (1985) references the self-deception that is present in the construction of social reality, which, for this study, is the ideology of the good mother. He discusses Erving Goffman's study of "frames" which are scripts that notate appropriate behavior within the execution of a social role and contain a collection of shared schemas. He posits that it is easier to see the "deviance" from the ascribed role expectations than to view the positive behavior. For example, the analysis of the data for this study focused on "bad" or "poor" mothering in order to locate

inconsistencies with the co-researchers beliefs about their mothering, especially in the cases of BB and GC. A mother who is an alcoholic is as unacceptable as is the mother who "yelled a lot." Rich (1976) and others (Bernard, 1974; Brown et al. 1994; Maushart, 1999; Thurer, 1994) have written about the mothering schemas that are rarely addressed, for example, emotional abuse, physical abuse, depression, boredom, isolation, anger, self-blame, and guilt which adds to the tendency to idealize yet devalue the role in our present culture (Crittenden, 2001; Gerstel & Gross, 1987; Rossiter, 1988; Thurer, 1994) All the co-researchers expressed dismay that someone would want to hear stories about their mothering experience. Thus, this study attempts to bring value to the role, particularly from a framework perspective that values mothers' subjective knowledge (Abbey, S. & O'Reilly, A., 1998; Belenky et al., 1986; Brown, et al., 1994; Daly B. & Reddy, M., 1991).

Research Question #1

What is the mothering experience of the internal organizational development consultant/manager who perceives that her experience informed her professional functioning?

The Language of Mothering

One purpose of this study was to develop more of a language to describe the mothering experience. Stern (1995) posits that language to describe the early mother-child relationship is largely non-verbal and pre-symbolic. In an attempt to capture a more longitudinal example of language as well as experience, this study focused on the mothering experience of women who had an adult child.

Although the use of narratives alone, as in this study, produces more subjective knowledge, the narratives of the mothering and work experiences of the three co-researchers demonstrated many examples of previous attempts to develop a language for mothering. Seery's (1996) mothering emotion work, and Ruddick's (1989) ideal maternal practice goals of protect, nurture, and train were evident in the narratives. Fletcher's (1999) "invisible relational practice" was also "visible" in the data. Hart's (1992) abstracted idealized mothering epistemology was demonstrated in the co-researchers' "letting

go" process with their adolescence/adult children. During that process, their general knowledge about child development stages was tempered by their subjective knowledge regarding their unique child, as in the case of SC.

The ideal themes that emerged from the data, "being fully present," "protecting by fighting for trust and safety," and "bringing a caring stance," which this study subsumed under the larger construct of "care," assists in the development of a language to describe the role. These phrases, besides describing maternal practice and Stern's (1995) "being with one's child" meaning making of the motherhood constellation, represented what the co-researchers also believed they brought from mothering to work. However, what is important for this study is that these mothers chose to use the current language of mothering to describe their earlier style of relating to their young children, their current relationship with their adult children and their style of work despite significant lack of support for these descriptions in their own verbal descriptions of these events.

Mothering as Transformation

There is a body of literature that addresses the change in self-definition that results from the mothering experience (Barlow, 1993; Collins, 1998; Comart, 1983; Coulter, 2001; Stern, 1995; Stern, 1992). This study is added to that literature due to the changes in self-definition as suggested by the influence of the "motherhood constellation" (Stern, 1995) and its impact on mothering behavior. Despite its more unconscious origins (Stern, 1995), the motherhood constellation is socially constructed within the current western developed post-industrial culture based on expectations of the mother-infant bond (Stern, 1995). Stern's (1995) clinical model was conceived to assist in the treatment of dysfunctional mother-infant bonding and emerged from clinical practice and psychodynamic literature in this area. His work suggests that the potential for psychic re-organization that begins with pregnancy may last for months or a lifetime and can be considered transformational in nature. According to Stern (1995):

> The motherhood constellation has some features of a complex, of a psychic organization, of a specific life-span phase or issues, and of the mental organization created by an activated motivational system. We do not know the exact nature of this kind of mental organization, or how it influences ongoing mental life and behavior. (Further clarification at a fundamental level probably awaits advances in the cognitive neurosciences in collaboration with the clinical sciences.) p. 185.

Acknowledging the potential presence of the motherhood constellation further confounds the possibility of separating out the mothering experience for study.

In the case of this research, the "being mothered" aspect and the "being with" their child aspect of the constellation were most addressed by the co-researchers. As with other life experiences that impact mothering, it is difficult to discern the specificity of the "mothering constellation's" impact, but its more subjective importance, especially the "being mothered" aspect, was suggested in the case of GC. BB also verbalized the importance of both "being mothered" and her own personal transformation from "being with" her son and how, she believed, it impacted her work role. SC's over-structured mothering behavior suggested her "being mothered" by a mother who raised seven children. In addition, SC believed that "being with" her youngest daughter impacted her sense of self that she believed she brought to her managerial and consulting practice.

The other most significant literature on this topic was Collin's (1998) study, which was partially based on defining mothering and the professional role as a seamless/dual role. Her study of mother/teachers referred to the mothering experience as a defining moment that shaped lives at both home and work. In an attempt to balance work and family, these women altered career plans and commitment to work as well as having less time for their marital relationships in favor of having more time with their children.

Likewise, the co-researchers reported holding back in some way from a full commitment to work during certain periods of their children's developmental years. GC didn't work, outside the home, until her youngest son was in elementary school. Unlike Collin's (1998) study, GC's mothering/work role

was one more of juggling as was the case of mothers who worked in her era (Hochschild, 1989; Gould, 1997; Murphy, 1994; Smith-Pierce, 1994). BB didn't work full time until her son was in elementary school and considered her two roles as existing side by side as she was not always mothering due to her ex-husband's greater role in the parenting process. SC, on the other hand, worked full time during her daughters' entire childhood development in perhaps more the dual/seamless mode. She obtained employment out of the country, where household help was more affordable, so that she, as well as her husband, could have more quality family time when their daughters were in elementary school. She also admitted that she was less focused on work during her oldest daughter's adolescence.

Although Stern (1992) dealt with the work and mother roles as separate rather than as a duality, her career/mothers talked about the personal growth that came from the mothering experience rather than from any other adult developmental experiences. Although this study cannot confirm the findings of Stern's study about the specific attributes that mothering directly brought to work through experiential learning, Stern's (1992) study is referenced here since motherhood in Stern's study was also considered a "trigger event" that could lead to the further development of the adult self.

Mothering, Adult Development, and Learning

It is difficult to separate the mothering experience from other adult developmental learning experiences such as psychotherapy, self-help groups, graduate education, work place education such as sensitivity training and management training groups as well as other intimate relationships in which the co-researchers participated. Yet these co-researchers adamantly believed that the mothering experience transformed them, as discussed previously. Mothering as an adult learning experience is discussed in the literature on adult development (Belenky, et al., 1986; Gilligan, 1982; Han & Moen, 1999; Jordon, Kaplan, Miller, Stiver & Surrey, 1991; Levinson, 1996; Merriam, S. & Clark, M., 1991; Watson, 2001)

According to that body of literature, mothering can be an example of transformational learning, which often begins with a "trigger" event (Meizirow, 1981, 1991; Meizirow, et al., 1990) like motherhood. The pregnancy and birthing process initiates the "motherhood constellation" (Stern, 1995) which is a powerful and mostly unconscious force in the transformational process. A commitment to protect, nurture, and train their children results in Ruddick's (1989) "maternal thinking" or as in Hart's (1992) words, a "motherhood epistemology" that emerges from the transformation and experiential learning that occurs. It must be noted here that both Ruddick's and Hart's works are not empirically based but are examples of "ideal-type abstracting" (Hart, 1992, p. 183) with reference to the mothering experience. Also, there were differences among the co-researchers in this study as to what they felt they learned from mothering since learning is impacted by individual differences as well as psychosocial, sociocultural, sociopolitical, and historical influences (Abbey, 1995; Boucouvalas & Krupp, 1989). Besides transformational (Barlow, 1993; Comart, 1983; Coulter, 2001; Meizerow, 1981, 1991; Stern, 1995; Stern, 1992) and experiential learning (Hart, 1992; Kolb, 1984; Lewin, 1951; Ruddick, 1989; Watson, 2001) the literature about motherhood makes reference to tacit (Boucouvalas & Krupp, 1989; Durrance, 1998; Fenwick, 1994; Polanyi, 1967; Sternberg & Caruso, 1985) transpersonal (Boucouvalas, 1980,1981,1983,1984,1995,1999, 2000; Maslow, 1970; Merriam & Caffarella, 1991; and embodied knowing(Coulter, 2001; Lakoff & Johnson, 1999; Verala et al., 1997).

As the mothering experience cannot be isolated from other adult learning experiences except in the subjective knowledge of the co-researchers' belief system, the purpose of this research did not include an extensive explication of the kinds of learning that mothers used in bringing their experience to work. By acknowledging the complex interaction between the mothering experience, other adult developmental learning experiences and organizational practice, it was difficult to clarify any further the learning processes involved. However, the research process afforded the co-researchers an opportunity

to participate in "critical reflection" upon their experience. All of the co-researchers expressed dismay that someone would want to study their mothering experience. Finding more value in a role they themselves initially devalued led to a sense of empowerment, which is a form of transformational learning (Meizerow, 1980, 1991, Meizerow et al., 1990) that they voiced during the focus group as well as privately.

Despite the inconsistencies that appeared between what the co-researchers believed and their self-reported behavior, and the difficulty in disentangling the mothering experience from other adult developmental experiences, what these mothers believed must be valued as their subjective knowledge. Qualitative research using the case study method, as does this study, offers the "epistemology of the particular" (Stakes, 2001).

The mothers of this study, as well as those of Stern's (1992), firmly believed that their mothering experience had an important impact on their work role. Their subjective knowledge is often referred to as "women's ways of knowing," (Belenky, et al., 1986) and is partially based on the understanding that women learn through connection with others (Jordan, et al., 1991; Surrey, J., 1983). Belenky, et al. (1986) posit that the women of their study did not listen to their own authority until later in life, specifically around age 40-50 after years of having children, managing a household, and working outside the home. This subjective knowledge is defined in their study as the "inner voice" and "infallible gut" (Belenky, et al., 1986, p. 54.) This subjective knowledge evolves into personal, private knowledge or intuition (Boucouvalas, 1997) referred to in the more feminist literature as subjectivism (Bloom, 1998). According to the more feminist paradigm, such knowledge cannot be verified and thus is not valued by the more patriarchal research methods that value objectivity. The grounded theory of this study emerged from the mothers' self-reported behavior in the three roles. The narratives demonstrated inconsistencies between their beliefs and actual behavior and led to the emergence of the construct of

idealized perception, especially in two cases. Their beliefs were presented as separate data and represented their more subjective knowledge. The more ideal themes that emerged from the data appeared to be more culturally and historically defined within the present ideology of the good mother as referenced above. For this discussion, beliefs are separated from ideals and later rejoined. According to *Webster's College Dictionary* (1991), beliefs are convictions. There is confidence in the truth or existence of something not immediately susceptible to rigorous proof. The mothers of this study believed that their mothering experience impacted them more profoundly than the other experiences of adult development.

An ideal according to *Webster's College Dictionary* (1991) is the conception of something in its perfection. It is a standard of perfection or excellence. The attributes, or themes, that the mothers felt they brought from mothering to work represented more of their ideals of mothering which, especially in two cases, was not represented in their actual behavior at work and at home. Ideals are usually associated with the notion of morals and ethics.

The notions of beliefs and ideals can be rejoined. These mothers believed in the ideals of motherhood that they thought they were demonstrating at home and bringing to work. Noddings (1984) uses an abstract idealized version of mothering to explicate her concept of care, and the ideals of this study are viewed by this researcher to be strategies for caring.

<div align="center">Research Question #2</div>

<div align="center">*How does the mothering experience inform the professional functioning of the internal organizational development consultant/manager?*</div>

Based on the data, this study calls into question the validity of studies reported that indicate a causal, linear connection between mothering and professional functioning and the value given to the mothering experience as directly, rather than indirectly, producing substantive knowledge, attitudes,

attributes and skills (Baron, 1987; Collins, 1998; Coulter, 2001; Erkut et al., 2001; Goldman, 1996; Kaplan, 1994; Kitchen, 1996; Nelton, 1991; Nelton & Berney, 1987; Stern, 1992).

The results from this study support the findings of Greenhaus and Parasuraman (2001) about the linkages between family and work. Their review of the research in this area is an attempt to recognize the nature of the interdependence between work and family roles. They underscore that experiences of a specific role can have an indirect effect on life in another role. They note, however, that there are very few studies that acknowledge the possibility that work and family roles can have positive or enriching effects on one another and that attitudes or moods that arise within one role can affect attitudes, moods, and behavior in another role (Crouter, 1984; Greenhaus & Parasuraman, 2001).

This study focuses more on the possible "personality enrichment" aspect of how a family role may be integrated with a work role. Personality enrichment is defined here as the transfer of skills, attitudes, or perspectives developed in one role that can affect attitudes, moods, and behavior in another role (Fredriksen-Goldsen & Scharlach, 2001; Friedman & Greenhaus, 2000; Greenhaus & Parasuraman, 2001; Parasuraman & Greenhaus, 1997).

Collins (1998) focuses on the fluidity between the mothering and teaching roles with an emphasis on what mothering brings to school. Abby's (1995) study of mother/teachers presents the notion that certain maternal traits are not exclusively derived from mothering and can be learned from teaching. Stern's (1992) study emphasizes the "spill over" of mothering to more generic careers. MacDonald (1996) studied the reciprocal flow of energy from the nursing role to the mothering role and how the nurses avoided burnout in both roles.

Influence of Mothering on Organizational Development Consulting

Although it is difficult to ascertain any direct causal connection between mothering attributes and the practice of organizational development consulting, certain themes emerged that uniquely

described the subjective knowledge of the co-researchers regarding how their mothering experience informed their work. These themes are not generalizable since certain unique forces combined to form the particular subjective knowledge of each co-researcher. There was a separate and unique substantive theory for each case which, when combined together, presents a beginning in the production of a more formal theory.

Acknowledging that mothering contributes in some complex and indirect way to behavior in a work role, the emergence of "bringing a caring stance" that SC believed her mothering brought to her work might be viewed as the "mind set" that the organizational development literature posits is necessary for the change agent concerned with the process of organizational transformation (Anderson & Anderson, 2001b; Bolman, 1991; Pedler, Burgoyne & Boydell, 1997; Senge, 1990; Senge et al., 1999; Weisbod, 1987). SC defined her "caring stance" as becoming more process focused, slowing down, needing to be less perfectionist, and more sensitive to the gestalt of the consulting situation. Likewise the organizational development literature states that "mind set" is also referred to as "a way of being" that is considered the most powerful of change levers in all human systems. This mind set effects the internal as well as external state of being and perception of reality. It demands that change agents continually reflect or test their thoughts and assumptions about reality. This process is part of the mastery of self that is so important in the practice of organizational development consulting. It involves the four domains of human experience, namely: physical, emotional, mental and spiritual. In essence it is a practitioners' "world view." Its motto is "Fix yourself first and then others and the environment will follow" (Anderson & Anderson, 2001b, p.93).

Of particular relevance was the fact that at the time of the focus group, SC had been hired by an engineering firm to bring "care" to the workplace. Unlike the engineers of Fletcher's (1999) study done

only four year ago, SC' s relational practice was not only very visible but was the stated goal of her role at this workplace.

In contrast, the reported consulting behavior of GC was found lacking in this "mind set." GC was not aware that her reported behavior did not match her beliefs about how she did her consulting. Despite her years of personal therapy and professional development seminars, she appeared to be lacking in self-awareness. Awareness is considered by the organizational literature to be the foundation of self-mastery. And transformation must be a conscious process for the change agent who intends to lead organizational transformation (Anderson & Anderson, 2001b).

This study, like that of Kaplan (1994) about external consultants, demonstrated how the three goals of maternal thinking (Ruddick, 1989) protect, nurture, and train were present in the self-reporting of consulting work by the three co-researchers. Unlike Kaplan's (1994) consultants, this study's consultants were very visible in their professional roles and believed that they were being authentic.

There was evidence from BB that, for her, partnering with men was as difficult as that experienced by Kaplan's (1994) consultants. While discussing the concept of gender in the workplace, BB shared that although men and women were generally being liberated from more prescribed gendered roles in the workplace; older men were more difficult to deal with in this arena. She felt she could not have an open discussion about gender with, especially, older white men. GC also shared, with dismay and anger, an example of a supervisor suggesting she should get advice from her husband about how to handle a decision regarding being moved to another job. These examples suggest some residue of oppression that Kaplan's (1994) and Harris's (1995) consultants experienced almost ten years ago which would also impact the co-researchers' behavior in the workplace.

Generally, however, it appears that women are gaining much stature within the profession and within organizations (Adler, N., 2001; Frenier, C. 1997; Maier, M., 2001) Other literature (Correa et al.,

1988; Covin & Harris, 1995; Kaplan, 1995; Larwood & Gattiker, 1985; Szwajkowski & Larwood, 1991), although not focused on mothers in organizational development consulting, referenced the beginning emergence of feminine thinking and ways of being within organizational life which has become even more dominant than the more male, hierarchical, industrial mind set of ten years ago (Maier, 2001). As early as 1995 (Covin & Harris, 1995; Kaplan, 1995; Waclawski, Church & Burke, 1995) there was recognition that women brought a unique way of consulting, different from the male model, that emphasized the maternal practice of connectedness, co-operation, and mutuality as seen in the reported behavior of SC and the more ideological beliefs of BB and GC. BB shared that over the past ten years she witnessed many changes in the workplace with regard to gender.

Through the experience of coaching executives and facilitating teams, BB believed that women have been able to validate the feminine model in the workplace. Her experience providing "mothering distress management emotion work" (Seery, 1996, p. 105) to her manager serves as an example. She viewed that at present there is much fluidity in the workplace regarding the sorting out of gendered behavior as well as concepts of leadership. Being in charge of leadership development at her workplace, BB shared that she helps employees integrate their male and female persona in the process of helping them become more authentic, a life long process from which she is still emerging. She also discussed the differences she notes in the workplace regarding permission to show emotions. Women when under stress seek out other women and might even cry, whereas men tend to isolate themselves and their feelings. After she provided mothering distress management to her manager when he appeared very vulnerable, he was reluctant to repeat the experience. This may have occurred however because of her propensity to intimidate men rather than about men in general or even this man in particular. Her explanation was that her manager had not learned to trust.

Similar to the consultants in the study by Waclawski, Church and Burke (1995), the co-researchers of this study were committed, at least ideally, to improving the human condition, a maternal goal, within the workplace which was considered the founding and defining principle of the field at that time. However, the emotion work, such as empowering employees to act, was more visible in the stories of the consultants of this study than that of the consultants in 1995. Only GC's reported behavior was more power seeking, similar to the consultants of Waclawski, Church and Burke's (1995) study.

Influence of Mothering on Management

The focus on the managerial role here as separate from consulting is made because managing has more of a one-on-one aspect as well as a sense of authority that is similar to mothering. In this study, managing activities are referred to as transformational leadership activities because according to Senge, et al. (1999), the possibility for leadership occurs at every level within an organization.

Acknowledging that mothering contributes to work behavior but in some complex and indirect way, the "caring stance" that SC believed she brought to her consulting work was also noted in her reported management experience as well. Her reported behavior as a manager contained many of the behaviors of Roll's (1995) transformational leader. Especially evident were her use of dialogue, listening, and the time involved in establishing a trusting relationship with people she managed. Roll (1995) considers these as transformational leader competencies within Senge's (1990) fifth discipline of team learning as presented in Table 1 of the literature review. SC's "caring" style of management, which includes the continual consciousness transformation process discussed above also blends with the concept of leadership as outlined by Senge, et al., (1999). Being a first line manager during our initial interviews, much of SC's effort was spent in communication and community building, usually *invisible* relational practice (Fletcher, 1999) behavior. According to Senge, et al. (1999), leadership is built around activities of daily living. SC modeled a balanced work/family role. Based on her self-reported

behavior, she believed that she walked the talk, so to speak, that is important for transformational

leaders if they are to assist in the transformation of a workplace (Anderson & Anderson, 2001b).

Rolls' (1995) leadership competency of the alignment of personal and company values is seen in

BB's self-reported management style. BB believed that having to define her personal values was an

outcome of her mothering experience. Inasmuch as Senge's et al. (1999) concept of leadership exists at

all levels, BB's belief that she was able to provide the mothering emotion work of distress management

(Seery, 1996) for her boss is another example of her management ability that she believed she brought

from her mothering.

Unfortunately, GC was not an example of transformational leadership. What she seemed to bring

from mothering to management was the need to "hold too closely" as well as "holding too timidly,"

which Ruddick (1989, pp.78-79.) warned could be a negative outcome of maternal practice or as in the

case of GC, somehow perhaps the consequence of her subjective life experiences. .

Implications for Organizational Practice

Ideal as Vision for an Ethic of Care

Acknowledging that mothering contributes to work roles but in some complex and indirect ways

that cannot be clearly described, the following discussion is more of an ideal-type abstracting as to the

potential power of the mothering experience. The three ideal themes: "being fully present," "protecting

by fighting for trust and safety," and "bringing a caring stance," that the co-researchers of this study

believed that they brought to the workplace from their mothering experience were viewed as caring

"strategies" (Strauss & Corbin, 1998, p.133) and thus subsumed under the larger construct of care.

Much has been written about the construct of care (Brabeck, 1989; Crittenden, 2000; Gilligan,

1982; Larrabee, 1993; Noddings, 1984; Tronto, 1993; Wood, 1994) as a metaphor for values and

behavior of women initially explicated by Gilligan (1982) in her research on how women's moral

development and ethical behavior is different from that of men. Noddings (1984) built on Gilligan's (1982) work and used an idealized vision of the activities of mothering and teaching to explicate her concept of care. Tronto (1993) also builds on both the works of Gilligan (1982) and Noddings (1984) by expanding the boundaries of the concept to include the political realm.

Noddings (1984) claims that the "concept of care is rooted in receptivity, relatedness, and responsiveness." (p. 2). She gives "mother's voices" to the notion of care based on her perception of the idealized practices of mothers and teachers, which limited the generalization of her work. Her main goal is to demonstrate that an ethic should not be only concerned with notions of logic, rationality, and deduction. Instead it should ask for more information with regard to context, that is, feelings, needs, impressions, and a subjective sense of personal ideal rather than to more male universal principles. It should be rooted in the affect of the human heart and referred further by her to be the "subjective experience" (p.4.) She outlines her suggestions about moral education and the role of teachers and administrators in this endeavor. Ultimately her ethic of caring is subjectively grounded and based on the nature of the stance that one has established with the other which will then guide appropriate behavior. One is reminded here of SC's reference to the "caring stance" she believed she developed while raising her youngest daughter and which she brought to her consulting work.

Tronto (1993) posits that care implies a reaching out to something other than the self. It is not self representational. It is not self-absorbing. Care implies that it will lead to some type of action and the acceptance of some kind of burden. Care focuses on maintaining, continuing, or repairing our world. It can be characterized as a single activity or can describe a process. Care is both a practice and disposition. It is concerned with the living actions that humans engage in during the process of everyday living. Care is a practice which is comprised of four separate yet interconnected phases: the caring about, taking care of, care giving, and care receiving. It is a practice that implies and involves thought

and actions, which are interrelated and directed toward some end. Providing an integrated, holistic way to meet concrete needs is the ideal of care. Conflict is inherent in the process.

Tronto (1993) sees mothering as a paradigmatic act of caring which is culturally constructed yet is also a universal aspect of human life. However, care has been marginalized to the private sphere and devalued as work and instead is seen as a sign of weakness. Care receives as well as gives. In this study, all of the co-researchers had a significant other that they believed supported them. Self care is important in the process and is highlighted in the care literature relating to the nursing (Agard, 1996; Becker, 1991; MacDonald, 1996) and teaching (Turner, 2000) professions in order to avoid "burn out." In this study, SC modeled a balanced life of self-care by physical exercise, limiting work to no more than 9 hours a day, and eating lunch. She also had volunteered with children at a pre-school during her daughters' early childhood which gave her more energy as compared to working with adults. She also valued relationships with extended family. She regretted that she couldn't give more to her community because of full time employment. BB played tennis weekly and took long vacations sailing in the South Pacific. She continued attending AA meetings on a regular basis. BB, at times, provided pro-bono external consulting as she felt there was more of a congruence between the organization's values and purpose which made for a more authentic consulting experience as compared to her own workplace. GC often traveled with her husband to visit her children. However, she regretted not having more time for female friends. Allowing her staff to emotionally abuse her clearly was not about caring for the self.

More recently, the concept of care and the ethic of care has been discussed in relation to organizational behavior within the realm of health care (Scott, Aiken, Mechanic & Moravcsik, 1995), business ethics (White, 1992), and more market driven businesses (Liedkta, 1996). Crittenden (2000) revises the work of Noddings (1984) and Tronto (1993) to make it more applicable to organizational practice.

Wood (1994) argues that it is crucial to position "care" more centrally in our cultural life through enacting structural and symbolic changes required to realize a re-configuration and reform of society. Caring is defined as an attitude or orientation that gives rise to a certain kind of thinking, attitudes, and moral stances that comprise an ethical orientation. The public domain of caring is seen in certain language in the business world as "mentor," "coach," "transformational leader," and "servant-leadership." SC and BB used coaching in their work. SC was a flexible manager who allowed employees, particularly parents, to work from home. SC's theme of "bringing a caring stance" to work gave an important definition to this study. BB was careful not to trespass upon the emotional boundaries of the people she managed, although she still experienced difficulty with men.

Transformational leadership competencies as described by Roll (1995), and illustrated in Table 1 of the literature review, were evident particularly in the narrative of SC and BB. For example, BB valued the alignment between her personal and company values. She believed that she first learned about the need for this alignment because of the ambiguity of the mothering experience. She also addressed the importance of listening and dialogue in her home and work life. Another example of transformational leadership competence is seen in SC's story about how she coached a younger staff person who did not have much consulting experience while she herself remained in the background yet available for support. Her present position of bringing care to the workplace encourages relationship and promotes harmony by efforts at humanizing the workplace and modeling caring interactions while coaching employees to take risks with new behavior, as simple as, eating candy at work.

The caring process both at home and at work involves four major behaviors namely: attention, responsibility, competence, and responsiveness (Tronto, 1993; Wood, 1994). The care process involves judgments that develop strategies for achieving certain ends. The capacity for attention, BB's major theme, is crucial for generic human interaction. That process consists of suspending thought so as to be

available, empty, and ready to be entered by its objects. One needs to suspend one's own goals, ambitions, plans for life, and concerns, in order to recognize and be attentive to others and "noticing needs." Being consumed with one's work role and egocentrically driven might make it difficult to provide this kind of mothering emotion work. All of the co-researchers discussed how they "held back" from their career during certain times in their children's development.

The capacity for responsibility is a second trait of caring that BB believed she learned first as a mother. Competence is a third trait of caring and all three co-researchers considered themselves to be competent mothers and workers although they had their unique difficulties.

The fourth trait of responsiveness was underscored by BB in reference to joining AA after her son called her the most terrible mother. SC described many instances of her responsiveness to employees she managed, her clients, and both her daughters. She was careful about not overshadowing an employee who doubted her consulting ability. She adapted to a more bureaucratic work environment than she preferred. Relating with her youngest daughter, she believed, brought a more process focus to her consulting style. She drove her oldest daughter to Kinko's at midnight to support her with a challenging writing project.

The events of the last few years, that have uncovered unethical practices within the business world of major proportion in decimating stock portfolio, employment opportunities, and retirement funds, have brought a call for more civility in government, businesses, educational institutions as well as in individual behavior. Articles appear in parenting magazines about raising ethical children. Business journals, reflecting the emerging ethical ethos (Liedtka, 1996), suggest how reconfiguring businesses to do the "right" thing is seen as not cheap or easy but that firms with that foundation may be able to point to "real" returns, loyal employees and a purportedly better bottom line (Fandray, 2000). While acknowledging that calculating the return on investment of this nature may be difficult, Fandray (2000),

using case examples from actual companies and organizational surveys, suggests that employees who feel that their company conducts business with honesty and integrity show higher levels of commitment than those who rate their companies low on these values.

Based on Liedtka's (1996) work which compared a caring organization that values relationship with the more market driven organization that values transaction, the practitioner of organizational development consulting might assist market driven companies to decentralize and provide more opportunity for the involvement of employees in strategic planning. BB assisted in such an experience by giving voice to 1,000 employees regarding the automation of their work. Sharing about the professional gratification of this experience brought tears to her eyes. All strategies that empower employees are also important. SC preferred to delegate when she was a manager and underscored the recognition of every employee's functioning.

For internal consulting, however, the practitioner's customer is the organization and senior management. This is usually the level at which the greatest resistance occurs. Consultants are aware that unless senior management values the consulting goals, little change can occur (Anderson & Anderson, 2001b; Block, 2000; Freedman & Zackrison, 2001; Nevis, 1987; Olson & Eoyang, 2001). BB reflected on her frustration in this area during the focus group when she shared that she was confined to working with her team rather than the larger organization around certain issues. GC however had "friends in high places" which served to protect her programs. SC had to adapt to her employer's more hierarchical organizational structure but was aware how difficult this was for her and the employees she managed. The internal consultant must focus on every level of the organizations functioning to effect lasting change (Anderson & Anderson, 2001b; Block, 2000; Freedman & Zackrison, 2001; Nevis, 1987; Olson & Eoyang, 2001). Similar to the field of health care as discussed by Scott, et al. (1995), all organizational systems interact with each other to impact the delivery of a product or service.

There has been movement in the recognition of care as a valuable commodity. In Fletcher's work carried out in 1999, relational activities of care were not considered work within the organizational culture of her female engineers. In 2002, SC reported that she was hired by an engineering firm to bring "care" to the workplace. This work group was endangering its productivity due to the lack of "emotional intelligence" (Goleman, 1997, 1998) in the workplace. The presence of candy on SC's desk was a simple strategy that she reported she used to normalize pleasurable eating on the job, in essence a kind of humanizing that workplace. She also reported that she used coaching and modeling as strategies in her work.

Unlike the work of the female engineers of Fletcher's (1999) study, the field of organizational development consulting as well as management uses a language that is similar to mothering or feminine relational practice concepts such as process, empowerment, development, coaching, mentoring, personal mastery, or "emotional intelligence" (Goleman, 1997,1998). An ethic of care was once considered only as a stereotypical moral norm for women especially in the domestic role of sustaining family life in the face of the harsh realities of a competitive marketplace and indifferent politics. Now the ethic of care is often related to the bottom line. Unlike the ethic of justice, it is person specific, person oriented and not rules based and can perhaps offer an opportunity for moral leadership which is an important competency for transformational leaders (Roll, 1998).

However, now that the ethic of care is related to the bottom line, will organizations misuse the concept? The recent activity of a national non-profit health insurance company, Care First, suggests that possibility. Recent newspaper accounts about the attempts of this company to become "for profit" is replete with information about how the top-level executives are overpaid while patients are over charged. This same disparity is suggested by the widening gap between the salary of lower level

employees as compared to top level management in organizations that "care" for their customers and employees.

The prevailing "mindset" within the literature on organizational development consulting has much in common with the notion of "care," Senge's et al. (1999) dance of change, and a more feminine world view (Maier, 2001). The emerging mindset of today's organizations differs from the industrial mindset of the past. The present mindset sees reality as a living system. Everything is in relationship connected and interdependent just as is the basis of the findings of this study. Bridges and connections are more prevalent and important than boundaries. The notion of power and control becomes one of co-creation and participation, just as the co-researchers experienced in this study. The subjective is valued equally with the objective as is the use of only the narratives for this study and conceptualizing the beliefs of the co-researchers as subjective knowledge. Life is seen as one continuous process and in constant motion. Systems are in the constant state of self-renewal just as BB is still learning to be "fully present." Chaos is valued over order and abundance, rather than scarcity, prevails (Anderson & Anderson, 2001b).

The literature in the field of organizational development consulting underscores the importance of personal mastery in consulting and management (Anderson & Anderson, 2001b). According to Senge, et al. (1999), management activities take place at every level of an organization and, therefore, unlike some previous management literature (Block, 1987; Hampton, Summer & Webber, 1982) leadership is separated from the concept of management. Given that leadership development is a life-long process, the area of personal mastery demonstrated the greatest variation among the co-researchers by virtue of the appearance of idealized perception on the part of BB and GC as compared to their actual self-reported behavior. If learning organizations are committed to the growth and development of employees, a greater emphasis is needed on training or experiences that will increase self-awareness and

improve emotional intelligence (Goleman, 1997, 1998). T-group sensitivity training is considered vital to the work of organizational development consulting, yet both BB and GC admitted that they did not participate in such training in favor of participating in a version of the training developed for managers which provided them more psychological safety. Anderson and Anderson (2001b) suggest that in addition to training for knowledge that focuses on what consultants and managers should know, and the skills they should have in order to do, more development is needed in a third area called "being." Like mothering, there is a lack of language to describe the concept of "being" within organizational culture. In addition to customizing the definition of "being" within an organizational culture, Anderson and Anderson (2001b) warn that such training must be credible, related to organizational results, and done in a safe atmosphere. BB shared during the focus group that she did not feel safe at her workplace, nor did most of her colleagues. She and GC agreed during the focus group that few employees return survey questionnaires about attitudes toward the organization, now that the surveys appear on-line, for fear of the lack of confidentiality.

Anderson and Anderson (2001b) offer design principles in developing a curriculum for conscious transformation which would include "being" modules. This study focuses on the "being modules" as they are considered the most recent innovations in the process of organizational transformation as well as having much in common with the mothering experience as described by the literature (Hart, 1992; Ruddick, 1989; Seery, 1996). Again, Anderson and Anderson (2001b) warn that the modules must be included in a "process" framework for learning and should deal with live-change cases, which provides for more experiential learning. They suggest 25 areas of learning within the "being" arena. These areas are functionally similar to ideal mothering activities, knowledge, and values that appear in the literature regarding mothering emotion work (Seery, 1996), the ideal thinking, values, virtues, and practices of mothering (Ruddick, 1989) as well as the ideal mothering epistemological

development described by Hart (1992). The need for an effective curriculum to ready a workplace for conscious transformational change suggests an important role for the field of adult learning informed by the subjective knowledge of mothering.

Implications for Career Counseling

Some argue that the present model of career counseling does not take into account the importance of family relationships to women and the fact that they are still held responsible for home and children in addition to their career (Cook, Heppner & O'Brien, 2002). In this study, all the co-researchers reported that they consciously held themselves back from more progressive upward career mobility so that they would have enough energy for family roles. More focus on the individual unique life history and resulting integrated mental map as well as recognition of the microsystem, macrosystem, and individual meaning making as suggested by Brott's (2001) "storied approach" needs more emphasis in counseling as well. A more politically active stance in efforts to reduce sexual, racial, and economic discrimination of women in general, as well as to assist in the development of more family-friendly personnel policies within the workplace (Cook, Heppner & O'Brien, 2002; Petzinger, T., 1999) and would bring Crittenden's (2000) vision of the "other" to an "ethic of care" in career counseling. Also, avoiding burnout as a counselor would implement the important self-care aspect of the concept.

If mothering contributes to a work role, although in some complex and indirect way, could mothering be viewed as possibly being a worthwhile experience that might be viewed as an important part of career development? Could the mothering experience of possible transformation with its unique meaning for the mother be associated in some complex way with opportunities for valuable self-development and the personal mastery that is necessary for transformational leaders?

Limitations of the Study and Suggestions for Future Research

The goals of this study were to give voice to the subjective knowledge of the co-researchers regarding the research questions and to assist in the development of a language to describe the mothering experience. Based on the theoretical framework of the case study method and using grounded theory as a method of data analysis, limitations of this study include the lack of triangulation of the data with those persons impacted by the mothering, consulting, and managerial activity of the co-researchers as well as the lack of non-participant observation of their functioning in the three roles to provide more validity regarding their belief system and self-reported behavior.

A follow-up study to this research would include interviews with BB's son and whether he felt that his mother was "fully present" to him at this time of her life as well as interviews with her present manager in terms of her use of "mothering emotion work" in the workplace. Non-participant observation of her during team meetings would provide rich data as to the extent of her personal mastery in the workplace.

Interviews with SC, her husband, and SC's youngest daughter, who just returned from her six months abroad, would be especially important to ascertain how "caring" SC had been during this daughter's re-entry into the family living experience. Non-participative observation of her "bringing care" to her current workplace would be especially important regarding the larger context of this study.

Interviews with selected employees of GC, her husband and children, especially her youngest son, would be important to understanding the idealized perception she uses in reporting her behavior in the three roles as well as how well she is managing her need to "protect by fighting for trust and safety" during the re-organization of her programs and position.

Summary

Although the mothering experience may contribute to workplace functioning in some complex and indirect ways, it is difficult to disentangle it from the other adult developmental and learning experiences of the three co-researchers in order to understand its real-life potential impact on organizational behavior. This study calls into question the validity of research that suggests a more causal and direct impact of mothering on work roles (Collins, 1998; Kaplan, 1994; Stern, 1992). In two cases, the actual reported behavior in the roles of mother, consultant, and manager was not consistent with the co-researchers' idealized belief system regarding the topic and demonstrated the appearance of contradictions in, as well as the limitation of using only self-reported behavior in the research design. Instead, this study explicates the subjective knowledge of the co-researchers regarding the research questions. All the co-researchers believed that they brought many valuable attitudes, attributes, skills, and perspectives from their mothering to their work. Their ideal theme of "care" which included the three themes of "being fully present," "protecting by fighting for trust and safety," and "bringing a caring stance," was linked to the "ethic of care." This study suggests that an "abstracted-ideal vision" (Hart, 1992, p.184) of mothering might offer an opportunity for developing a moral leadership that is so important to the process of organizational transformational of our present business environment.

The process of this study could be represented by the metaphor of a treasure hunt. The study focused on finding the most valuable (my bias) of jewels, the diamond, which represented the mothering experience. However, the chest in which I looked to find the diamond was filled with many other jewels, perhaps of lesser value (my bias), as represented by other adult learning experiences. Removing that diamond from the chest proved difficult at best. A mother's more subjective knowledge may offer the perception about the value of her mothering experience, its impact in her life, and the vision of care that it might bring to organizational practice as suggested by the narratives of this study.

References

Abbey, S. (1995). *Experiences of mothers who teach: Furthering the understanding of this dual role.* Unpublished doctoral dissertation. University of Toronto, Ontario.

Abbey, S. & O'Reilly, A. (Eds.). (1998). *Redefining motherhood: Changing identities and patterns.* Toronto: Second Story Press.

Ackerman, N. (1958). *The psychodynamics of family life*. New York: Basic Books.

Adler, N. (2001). Global leaders: Women of influence. In G. Powell (Ed.), *Handbook of gender and work* (pp. 239-262). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Agard, E. S. (1996). *Care as work and care as moral ideal: Towards a feminist understanding of ca*re. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Graduate Theological Union, Cleveland.

Anderson, K., Armitage, S., Jack, S., & Wittner, J. (1990). Beginning where we are: Feminist methodology in oral history. In J. Neilsen (Ed.), *Feminist research methods* (pp. 69-94). Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Anderson, L. & Anderson, D. (2001a.). *The change leader's roadmap.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass/Pfeiffer.

Anderson, L. & Anderson, D. (2001b). *Beyond change management: Advanced strategies for today's transformational leaders*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass/Pfeiffer.

Apple, R. & Golden, J. (Eds.). (1997). *Mothers & motherhood: Readings in American history.* Columbus: Ohio State University Press.

ARM. (1998). Website for Association for Research on Mothering. Available: Retrieved on 2/1/2001 from Association for Research on Mothering, http:www.yorku.ca/crm/ARM%20 info/HISTORY.HTM.

Barlow, A. (1993). *Expanding the boundaries: Psychosocial processes of mothering.* Unpublished

   doctoral dissertation, University of Calgary, Calgary, Alberta, Canada.

Baron, A. S. (1987, January-March). Working parents: Shifting traditional roles. *Business*, *37*, 36-37.

Becker, P. H. (1991). *Perspectives of ethical care: A grounded theory approach.* Unpublished doctoral

   dissertation, Columbia University Teachers College, New York.

Belenky, M., Clinchy, B., Goldberger J., & Tarule, N. (1986). *Women's ways of knowing: The

   development of self, voice, and mind*. New York: Basic Books.

Bernard, J. (1974). *The future of motherhood.* New York: Dial Press.

Bettelheim, B. (1987). *A good enough parent.* New York: Vintage Book

Block, P. (1987). *The empowered manager: Positive political skills at work.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Block, P. (2000). *Flawless consulting: A guide to getting your expertise used* (2nd ed.). San Francisco:

   Jossey-Bass/Pfeiffer.

Bloom, L. (1998). *Under the sign of hope: Feminist methodology and narrative interpretation*. Albany:

   State University of New York.

Bocknek, G. (1986). *The young adult.* New York: Gardner Press.

Bolman, L.& Deal, T. (1991). *Reframing organizations: Artistry, choice, and leadership.* San

   Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Bolton, M. (2000). *The third shift: Managing hard choices in our careers, homes, and lives as women.*

   San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Booth, A., Crouter, A., & Shanahan., P. (1999). *Transitions to adulthood in a changing economy.*

   Westport, CT: Praeger.

Boris, E. (1994). Mothers are not workers: Homework regulation and the construction of motherhood, 1948-1953. In E. G. Chang & L. Forcey (Eds.), *Mothering: Ideology, experience, and agency* (pp. 161-180). New York: Routledge.

Boucouvalas, M. (1980). Transpersonal psychology: A working outline of the field. *The Journal* of *Transpersonal Psychology*, *12* (1), 37-46.

Boucouvalas, M. (1981). Transpersonal psychology: Scope and challenges. *The Australian Journal of Transpersonal Psychology, 1* (2), 136-159.

Boucouvalas, M. (1983). Social transformation, lifelong learning, and the fourth force-transpersonal psychology. *Lifelong learning: The adult years*, *6* (7), 6-9.

Boucouvalas, M. (1993). Consciousness and learning: New and renewed approaches. *New directions in adult and continuing education*, *57*, 57-69.

Boucouvalas, M. (1997). Intuition: The concept and the experience. In R. Davis-Floyd & P. Arvidson (Eds.), *Intuition: The inside story* (pp. 3-18). New York: Routledge.

Boucouvalas, M. (1999). Following the movement: From transpersonal psychology to a multi-disciplinary transpersonal orientation. *The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology, 31* (1), 27-39.

Boucouvalas, M. (2000). The transpersonal orientation as a framework for understanding adult development and creative processes. In M. Miller & S. Cook-Greater (Eds.), *Spirituality, creativity, and transcendence: Paths to integrity and wisdom in the mature self.* Greenwich, CT: Ablex.

Boucouvalas, M. & Krupp, J. (1989). Adult development and learning. In S. Merriam & P. Cunningham (Eds.), *Handbook of adult and continuing education* (pp. 183-200).San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Boydell, T. (1976). *Experiential learning*. Manchester: Manchester Monographs.

Brabeck, M. (Ed.). (1989). *Who cares: Theory, research, and educational implications of the ethic of care.* New York: Praeger

Brott, P. E. (2001). A storied approach: A postmodern perspective for career counseling. *The Career Development Quarterly*, *49*, 304-313.

Brown, S., Lumley, J. & Small, R. (1994). *Missing voices*: *The experience of motherhood.* Melbourne: Oxford University Press.

Burton, L., Dittmer, J.,& Loveless, C. (1992). *What's a smart woman like you doing at home?* (Rev. ed.). Vienna, VA: Mothers at Home.

Chawla, S. & Renesch, J. (Eds.).*Learning organizations: Developing cultures for tomorrow's workplace*. Portland, OR: Productivity Press.

Chodorow, N. (1978). *The reproduction of mothering: Psychoanalysis and the sociology of gender*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Coffey, A. & Atkinson, P. (1996). *Making sense of qualitative data: Complementary research strategies.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Cline, M. G. (2001). Criticism of *Mothers as teachers, teachers as mothers*, by Alice Collins. Falls Church, Virginia.

Coll, C., Surrey, J.,& Weingarten, K. (Eds.). (1998). *Mothering against the odds: Diverse voices of contemporary mothers.* New York: The Guilford Press.

Collins, A. (1998). Mothers as teachers, teachers as mothers. In S. Abbey & A. O'Reilly (Eds.), *Redefining motherhood: Changing identities and patterns.* Toronto: Second Story Press.

Comart, J. (1983). *Integrating maternal and professional identities: Paradox for the new mother*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, California School of Professional Psychology, Berkeley/Alameda.

Conran, S. (1999, May). How does she manage? *Management Today*, *68* (5), 72-75.

Cook, E., Heppner, M., & O'Brien, K. (2002). Feminism and women's career development: An ecological perspective. In S. Niles (Ed.), *Adult career development: Concepts, issues, and practices* (3rd ed.). Tulsa, OK: National Career Development Association.

Correa, M., Stone, K., Klein, E., Astrachan, J., Kossek, E., & Komarraju, M. (1988). Reactions to women in authority: The impact of gender in group relations conferences. *Journal of Applied Behavioral Science*, *24* (3), 219-233.

Costello, R. (Ed.). (1991). *Webster's College Dictionary.* New York: Random House.

Coulter, X. (2001, June). *The hidden transformation of women through mothering*. Paper presented at the 16th Annual Symposium of the Society for Research in Adult Development: Parenting as a Path for Adult Development, New York, N.Y.,

Covin, T. J. & Harris, M. (1995). Viewpoint: Perspectives on women in consulting. *Journal* of *Organization Change Management, 8* (1), 7-11.

Crittenden, A. (2001). *The price of motherhood: Why is the most important job in the world still the least valued?* New York: Metropolitan Books/Henry Holt and Co.

Crittenden, C. C. (2000). *Clarifying care: Elaborating and expanding the care ethic*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Tennessee, Knoxville, TN.

Crouter, A. C. (1984). Spillover from family to work: The neglected side of the work-family interface. *Human Relations*, *37* (6), 425-442.

Daly, B. & Reddy, M. (Eds.). (1991). *Narrating mothers: Theorizing maternal subjectivities*. Knoxville, TN: University of Tennessee Press.

Derry, R. (1999). The mother-child paradigm and its relevance to the workplace. *Business and Society, 38* (2), 217-225.

Devault, M. (1990). *Feeding the family*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Dewey, J. (1963). *Experience and education.* New York: McMillan.

DiQuinzio, P. (1999). *The Impossibility of motherhood: Feminism, individualism and the problem of mothering*. New York: Routledge.

Durrance, B. (1998, December). Some explicit thoughts on tacit learning. *Training and Development,* 52 (12), 24-29.

Erkut, S. (2001). *Inside women's power: Learning from leaders.* Unpublished manuscript, Wellesley, MA.

Everingham, C. (1994). *Motherhood and modernity*. London: Open University Press.

Fandray, D. (2000). The ethical company. *Workforc*e, *79* (12), 74-77.

Fenwick, T. (1994*). New perspectives on professionals' learning: The liberatory and limiting potential of dialogue*. San Francisco: Jossey Bass.

Fierman, J. (1990, December 17). Do women manage differently? *Fortune*, *122* (15),115-118.

Fineman, S. (Ed.). (1993). *Emotion in organizations*. London: Sage.

Fletcher, J. K. (1995). Radically transforming work for the 21st century: A feminist reconstruction of "real" work. *Academy of Management Journal* (Best Papers Proceedings), *38* (39), 448-452.

Fletcher, J. K. (1999). *Disappearing acts.* Cambridge: MIT Press.

Fredriksen-Goldsen, K. & Scharlach, A. (2001). *Families and work: New directions in the twenty-first century*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Freedman, A. & Zackrison, R. (2001). *Finding your way in the consulting jungle: A guide book for organization development practitioners* . San Francisco: Jossey-Bass/Pfeiffer.

Frenier, C. (1997). *Business and the feminine principle: The untapped resouce.* Boston: Butterworth-Heinemann.

Friedman, S. & Greenhaus, J. (2000). *Work and family--allies or enemies: What happens when business professionals confront life choices*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Garey, A. (1999). *Weaving work and motherhood*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.

Gerstel, N. & Grossman, H. (1987). *Families and work*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.

Gilligan, C. (1982). *In a different voice: Psychological theory and women's development*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Glaser, B. & Strauss, A. (1967). *The discovery of grounded theory*. New York: Aldine De Gruyter.

Glenn, E., Chang, G., & Forcey, L. (Eds.). (1994). *Mothering: Ideology, experience and agency*. New York: Routledge.

Goldberger, N. R., Tarule, J., & Clinchy, B. (1996). *Knowledge, difference, and power: Essays inspired by women's ways of knowing*. New York: Basic Books.

Goldman, K. (1996). *If you can raise kids, you can get a good job*. New York: Harper.

Goldscheider, F. & Goldscheider, C. (1999). *The changing transition to adulthood*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Goleman, D. (1997*). Emotional intelligence.* New York: Bantam Books.

Goleman, D. (1998). *Working with emotional intelligence.* New York: Bantam Publishing.

Gould, J. (1997). *Juggling: A memoir of work, family, and feminism.* New York: The Feminist Press.

Greenhaus, J. & Parasuraman, S. (2001). Research on work, family, and gender. In G. N. Powell (Ed.), *Handbook of gender and work* (pp. 391-412). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Grumet, M. (1992). Existential and phenomenological foundations of autobiographical methodology. In W. Pinar & W. Reynolds (Eds.), *Understanding curriculum as phenomenological and deconstructed text* (pp. 28-43). New York: Teachers College Press.

Hampton, D., Summer, C., & Webber, R. (1982). *Organizational behavior and the practice of management* (4th ed.). Glenview, IL: Scott, Foresman and Company.

Han, S. & Moen, P. (1999, March). Work and family over time: A life course approach. *The Annals of the American Academy of the Political and Social Sciences, 562*, 98-110.

Harris, M. E. (1995). What has it been like to be a woman consultant over the last two decades? *Journal of Organization Change Management, 8* (1), 32-43.

Hart, M. (1992). *Working and educating for life*. New York: Routledge.

Hartmen, M. (1999). *Talking leadership: Conversations with powerful women.* New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press.

Hays, S. (1996). *The cultural contradictions of motherhood.* New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.

Hearn, J. (1993). Emotive subjects: Organizational men, organizational masculinities and the (de) construction of 'emotions'. In S. Fineman (Ed.), *Emotion in organizations*. London: Sage.

Held, V. (1993). *Feminist morality: Transforming culture, society, and politics*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

Hochschild, A. R. (1983). *The managed heart*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Hochschild, A. R. (1989). *Second shift: Working parents and the revolution at home.* New York: Viking.

Hochschild, A. R. (1993). Preface. In S. Fineman (Ed.), *Emotion in organizations* (pp. ix-xiii). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Hochschild, A. R. (1997). *Time bind*. New York: Henry Holt and Company.

Jacques, R. (1992, July). Critique and theory building: Producing knowledge "from the kitchen." *Academy of Management Review, 17* (3), 582-606.

Janesick, V. The Choreography of qualitiative research design. In N. Denzin & Y. Lincoln (Eds.), *Handbook of qualitative research* (2nd ed., pp. 379-420). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Jordon, J. A., Kaplan, A., Miller, B., Stiver, & Surry, J. (1991). *Women's growth in con*nec*tion: Writings from the Stone Center*. New York: The Guilford Press.

Kaplan, K. (1994). *An exploration of the experiences and perceptions of women organization development consultants: Changes, challenges, contributions, lessons*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, George Washington University, Washington, DC.

Kaplan, K. (1995). Women's voices in organizational development: Questions, stories, and implications. *Journal of Organizational Change Management*, *8* (1), 52-80.

Kaplan, M. (1992). *Mothers' images of motherhood: Case studies of twelve mothers*. London: Routledge.

Kessler-Harris, A. (1982). *Out to work*: *A history of* wage-*earning women in the United States*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Kitchen, P. (1996, February 18). Mother skills can be useful in work world fast track. *Newsday, 262,* 1-3

Knowles, J. & Cole, E. (Eds.).(1990). *Motherhood: A feminist perspective.* New York: Haworth Press.

Klunk, C. D. (1999). *Workplace devaluation: Learning from experience*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, Falls Church, VA.

Kolb, D. (1984). *Experiential learning: Experience as the source of learning and development*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, Inc.

Kolberg, L. (1981). *The philosophy of moral development.* San Francisco: Harper & Row.

Kotter, J. (1990). *A force for change: How leadership differs from management*. New York: The Free Press.

Lajoie, D. H & Shapiro, S. I. (1992). Definitions of transpersonal psychology: The first 23 years. *The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology, 24* (1), 79-98.

Lakoff, G. & Johnson, M. (1999). *Philosophy in the flesh: The embodied mind and its challenge to western thought*. New York: Basic Books.

Larrabee, M. (1993). *An ethic of care: Feminist and interdisciplinary pers*pectives. New York: Routledge.

Larwood, L. & Gattiker, U. (1985). Rational bias and interorganizational power in the employment of management consultants. *Group and Organization Studies*, *10* (1), 3-17.

Lerner, H. (1985). *The dance of anger: A woman's guide to changing the patterns of intimate relationships*. New York: Harper & Row.

Lerner, H. (1989). *The dance of intimacy: A woman's guide to courageous acts of change in ke*y *relationships*. New York: Harper & Row.

Lerner, H. (1998). *The mother dance: How children change your life*. New York: Harper Collins.

Levinson, D. J. (1978). *The seasons of a man's life*. New York: Alfred A. Knopf.

Levinson, D. J. (1996). *The seasons of a woman's life*. New York: Alfred A. Knopf.

Lewin, K. (1951). *Field theory in social sciences*. New York: Harper & Row.

Lewin, R. & Birute, R. (2001). *Weaving complexity and business: Engaging the soul at w*ork. New York: Texere LLC.

Liedtka, J. M. (1996). Feminist morality and competitive reality: A role for an ethic of care? *Business Ethics Quarterly*, *6* (2), 179-200.

Mac Donald, G. (1996). *Sustaining energy for caring: The experience of mothers who are nurses*. Unpublished Ed.D., University of Toronto, Toronto, Ontario, Canada.

Maier, M. (2001). On the gendered substructure of organization: Dimensions and dilemmas of corporate masculinity. In G. N. Powell (Ed.), *Handbook of gender and work*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Marshall, J. (2000). *Leadership now includes nurturing. Financial Execu*tive, *16* (4), 15-16.

Maslow, A. H. (1970). *Motivation and personality* (2nd. ed.). New York: Harper and Row.

Maushart, S. (1999). *The mask of motherhood: How becoming a mother changes everything and why* we *pretend it doesn't*. New York: The New Press.

Merriam, S. (1998). *Qualitative research and case study applications in education. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass*

Merriam, S. & Caffarella, R. (1991). *Learning in adulthood*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Merriam, S. & Clark, M. (1991). *Life lines: Patterns of work, love, and learning in adulthood*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.

Merriam, S. & Cunningham, P. (Eds.). (1989). *Handbook of adult and continuing education.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Merriam, S. & Simpson, E. (1995). *Guide to research for educators and trainers of adults. (2nd. ed.).* Malabar, FL: Krieger Publishing Company.

Mezirow, J. (1981). A critical theory of adult learning and education. *Adult Education Quarterly*, *32*, 3-24.

Mezirow, J. (1991). *Transformative dimensions of adult learning*. San Francisco: Jossey/Bass.

Mezirow, J. & Associates (1990). *Fostering critical reflection in adulthood: A guide to transformative and emanacipatory learning*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Miller, J. B. (1986). *Toward a new psychology for wome*n (2nd. ed.). Boston: Beacon Press.

Morris, L. (1995). Developmental strategies for the knowledge era. In S. Chawla & J. Renesch (Eds.), *Learning organizations: Developing cultures for tomorrow's workplace*. Portland, OR: Productivity Press.

Murphy, S. (1994). *Women's experience balancing multiple roles: Holistically processing on-going acceptable peace*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Boston College, Boston.

Nelton, S. (1991). Men, women and leadership. *Nations' Business, 75 (5),* 16-22.

Nelton, S. & Berney, K. (1987, May). Women: The second wave. *Nation's Business*, *68*, 18-27.

Nevis, E.(1987). *Organizational consulting: A Gestalt approach* . New York: Gardner Press

Noddings, N. (1984). *Caring: A feminine approach to ethics and moral education*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Oakley, A. (1981). *Women's work: The housewife, past and present*. New York: Vintage Books.

Olson, E. & Eoyang, G. (2001). *Facilitating organizational change: Lessons from complexity science*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass/Pfeiffer.

O'Reilly, A. (1998). Association for Research on Mothering, (Website). Andrea O'Reilly, Founding President. Retrieved 3/2001. Available: www.yorku.ca/crm/ARM%20info/History.HTM (1998).

Organization Development Network (2001) *Membership roster*. South Orange, NJ: ODN

Parasuraman, S. & Greenhaus, J. (1997). *Integrating work and family: Challenges and choices for a changing world.* Westport, CT: Quorum.

Pedler, M., Burgoyne, J., & Boydell, T. (1997). *The learning company: A strategy for sustainable development* (2nd. ed.). London: McGraw-Hill.

Perry, W. (1968). *Forms of intellectual and ethical development in the college ye*ars. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston.

Petzinger, T. (1999). *The new pioneers: The men and women who are transforming the workplace and marketplace*. New York: Simon and Schuster.

Phoenix, A., Woollett, A., & Lloyd, E. (1991). *Motherhood: Meanings, practices & ideologies.* London: Sage Publications.

Piaget, J. (1970). *Genetic epistemology*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Polanyi, M. (1967). *The tacit dimension*. New York: Doubleday & Co.

Powell, G. N. (Ed.). (1999). *Handbook of gender and work*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Reinharz, S. (1992). *Feminist methods in social research.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Ribbens, J. (1994) . *Mothers and their children: A feminist sociology of childrearing.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Rich, A. (1976). *Of women born: Motherhood as experience and institution*. New York: W.W. Norton.

Richardson, D. (1993). *Women, motherhood, and childrearing.* New York: St. Martin Press.

Rolls, J. (1995). The transformational leader: The wellspring of the learning organization. In S. Chawla & J. Renesch (Eds.), *Learning organizations: Developing cultures for tomorrow's workplace* (pp. 101-108). Portland, OR: Productivity Press.

Rossiter, A. (1988). *From private to public: A feminist exploration of early mothering*. Toronto: The Women's Press.

Rubin, H. & Rubin, I. (1995). *Qualitative interviewing: The art of hearing data*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Ruddick, S. (1989). *Maternal thinking: Toward a politics of peace*. Boston: Beacon Press.

Salter, J. (1998). *Mothering with soul: Raising children as special work*. Gloucestershire, England: Hawthorn Press.

Schminke, M. (1997). Gender differences in ethical frameworks and evaluation of others' choices in

ethical dilemmas. *Journal of Business Ethics*, *6* (1), 55-65.

Scott, R., Aiken, L., Mechanic, D., & Moravcsik, J. (1995). Organizational aspects of caring. *The

Milbank Quarterly*, *73* (1), 77-95.

Seery, B. (1996). *Four types of mothering emotion work: Distress management, ego work, relationship

management, and pleasure/enjoyment work (domestic work).* Unpublished doctoral dissertation,

The State University of Pennsylvania.

Seidel, J. (1998). *Ethnograph v5.0: A users guide.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Senge, P. (1990). *The fifth discipline*. New York: Currency & Doubleday.

Senge, P., Kleiner, A., Roberts, C., Ross, R., Roth, G., & Smith, B. (1999). *The dance of change: The

challenges of sustaining momentum in learning organizations.* New York: Doubleday/Currency.

Smith-Pierce, S. (1994). *Juggling: A heuristic study of first time mothers.* Unpublished doctoral

dissertation, Union Institute Graduate School, Cleveland, OH.

Stern, D. (1995). *The motherhood constellation.* New York: Basic Books.

Stern, J. (1992). *Career women/mothers: A qualitative study of the positive carryover from home to

work*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, The Fielding Institute.

Sternberg, R. & Caruso, D. (1985). Practical modes of knowing. In E. Eisner (ed.) *Learning and

teaching the ways of knowing.* 84th Yearbook, part 2. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Stivers, B. P. & Campbell, J. E. (1995). Characterizing accounting consultants: Gender does make a

difference. *Journal of Organization Change Management*, *8* (1), 23-31.

Stake, R. (2001). Case studies. In N. Denzin & Y. Lincoln (Eds.), *Handbook of qualitative research*

(2nd ed., pp. 435-454). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Strauss, A. & Corbin, J. (1998). *Basics of qualitative research: Grounded theory procedures and techniques*. Newberry Park, CA: Sage.

Stringer, D. (1995). The role of women in workplace diversity consulting. *Journal of Organizational Change Management*, *8* (1), 44-51.

Surrey, J. (1983). *Self-in-relation: A theory of women's development*. Paper presented at the Stone Center Colloquium, Wellesley, MA.

Surrey, J. (1990). Mother-blaming and clinical theory. In J. Knowles & E. Cole (Eds.), *Motherhood: A feminist perspective*. New York: The Haworth Press.

Swigart, J. (1998). *The Myth of the perfect mother: Parenting without guilt* . Lincolnwood, Il. : Contemporary Books.

Szwajkowski, E. & Larwood, L. (1991). Rational decision processes and sex discrimination: Testing 'rational' bias theory. *Journal of Organizational Behavior*, *12*, 507-527.

Tannen, D. (1994). *Gender and discourse*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Taylor, E. (1997). Building upon the theoretical debate: A critical review of the empirical studies of Mezirows's transformative learning theory. *Adult Education Quarterly*, *48* (1), 34-49.

Thurer, S. (1994). *The myths of motherhood*. New York: Houghton Mifflin Co.

Tisdell, E. (1993, Spring). Feminism and adult learning: Power, pedagogy, and praxis. *An Update on Adult Learning Theory*, *57*, 91-103.

Tronto, J. C. (1993). *Moral boundaries: A political argument for an ethic of c*are. New York: Routledge.

Turner, G. M. (2000). *Care of self and care of others: Justice and identity in care*. Unpublished Doctor of Philosophy, The University of North Carolina at Greensboro, Greensboro, North Carolina.

Vaillant, G. (1977). *Adaptation to life*. Boston: Little Brown and Company.

Valian, V. (1998). *Why so slow: The advancement of women*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Varney, G. (1976). *An organizational development approach to management development*. Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley Pub. Co.

Vasilyuk, F. (1992). *The psychology of experiencing*. New York: New York University Press.

Verela, F., Thompson, E., & Rosch, E. (1997). *The embodied mind: Cognitive science and human experience.* Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Viorst, J. (1986). *Necessary losses*. New York: Simon & Schuster.

Waclawski, J., Church, A., & Burke, W. (1995). Women in organization development: A profile of the intervention styles and values of today's practitioners. *Organizational Change Management, 8* (1), 12-22.

Watkins, J. & Mohr, B. (2001). *Appreciative inquiry: Change at the speed of imagination. In W. Rothwell, R. Sullivan, & K. Quade (Eds.),* Practicing organizational development: The change agent series for groups and organizations. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass/Pfeiffer.

Watson, T. J. (2001). The emergent manager and processes of management pre-learning. *Management Learning, 32* (2), 221-235.

Weiner, L. (1985). *From working girl to working mother: The female labor force in the United States*, *1820-1980*. Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina.

Weisbord, M. (1987). *Productive workplaces: Organizing and managing for dignity, meaning, a*nd *community*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

White, T. (1992). Business, ethics, and Carol Gilligan's "Two Voices." *Business Ethics Quarterly, 2* (1), 51-59.

Wood, J. (1994). *Who cares: Women, care, and culture*. Carbondale, IL: Southern Illinois University Press.

Yin, R. K. (1994). *Case study research: Design and methods* (2nd. ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage

Publications.

Youngblade, L. M. (1999). *Mothers at work: Effects on children's well-being.* Cambridge: University

Press.

Appendices

Appendix A: Pool of Co-Researchers

BB, Caucasian female, age 59, has a married son aged 28, and is a director of leadership development at a quasi-federal agency.

GC, Caucasian female, age 62, has a married daughter, aged 39, a married son aged 36 and a single son aged 31. She has three grandchildren. She is an administrator of a federal counseling service and is an internal organizational development consultant at a department of the federal government.

SC, Caucasian female, age 52, has two daughters, ages 15 and 18 and at the time of our individual interviews was a project manager and internal organizational development consultant for a small business service that contracts with the federal government.

JM, Caucasian female, age 52, has one daughter, aged 19 who was living at home and attending a local community college. She has never married. She is an internal organizational development consultant for a federal agency where she also manages a coaching program. Not part of final data analysis due to internal discrepancies.

Appendix B: Informed Consent Form

Title of Project: Case Studies of Internal Organizational Development

Consultant/Manager/Mothers

Investigator: Patricia A. Morgan

I. The Purpose of this Research:

This is an exploratory study of the mothering experiences of internal organizational development consultant/managers who perceive that their mothering experience informed their professional functioning. This study will seek to understand the mothering experience of these women and how it operates in the professional role. There is a lack of scholarly knowledge, which explicates the learning that emanates from the mothering experience. Adult development and learning theory suggest that being able to validate one's personal experience through one's narrative can link the rational knowledge of the public world and one's lived experiences. This study will afford the co-researchers an opportunity to legitimatize the knowledge that mothering provides as well as assist in further developing a language to describe this experience. In doing so, the historically devalued mothering experience may be accorded more value as important "work" that can inform professional work and therefore is vital for individual, organizational and societal learning. The case studies of this study present more data for public dialogue to facilitate professional and organizational practice.

II. Procedures

Participants as co-researchers are integral to this study. As a co-researcher, you will be encouraged to develop a professional collaboration with the researcher to tell your experience, dialogue on the meaning of the experience, and the internal learning process. After the interviews have been completed with all the participants, you will be expected to participate in a focus group to examine the

result of the analyses and develop a response to the research questions. To insure confidentiality and anonymity, you and your work place will be given a pseudonym. Please refer to Section V. for more specific information about anonymity and confidentiality.

Two interviews, lasting approximately ninety minutes will be taped (audio). The purpose of taping the interview is for convenience and accuracy of data. The tapes will be immediately transcribed and submitted for your review to verify, edit, or change to ensure that the transcript accurately reflects what you meant. Once the transcript is complete, any identifying information will be excised. Only a completely anonymous transcription will be analyzed.

III. Risks

In discussing your professional role, you may feel you are prejudicial regarding your workplace or employment status. Protection against these risks will be carefully followed and includes your right to refuse to answer any question or probe or to withdraw from the study at any time. Your exercise of these rights will be respected.

IV. Benefits

Your participation in this study is important. You can use this opportunity to enhance the value of the mothering experience, which continues to be devalued, by explicating knowledge that often remains unknown, not thought about, subconscious, or even unconscious yet is vital to individual, professional, and organizational learning. You will be a more recent voice for women in the field of organizational development consulting which has been lacking despite their greater numbers as compared to men. Overall, you will be adding to scholarly knowledge about the topic.

You will not receive any tangible benefits such as compensation of any form for participation in this study, nor is there any promise or guarantee of benefits to encourage your participation.

If you would like a summary of the research results at a later date, you may contact Patricia A. Morgan.

V. Extent of Anonymity and Confidentiality

The design of this study promises anonymity and confidentiality to participants. Anonymity (individuals cannot be identified) will be accomplished by the following procedures:

- Audiotaping of the interviews will only be done with your permission. The purpose of the taping is for convenience and accuracy of what is said.

- Before taping begins, you will select a pseudonym for yourself and your organization. All references to you and your organization will be disguised.

- Tapes will be immediately transcribed by the researcher. Any identifying information will be excised.

- As a co-researcher/participant, you will also review transcripts for accuracy and anonymity. Identifying information will be excised.

- Tapes will be stored in a bank safe deposit box for seven years. Seven years is not a legal requirement, but a standard for this type of research. After seven years, the tapes will be destroyed.

- After all analyses are completed, transcripts will be destroyed.

Confidentiality (individuals can be identified, but the researchers promise not to divulge that information) is promised. Researchers include the investigator, members of the dissertation committee, and co-researchers who participate in the concluding focus group. The promise of confidentiality may be broken if a participant is believed to be a threat to herself or others. If this should happen, the investigator will notify the appropriate authorities.

VI. Compensation

No form of compensation is to be earned for participant in this study.

VII. Freedom to Withdraw

Participants' right to refuse to answer any question, comment on any issue or withdraw from the study at any will be respected and followed.

VIII. Approval of Research

This research project has been approved, as required, by the Institutional Review Board for Research Involving Human Subjects as Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, by Department of Research

IX. Subject's Responsibilities

I have read and understand the Informed Consent and conditions of this project. I have had all my questions answered. I hereby acknowledge the above and give my voluntary consent for participation in this project.

If I participate, I may withdraw at any time without penalty. I agree to abide by the rules of this project.

_____

    Signature   Date

Should I have any questions about this research or its conduct, I may contact:

Patricia A. Morgan_____
Investigator   Phone

Marcie Boucouvalas_____(signature on file)_____
Faculty Advisor   Phone

M. G. Cline_____(signature on file)_____
IRB Departmental Reviewer   Phone
Northern Virginia Graduate Center

Appendix C: Questions to Guide the Interview Process

1. Introduction:
    - Description of study, method, ethical release
    - Choice of pseudonym or some initials
    - Discussion of anonymity and confidentiality parameters
    - Expectations regarding the role of co-researcher

2. The First Interview
    - Let's begin with your present job (a neutral question to put person at ease)

    Probes:
    - What do you do and where, the nature of the organization?
    - Could you tell me some stories about your organizational consulting work?
    - Could you tell me some stories about your management experiences?
    - How would you describe yourself as a professional?
    - Would you describe a typical day and weekend?
    - What are some insights about the connection between mothering and consulting?
    - What are some insights about the connection between mothering and managing?
    - Let's talk about your mothering experience

    Probes:
    - Tell me about your pregnancy, birth and delivery experience and how it impacted you.
    - Tell me some stories about each of your children during developmental phases of infancy, childhood, adolescence and adult hood
    - How did you combine work and mothering during your children's developmental phases?
    - What kind of childcare arrangements did you make?
    - When children were at home, what was a typical day and weekend like?
    - What advice would you give to women with families who are entering the consulting field?
    - How has mothering helped or hindered your work?
    - Let's talk about your background

    Probes:
    - What was it like to live in your family of origin?
    - Tell me some stories about your adolescence and early adulthood
    - What were some of your other adult learning experiences such as continuing education, workplace training, psychotherapy, and self-help groups?

3. The Second Interview

    - After coding and analysis of the first interview, a second interview was scheduled. The interview began with questions that emerged from the data analysis and other insights as well as obtaining more information on various topical areas that needed richer data. Prior to this interview, the co-researcher had already received a transcription of the first interview. The second interview began with a discussion

about whether the first interview adequately described what the co-researcher wanted to share about the topics.

Probe:

- Could you tell me more about…..?
- Is there anything else I should know that I didn't ask that would be helpful to the project?

4.   Focus Group

- The purpose of the focus group was to share the themes that emerged from the coding and analysis of the data for each co-researcher and if they agreed that their theme seemed to describe them. It was also important to obtain their insights about the notion of care that emerged from the data as well as their thoughts about the separation of mothering from other adult learning experiences or development.
- Would you introduce yourself and share about how this project has affected you?
- What other insights do you have about the influence of mothering on professional practice?
- What does the word "care" mean to you?
- Could you share some stories about examples of care in your work?
- Can you separate out the mothering experience from other adult learning experiences and the normal maturing process?
- How does your work address the three goals of mothering which are to protect, nurture and train?
- It must be noted that it was not always necessary to ask the specific questions listed above as often the information emerged naturally in the course and flow of the interviews. The researcher's thirty years of psychotherapeutic interviewing led the co-researchers to talk at length about topical areas as they felt that they were being empathetically heard.
- Occasionally a question was asked about a seemingly relevant topic that appeared on the schedule used in prior research on this subject. Those questions produced the thinnest data and sometimes interfered with the more natural conversational flow of the interview.

Grounded theory seeks to produce substantive theory grounded in the data. Therefore, the interviews tried to elicit as many everyday details about the co-researcher's lives that impacted the research question. The main focus then was to obtain details of the co-researcher's mothering, consulting, and management experiences in order to learn how these three experiences played out in their lives.

Appendix D: Topical Guide

Issues Related to Dual Role of Mother/OD-Manager Role

(Adapted from various literature and Sharon Abbey, Experiences of Mothers Who Teach: Furthering the Understanding of This Dual Role, Unpublished thesis. Toronto: York University, 1995)

1. Images
   - What recollections, anecdotes, metaphors, special moments, typical events, significant experiences or awful times that stand out for you as you think about your life as a mother/manger/OD?
   - What would you do differently?

2. Dual Experiences of Private and Public Life
   - What are the dynamics, tensions, and complexities in this dual role?
   - How did you begin and make choices along the way?
   - How have you set boundaries between motherhood and management/OD
   - What communication systems are in place in both domains and between the two?
   - How is authority and leadership handled in both places?

3. Transformations
   - How have you changed as a result of motherhood/manager/OD
   - How have mothering and management/OD influenced each other?
   - What have you learned along the way? What advice would you give women starting out as mothers/managers/OD?

4. Emotions
   - How are your feelings affected by these two roles?
   - What are the sources of satisfactions, conflict, guilt, support, confirmation?
   - How valued and worthwhile are you made to feel in both roles? Who provides or should provide this feedback? How adequate is this?
   - What are your hopes as a mother/manager/OD?
   - How does the ethics of caring and competition affect you?

5. Logistics
   - Describe your methods of coping with dual roles, organizational strategies, and routines that work for you.

6. Cultural Issues
   - What does society, family and institutions expect of good mothers/managers/OD
   - How does this serve to shape the roles of mothers/Managers/OD
   - How well do you measure up to these expectations? Is there any guilt?
   - How do you see a gendered division of labor at home and at work. How would you like to see this change?

7. Ways of Knowing
    - What kinds of knowing do mothers rely on beyond the cognitive(e.g. Intuitive, relational, inter-personal, connected, empathetic, organic?)

Appendix E: BB

Appendix F: GC

Appendix G: SC

Appendix H: Glossary

This glossary is intended to assist the reader's understanding of the researcher's thinking with regard to the data collection process, analysis of the data, the writing of the text of the narratives, the findings of the study as well as the conclusions reached.

Adult child: at least 18 years of age, which is considered the legal age in most states in order to enter into contracts or execute deeds (Costello, 1991).

Belief: Statements about what the mothering experience brings to the work role as stated by the co-researchers. It is more abstract than self-reports and is usually not stories about actual behavior. The belief may be verbalized by the co-researcher or stated by the researcher in the written report as an integration of the stories and statements given by the co-researchers and often is often referred to as a belief system in the text.

Consultant: There are many functional similarities between mothering and consulting. The notions of development, empowerment, assisting the change process are only a few.

Co-researcher: Participants of the study who assisted the researcher in shaping the research project. The term acknowledges the connection of the researcher and participants as equal partners in the research process and is used in research from a more feminist framework.

Experience: Something personally lived through or encountered (Costello, 1991). This includes physical as well as mental/emotional issues and/or activities that are encountered and handled. It includes knowledge or practical wisdom gained from what one has observed, encountered, or undergone.

Ideal: A conception of something in its perfection (*Webster's College Dictionary*, 1991). Something that exists only in the imagination. The themes that emerged from the narratives contained the ideals of the mothering behavior and what it brought to the workplace, since there were many inconsistencies between the ideal theme and the co-researchers actual behavior. The ideology of the good mother within our cultural context impedes telling the truth about mothering in ordinary discourse, which may have given cause for the idealized perception construct that emerged from the data.

Idealized Perception: The construct that emerged from the data wherein the co-researchers self-reported experiences of their behavior in the three roles and the interface between them was inconsistent with what their idealized belief about their experience and what their experience brought to their professional role. The code word "idealized perception" actually appeared in the axial coding of the interview transcripts. Triangulation of the data with the research professor and coding class students brought the most objectivity around this construct.

Informed: to give or impart knowledge, skills, ways of being with, and ways of knowing (Belenky et al., 1986).

Internal Organizational Development Consultant: A salaried employee of the organization upon which the consulting is focused. As differentiated from an external consultant who enters an

organization from outside and is either self-employed or works for an organization that specializes in consulting. For this study, a professional who is a member of the local Organizational Development Network (Membership Catalogue of Organizational Development Network, 2002), who has been in practice for at least three years, who are managers, and who perceived that their professional role functioning was informed by their mothering experience, and are providing services that are generally defined as belonging to the role of an internal organizational development consultant.

Manager: Having supervisory responsibility for people and/or projects. All of the co-researchers were managing projects and/or people at the same time or at different times. Internal consultants who were managers were chosen because the managerial role, in addition to the consulting role, has some common elements with mothering (Fierman, 1990; Frenier, 1997; Kitchen, 1996; Stern, 1992; Watson, 2001). The separation of the two roles in the text is indicated by a slash mark between consultant and manager (consultant/manager). If referring to more than one, the text reads as consultant/managers. This study was limited to self-selected members of the local Organizational Development Network.

The concept of manager has some functional similarities with mothering. It suggests taking care of or supervision of usually with a power differential. Good mothers over time ideally give up the power and let go of the responsibility for their adult child. Good managers delegate and reward employees who do not have to be managed to get the work done. However, the manager is always the one ultimately responsible for producing.

Mother: Ruddick (1989) defines mother as being a person who takes on responsibility for a child's life and for whom providing child care is a significant part of her working life. This included then, those who assumed major childrearing responsibility rather than major reliance on live-in surrogate employees or relatives during non-working hours of outside employment, as that would dilute the quality and/or quantity of the experience. Based on Ruddick's (1989) work, daycare providers are caregivers not mothers. Mothers who use other caregivers during their working hours still commit to arranging this assistance in the work of preserving, nurturing, and guiding their child.

Only biological mothers were used in this study due to the potential nature of the transformative experience of the actual physical process of giving birth. Also, the biological child had to be an adult child to ensure sufficient time for the mothering experience on which to draw. This resulted in all of the mothers being at mid-life, ranging from 52-62 years of age. The age variance did not appear to impact the ability to articulate the usefulness of the mothering experience. Marital status of the mothers varied. Two mothers were married, one was divorced, and one was single.

Mothering: Ruddick (1989) defines mothering as "a work out of which a distinctive thinking arises" (p. 40), thus the title of her seminal volume, Maternal Thinking. According to Ruddick (1989), the goals of the "work" of mothering are to protect, nurture, and train a child.

Perceive: to know through the senses. Some believe that a person's perception is their reality. It is their subjective knowledge. (Costello, 1991).

Process: Within the field of organizational development consulting, process refers to a critical component of the change strategy. People and content are the other two elements. Anderson and

Anderson (2001a) define process as the "natural or intentional unfolding of continuous events toward a desired outcome." (p.137)
Process is always purposeful action toward a result. Process is always evolving, it is never static.

Self-report: Actual stories about the co-researchers functioning in the mothering, managing, or consulting role.

Stories: Narratives about their actual functioning and beliefs about their functioning and the relationship between mothering and work behavior through their own eyes. A unique story line emerged from each co-researcher's narrative. Most of the interviews consisted of their telling me stories about their mothering of their children over the normal developmental phases including the child care arrangements they made so they could work, and stories about their consulting and managerial experiences. This data of course was subject to their memory lapses and perceptual distortions.

Appendix I: Vitae

PATRICIA A. MORGAN

10420 Breckinridge Lane
Fairfax, Virginia 22030
(703) 691-4968 E Mail-patricia.morgan11@verizon.net

EDUCATION

Ph.D. Human Development (Adult Learning). Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, Blacksburg, Virginia, 2003.
Master of Social Work, University of Iowa, Iowa City, Iowa, 1967.
Bachelor of Social Work, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Michigan, 1961.

PROFESSIONAL AFFILIATIONS

Chesapeake Bay Organization Development Network.
Greater Washington Society for Clinical Social Work.
Organization Development Network
National Association of Social Workers

PUBLICATIONS

Lyle W. Shannon and Patricia Morgan, "The Prediction of Economic Absorption and Cultural Integration Among Mexican American, Negroes and Anglos in a Northern Industrial Community." *Human Organization,* Winter, 1966.

Patricia A. Morgan, "Training Iowa Psychiatrists: Their Attitudes Toward Social Work Areas of Competency, *Journal of Iowa Social Work,* October, 1968.

UNPUBLISHED WORK

Patricia A. Morgan, *The Attitudes of Significant Others Toward a Prepatient, Inpatient and Postpatient Psychiatric Population.* Independent research project submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirement or the degree of Master of Social Work in the School of Social Work in the Graduate College of the University of Iowa, June 1967. (Data for this project was part of a larger study in the social psychology of mental patients directed by Dr. Steven Spitzer and Dr. Norman Denzin.

Patricia A. Morgan, *The meaning of the mothering experience to the work of the internal organizational development consultant/manager: Three case studies.* Dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the Graduate College of Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, Blacksburg, Virginia, 2003.

Patricia A. Morgan, continued.

PAPERS PRESENTED AT MEETINGS

Patricia A. Morgan, *A Study of Organizational Development Consultant Managers Who Are Mothers.* Paper presented at the 16th Annual Symposium of the Society for Research in Adult Development, Parenting as a Path to Adult Development. New York, New York, June 22-24, 2001.

Patricia A. Morgan, *A Study of Organizational Development Consultant Managers Who Are Mothers.* Paper accepted for presentation at the Annual International Conference of the Association for Research on Mothering. Motherhood: Power/Oppression. Queensland University, Australia, July 8-11th, 2001

Patricia A. Morgan, *A Study of Organizational Development Consultant Managers Who Are Mothers.* Paper accepted for presentation at the Annual International Conference of the Association for Research on Mothering. Motherhood: Power/Oppression. Queensland University, Australia, July 8-11th, 2001

Patricia A. Morgan, *A study of organizational development consultant managers who are mothers.* Paper presented at the Managerial and Organizational Cognition Division research development workshop of the Annual Conference of the Academy of Management, Washington, D.C., August 4[th,] 2001.

Patricia A. Morgan, *The meaning of the mothering experience to the work of the internal organizational development consultant/manager: Three case studies.*
Paper accepted for presentation at the conference, Mothering and Work/ Mothering as Work. Association for Research on Mothering, York University, Toronto, Canada, May 2-4th, 2003.

POSTER SESSIONS

Patricia A. Morgan, *A study of organizational development consultant/managers who are mothers.* Poster Session presented at the 17th Annual Symposium of the Society for Research in Adult Development, New York, June 21-23rd, 2002.